



THE SUSTAINABLE
DEVELOPMENT
GOALS
CENTER FOR
AFRICA

SDGs IMPLEMENTATION IN AFRICA REFLECTIONS ON A THREE-YEAR JOURNEY

12th- 14th June 2019 | Kigali Convention Center, Rwanda

CONFERENCE REPORT



KOICA
Korea International
Cooperation Agency



UNITED NATIONS
RWANDA

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS.....	V
INTRODUCTION	1
OBJECTIVES OF CONFERENCE	1
BACKGROUND	3
CONFERENCE OVERVIEW.....	5
OUTCOMES OF THE CONFERENCE.....	6
1. PRESENTATION OF THE REPORT ON AFRICA 2030 - SDGs THREE-YEAR REALITY CHECK	7
2. WELCOME TO HEADS OF STATES AND REPORT ON THE CONFERENCE.....	11
2.1. KEYNOTE ADDRESS	15
2.2. ACCELERATING AGENDA 2063	18
2.3. OFFICIAL OPENING REMARKS & LAUNCH OF THE SDGs THREE YEAR REPORT	22
2.4. PRESIDENTIAL PANEL: REFLECTIONS ON SDGs PROGRESS IN AFRICA	24
3. REVITALIZING NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT BANKS FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMEN	29
3.1. BACKGROUND.....	29
3.2. OBJECTIVES.....	31
3.3. OPENING SPEECHES AND KEYNOTE ADDRESS	32
3.4. THEMATIC DISCUSSION ON ASSESSING THE CURRENT CONDITION & PROSPECT OF NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT BANKS IN AFRICA IN FOSTERING ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & ACHIEVEMENT OF SDGs	36
3.5. PARALLEL THEMATIC GROUP AND PANEL DISCUSSIONS.....	46

4. THEMATIC PRESENTATIONS ON SYNTHESIZING THE EXPERIANCES & LESSONS OF SELECTED NDBs PARTICIAPTING IN THE SDGC/A NDB INITIATIVE, & WAYS TO SCALE UP TO OTHER NDBs	60
3.7. CLOSING SESSION: KEY MESSAGES & WAYFORWARD	66
3.8. MAIN CONCLUSIONS & RECOMMENDATIONS.....	68
5. ENHANCING NATIONAL M&R SYSTEMS AND CAPACITIES FOR SDG MONITORING & REPORTING”	72
5.1. BACKGROUND.....	72
5.2. OBJECTIVES OF THE SESSION	73
5.3. WELCOME REMARKS	74
5.4. KEY NOTES ADDRESS	75
5.5. SESSION OUTPUTS.....	76
Session 1: Understanding of Data Gap.....	77
Session 2: Strengthening National Statistical Capacity	81
Session 3: Strengthening the Pan-African M&R Systems for Harmonized Data	84
Session 4: Strengthening Coordination and SDG Results Dissemination	86
5.6. CLOSING REMARKS	88
6. FINANCING HEALTH, EDUCATION AND GREEN WATER IN AFRICA	89
6.1. BACKGROUND.....	89
6.2. OBJECTIVES OF THE SESSION	93
6.3. KEYNOTE ADDRESS	94
6.3. SESSION OUTPUTS.....	101
Session 1: Strengthening African Health Systems	102
Session 2: Scaling-up Enhanced Rainfed Agriculture.....	120
Session 3: Improving Primary and Secondary Education	130
6.4. REMARKS	134
ANNEXES	135
ANNEX I: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS BY ORGANIZATIONS AND COUNTRIES	135
ANNEX II: LIST OF DOCUMENTS.....	152

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AAAA	:	Addis Ababa Action Agenda (AAAA)
AU	:	African Union
JICA	:	Japan International Cooperation Agency
MCs	:	Master of Ceremonies
MDGs	:	Millennium Development Goals
M&E	:	Monitoring and Evaluation
NGO	:	Non-Governmental Organization
SDG	:	Sustainable Development Goals
SDGC/A	:	Sustainable Development Goals Center for Africa
UN	:	United Nations
UNED	:	United Nations Environment and Development.
USA	:	United States of America
WHO	:	World Health Organization
KOICA	:	Korea International Cooperation Agency

INTRODUCTION

The Sustainable Development Goals Center for Africa (SDGC/A) conference entitled “SDGS implementation in Africa – Reflections on a three-year journey” was held AT THE Kigali Convention Centre from the 12th to the 14th June, 2019 in Kigali, Rwanda. The three days’ conference brought together over 700 delegates including global, regional and national stakeholders from governments, multilateral and bilateral institutions, foundations and NGOs, the private sector, academia and civil society to discuss SDGs progress and make recommendations on the path forward towards SDG achievement in Africa.

The SDGC/A Conference was graced by the participation of H.E President Paul Kagame of Rwanda and Chair of the SDGC/A founding Board, H.E President Edgar Lungu

of Zambia and member of the SDGC/A Board, H.E Dr. Jewel C. Howard-Taylor, Vice President of Liberia, H.E Moussa Faki Mahamat, Chairperson of the African Union Commission and Mr. Hiroshi Kato, Senior Vice President of JICA. Other dignitaries include Dr. Vera Songwe, Executive Director of U Economic Commission for Africa (UNECA); Mr Hiroshi Kato, Sr. Vice President of Japan International Cooperation (JICA) and Mr. Mahmoud Mohieldin Senior president of World Bank among other distinguished guests. In addition to these in attendance were ministers and government officials, representatives from National Statistical Offices, NGOs, Development Banks, the Academia, Research Institutions and civil societies from 48 different countries, of which 35 are from Africa.

OBJECTIVES OF CONFERENCE

The main purpose of the conference was to provide a public forum for high-level discussion on SDG progress across Africa and on the priorities and challenges for SDG implementation, including the institutional and financial gaps in the implementation process. A complete trend analysis of Africa’s progress to date and how far it must go towards achieving the SDGs was provided to participants, including both qualitative and quantitative analysis of progress and constraints.

Presentations, panels and plenary discussions were conducted on the information arising out of the Three Year Report and Africa SDG Index 2019 Report including the following aspects:

- Progress towards the achievement of the SDGs in Africa from 2016 – 2018;
- Simulation and forecasting analysis on a select number of SDGs, with trend data series;
- Critical review of the performance challenges towards the SDGs;
- Mapping and performance of the governance framework for SDGs;
- Progress on the aspirations of the Addis Ababa Action Agenda (AAAA) for financing development,
- SDG data gaps; and
- A review of important “unfinished business” towards SDG achievement.

BACKGROUND



The SDG 3year Journey Conference in Kigali was graced by Heads of States and high level dignitaries from Africa

Following the adoption of the SDGs in September 2015, Africa has made many commitments towards the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) Agenda 2030 and the African Union Agenda 2063. At the adoption of the SDGs, Africa's starting point was lower than all the other regions. Africa was at cross roads, with low ratio of tax revenue to Gross Domestic Product (GDP) on one end of the problem, and enormous development needs on the other end.

Infrastructure gaps alone were estimated at USD 130-170 billion a year, with a financing gap in the range of USD 68-108 billion. The SDGs were conceptualized and adopted in 2015 during a period of global economy in transition. Emerging evidence over the last three years (2015-2018) of tracking SDGs progress on an annual basis indicates complex challenges still prevail in Africa. Many intricacies, ambiguities and questions continue to predominate and stand in the pathway forwards towards Africa's achievement of these Goals.

It is without doubt that there is much “unfinished business” that must be addressed for the SDGs to be achieved in Africa, foremost of which are the need:

- I. To bridge understanding between SDG conceptualization and implementation pathways,
- II. To address global financing for the SDGS in low income countries, particularly those in Africa,
- III. To raise domestic financing efforts, which still are suboptimal with an estimated gap of 3-5% of GDP, and
- IV. To engage the private sector. It is against this backdrop, that, from 12-14th June 2019, The Sustainable Development Goals Center (The SDGC/A) convened a multitude of global, regional and national stakeholders from governments, multilateral and bilateral institutions, foundations and NGOs, the private sector, academia and Civil Society to discuss SDG progress and make recommendations on the path forward towards SDG achievement in Africa.

The basis of these discussions was anchored by The Sdgc/A's report launched by H.E. Paul Kagame, President of the Republic of Rwanda and Chair of the SDGC/A Founding Board: **Africa 2030 – Sustainable Development Goals Three-Year Reality**

The SDGs Three Year Report produces an evidence-based foundation and reiterates an urgent call for acceleration of efforts by all stakeholders in order to realize the SDGs in all African countries – this urgent call to action was reiterated during the Conference. Furthermore H.E. Moussa Faki Mahamat, Chairperson of the African Union Commission, launched the 2019 Africa SDG Index and Dashboards Report¹ which has been produced by The SDGC/A and its partner, the Sustainable Development Solutions Network (SDSN). Along with the SDGC/A's SDGs Three Year Report, the results presented in the 2019 Africa SDG Index provides a foundation for discussion at the Conference, giving participants a current measure of country-level progress across all 17 SDGs, as well as elements of Agenda 2063.

The Africa SDGs Index provides national and regional level assessments of where countries stand with regards to achieving the SDGs, shining a light on where countries are or are not on track towards SDG achievement and providing a powerful informational tool to ensure accountability and commitment to the Goals.

¹ Find the link of The Launch of The 2019 Africa SDGC Index and Dashboards Report in the Annex 2

CONFERENCE OVERVIEW

The first part of the report highlights the key findings and conclusions from the Africa 2030 - SDGs three-year reality check report. Panel comments on SDG three-year report, Presidential panel: reflections on SDG progress in Africa. The path to SDG achievement in Africa: panel discussion on governance (including good data), financing and social inclusion during these sessions, and a diverse group of panelists discussed three key frameworks viewed as essential to SDG achievement.

Key points discussed that need urgent attention are;

1. Data gaps to measure SDGs progress, need for political support for statistics to enable data revolution in Africa;
2. The need to establish continent based accountability mechanisms that will be additional support for the existing ones;
3. The need to establish Africa based fund, specifically in the critical sectors of health, education and green water;
4. Securing the political will of national and local leaders for effective reform management and localized achievement of sustainable development goals;
5. Ensuring administrative reforms;
6. Ensuring the inclusion of CSO's and watchdog agencies in the governance space;
7. Encouraging the building of a strong democratic parliament;
8. Ensuring the adherence to the rule of law;
9. Ensuring public awareness and involvement;
10. Elimination of the culture of corruption and mismanagement of scarce resources.

Before launching the SDGs Three reality check report and the 2019 SDGs index report on 14 June, the conference was preceded on 12 and 13 June with sessions that brought together experts to discuss different thematic areas. These groups had participants from various institutions like National Statistical Offices, ministries, research institutions, Universities, Non-governmental Organizations, development banks, Civil Societies, UN agencies, bilateral and multilateral donors and many other partners.

The thematic sessions were:

- Enhancing national M&R systems and capacities for SDG monitoring and reporting” on 12th June 2019
- Revitalizing National Development Banks for Sustainable Development” on 12th June 2019
- Financing health, education and green water in Africa” on 13th June 2019
 1. Improving the quality of primary and secondary education for all children in Africa;
 2. Programs aimed at strengthening African health systems, with strong focuses on accountability and governance; and
 3. Increasing the productivity and resilience of smallholder farmers in the African dry land regions, mainly through scaling-up rainwater harvesting technologies.

OUTCOMES OF THE CONFERENCE

These high-level discussions highlighted the intended pragmatic and evidence-based recommendations for African countries to stay on track towards SDG achievement. The focus areas include: (i) Health, Education, Green Water/Agriculture,

Monitoring and reporting systems, the governance and institutional framework for SDG achievement in Africa, (ii) filling the SDG data gaps, (iv) financing, including alternative sources of financing, and (iii) social inclusiveness. In addition, with over 700 participants from across Africa and beyond, composed of women, youth, farmers and other members of civil society, the Conference has informed and urged everyone to take the information and key messages back to their countries to continue to push for urgent action and necessary reforms in order for all African countries to achieve the SDGs by 2030.

1. PRESENTATION OF THE REPORT ON AFRICA 2030 - SDGS THREE-YEAR REALITY CHECK



Dr. Enock Nyorekwa Twinoburyo, SDGC/A Advisor and Senior Economist presenting the SDGs THREE YEAR REALITY CHECK REPORT

Key Findings and Conclusions

The Sustainable Development Goals Center for Africa presented the Africa 2030 three-year reality check which focused on the Sustainable Development Goal Center for Africa report - theme launched on the 14th June 2019. In the report, it is revealed that Africa continues to lag behind the world and other regions on several development aspects, as was the case at the adoption of the SDGs in September 2015.

Africa continues to predominantly be in the low income category - or least commonly known as poor economies (28 countries) as well as in the low human development (37 countries) as measured by the Human Development Index. Additionally,

Africa remains the least competitive region - as exhibited by the infrastructure ratings in the World Economic Forum ratings.

Indeed, the infrastructure gap is large for the continent estimated by the African Development Bank at annually USD 130-170 billion. All these challenges notwithstanding – the recent growth epoch over the SDG period is not only below the SDG target of 7% per annum, but is also below the long term historical average. In context, the Sub Saharan African region – experienced the slowest growth in 15 years and 20 years respectively in 2015 and 2016.

The causes for this are many, both domestic and foreign. Globalization is dwindling or under pressure, China growth has decelerated in recent years yet it has positive correlation with Africa's growth, global trade growth has dwindled, commodity prices remain depressed and climatic conditions remain unfavorable.

A holistic review of SDGs over the three years – was not possible due to nonexistence of enough data. Only 96 indicators have data (41.4% of the global indicator framework). Where data exists, it is not comprehensive and consistent. The majority of African countries do not possess updated data for crucial indicators such as poverty, health, nutrition, education, and infrastructure. In case where countries possess the data, they are outdated and the latest available is from 2015.

The household surveys are irregular, and there exists variation among the countries in the scope, comprehensiveness, quantity and quality of the household surveys.

At continental level- there was not enough data for SDGs 10, 11 and 12. The same data challenges were faced in developing the launched on the same day. The index which uses 97 indicators (including AU 2063 indicators) is a call for action on governments to improve data frameworks and embrace online reporting systems for big data collection.

With 11 and half years to go, Africa is seemingly only on track on three goals only: SDG 5- Gender equality, SDG 13- Climate action and SDG 15- Life on land. Social inclusion continues to be outstripped by population growth. And the lack of demographic transition impedes structural transformation as well as affects future productivity.

Concentrated Poverty remains high and inequality in Africa ranks amongst the highest in the world. Nearly 1 in 3 Africans are at risk of food insecurity. It remains very unfortunate that a child born today is at risk of not receiving full education or healthy life.

As such stunting prevails, people continue not to visit hospital due to lack of money to pay at point of service, and a child in school today at age of 10 continues to struggle to read and write due to poor quality of education services. Similar trend is shown – in the Center’s forecasts that show predominantly all regions except North Africa are unlikely to meet all the goals (poverty, malnutrition, maternal mortality, net school enrolment, access to electricity, and access to drinking water) included in forecasts. Central Africa even in the most optimistic scenario is unlikely to meet all the goals.

The struggle for development of Africa prevails and as such presents a toll order on all stakeholders. Unfortunately, again, the governance framework for SDGs hangs largely at top level and has not cascaded to low levels. There exists not clear reporting, accounting and ratification framework for SDGs. Additionally, there is a persistent lack of clarity on mutual accountability mechanisms, roles and responsibilities. The existing mechanisms of reporting – in particular, the Voluntary Reporting Mechanism is not comprehensive and sometimes not of same standard compromising comparability as already exhibited in the 19 countries that had reported by end of 2018.

The inherent challenges in the Global SDG framework require attention – now more than ever and the 2020 review of the framework should be honest and candid on these.

Globally, financing for SDGs remains below the available financing mix. The same is true for Africa where the total financing mix (domestic revenue – USD 500bn, US\$50 billion in ODA, slightly less than US\$50 billion in FDI, US\$60 billion in remittances) is about or lower than the estimated financing gap for SDGs (between USD 500 billion and USD 1.2 trillion). Domestic revenue gap remains over 5% of GDP in medium term annually. One in five African countries does not raise enough in revenues to meet its basic state functions and the challenge is even worth at SSA level (1 in 3).

While National development Banks can play a catalytic role in providing long-term financing, many of them (140 in number) are immensely constrained from regulation to financing, thereby remain of small size relative to GDP (averagely 1-3% of GDP).

ODA is failing in per capita terms and OECD countries continue not meeting the 0.7% of GDP. They are currently meeting less than half of that.

Another prominent and prospective risk is that the share of the OECD in global GDP is reducing yet the emerging players (ASIA) continue to account for marginal shares of ODA. FDI is volatile and may not exclusively linked to financing SDGs. Remittances are growing but the associated costs remain over twice the SDG target of 3%.

Overall, Africa's failure to attain SDGs will have implications everywhere on the planet. Forty-six percent of the goals are not exclusive Africa SDGs but of international and cross border nature. The three-year report reiterates a call for action on governments, and all stakeholders to step and

strive for full transparency while documenting and coordinating their efforts of reporting.

The global financial disorder exists and at continent level – competing priorities remain a challenge between addressing infrastructure and human capital and social inclusion challenge. It is important and possible to leverage and incentivize global resources into critical areas of social inclusion. We cannot postpone investment in human capital and people or we risk losing a generation. Accordingly, we believe that earmarked continent based funds for health; education and green water are key game changers to address this issue.

2. WELCOME TO HEADS OF STATES AND REPORT ON THE CONFERENCE



Dr. Belay Begashaw, Director General of the SDGC/A, delivering his welcome remarks

Welcoming Remarks by Dr. Belay Begashaw

Dr. Belay Begashaw, the Director General of the SDGCA, started his speech² by expressing his special gratitude to all the dignitaries and welcoming the participants of the conference.

In his speech, he highlighted that SDGs provide a shared vision, build on solidarity, dignity, and care for the environment, inclusive participation with a promise not to leave anyone behind. However, he highlighted that there are shortcomings in addressing the accountability mechanism for

SDGs, the systems to quantify and ways to inform compliances.

The funding framework remains unclear; this couples with scarce of data accountability for financing SDGs. Donors have also led down Africa in financing Climate and biodiversity SDGs, in which it is unfair to let low-income African countries to fund these particular SDGs while they can barely meet basic needs such as health, food and education for their people.

2. Dr Belay's full speech in Annex 2

Dr Belay emphasized that financing SGD in Africa remains the most important challenge and the SDGs three years' reflections report suggested the following:

1. There are large data gaps to measure SDGs progress, so a need for political support for statistics to enable data revolution in Africa.
2. There is a need to establish continent based accountability mechanisms that will be additional support for the existing ones
3. There is a need to establish Africa based fund, specifically in the critical sectors of health, education and green water.

Dr. Belay Begashaw, the Director General of the SDGCA, started his speech by welcoming participants. He extended special gratitude to H.E Paul Kagame, President of the Republic of Rwanda, H.E Edgar Chagwa Lungu, President of the Republic of Zambia, H.E Moussa Faki Mahamat, Chairperson of the African Union Commission, H.E Dr. Jewel C. Howard-Taylor, Vice President of Liberia. Also, he expressed his deepest thanks to Honorable Ministers, Members of Parliament, SDGC/A board members, Honorable heads of Diplomatic missions, International Organizations and other distinguished guests for accepting the invitation and participating in this historic event.

Dr. Begashaw particularly expressed his deep gratefulness to the audience for attending the **SDGs Implementation in Africa-Reflections on a three-year journey** conference.

He also talked about what the SDGs could do for humanity; SDGs provide a shared vision, build on solidarity, dignity, care for the environment, inclusive participation with a promise not to leave anyone behind.

He said that the adoption of the SDGs in 2015 was unprecedented move in terms of the Global consensus for the oversight and commitment content in the SDGs agenda and that the universal 17 goals and 169 targets set a basis for social contact between the world leaders and their people. Dr. Begashaw informed that after three years along the journey, the SDGC/A has conducted a reality check analysis to find out whether Africa is still in the right direction to address the SDGs and if it will get there on time. He pointed out that the conference is going to reflect on this reality and agree on how to fix things that are not working.

During the event, the SDGs-three reality check and 2019 Africa SDG Index and Dashboard reports were launched. Consequently, Dr. Begashaw urged all participants to carefully read the reports and propose solutions moving forward.

Evidence shows that there is a gap between what SDGs agenda demands and what is workable on the ground partly due to the disadvantage starting point into Africa's SDGs development. Accountability mechanism for SDGs, the systems to quantify mechanism and ways to inform compliances, have not been addressed. The funding framework remains unclear; this couples with scarce of data accountability for financing difficult compliances have not been adequately addressed.

For example, one out of five African countries does not raise enough revenue to meet its basic state functions. External influences are constraints by inward looking policies and tight global economic financing conditions yet financial output flaws remain large. On a sad note it is evident that donors have also led down Africa in financing Climate and biodiversity SDGs.

It is unthinkable to let low income African countries to fund these particular SDGs while they can barely meet basic needs such as health, food and education for their people. Therefore, financing SDGs in Africa remains the most important challenge and the SDGs three years' reflections report propose suggestions that needs to be done.

Dr. Begashaw pointed out that the second report that was launched is the 2019 SDGs Index and Dashboards report which serves as a tool for reporting and monitoring the SDGs. It is produced by the SDGCA in collaboration with the Sustainable Development Solution Network. He highlighted that this is the second report and it will be produced every year, going forward there will be continued efforts to improve it to better reflect and address the existing gaps.

The tool provides country ranking scores and dashboards which are useful for planning, executing self-reflections. The good news is that there is an overlap between both SDGs and agenda 2063 which make the SDGs Index report relevant in monitoring implementation of both agendas. The recently signed MOU between SDGCA and AU will further strengthen effort to disseminate this tool across Africa.

It has been proposed that there should be Africa's SDGs day and it is my sincerely hope that this will be given due consideration. Dr. Begashaw highlighted three patent issues that merged from both the SDGs three years' reflections and 2019 SDGs Index and dashboard reports as well as the two days' thematic discussions that need urgent consideration. These three patent issues are as follows:

1. There are large data gaps to measure SDGs progress, political support for statistics to enable data revolution in Africa is needed.
2. There is a need to establish continent based accountability mechanisms that will be additional support for the existing ones
3. There is a need to establish Africa based fund, specifically in the critical sectors of health, education and green water

Before concluding his speech, Dr. Begashaw particularly expressed his deep gratitude to His Excellency Paul Kagame, President of the Republic of Rwanda, and the Government of Rwanda through the Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning of Rwanda as well as the Rwanda Convention Bureau, the Japan International Cooperation (JICA), the Korean International Cooperation Agency (KOICA), the One-UN Rwanda and the people of Rwanda for supporting the organization of the conference.

He also recognized the presence of all participants (over 700) from diversity backgrounds who came from 48 different countries of which 35 of them were from Africa.

2.1. KEYNOTE ADDRESS



Dr. Vera Songwe, Executive Secretary of UNECA, representing H.E Ms. Amina J. Mohammed, UN Deputy Secretary-General, delivering her keynote speech

Dr. Vera Songwe, the Executive Secretary for UN Economic Commission for Africa, represented H.E Ms. Amina J. Mohammed, the Deputy Secretary General, United Nations at the SDG 3 Year Journey Conference. She began her speech by thanking H.E President Paul Kagame the President of the Republic of Rwanda and Chair of the SDGC/A Board, H.E Edgar Lungu, President of the Republic of Zambia, H.E Chief Dr. Jewel C. Howard-Taylor, Vice President of the Republic of Liberia, H.E Moussa Faki Mahamat, Chairperson of the African Union Commission, Dr. Belay Begashaw, Director General of the SGDC/A, Hon. Dr. Uzziel Ndagijimana, Minister of Finance and Economic Planning of Rwanda, the considered partners; Mr Hiroshi Kato, Sr. Vice President of Japan International Cooperation (JICA) and Mr. Mahmoud Mohieldin Senior president of World Bank among other distinguished guests

Dr. Songwe reiterated that four years ago leaders of the world came together at the United Nations and adopted the SDGs 2030 agenda. It was a transformative vision for society to end poverty in its all forms in the next fifteen years, it was a moment of great hope, inspiration, governments responded to the common challenges they face around the world by uniting the truly forward looking and yet urgent plan to end poverty and create prosperity for a healthier and peaceful planet. It was a moment where aspirations and dreams were turning into reality.

Africa was truly part of the global multilateral agenda, where the MDGs were for Africa the SDGs were designed with and by Africans. She reminded that they had the President of Liberia, H.E Ellen Johnson Sirleaf in the three main panelists that decided on the educative of the SDGs Liberia, Indonesia and UK. In 2015, 195 countries also came in together in Paris to agree on a common Paris agreement on climate to reduce emissions and to start resilience.

In 2015 the Pope in the historic visit to the UN said that it was impossible to fight injustice if we do not fight climate change together and climate change was a question of justice and social inclusion. In 2015 the world came together in Addis Ababa to talk about financing Africa and world's development.

Dr. Songwe said that it is for this reason that the conference happened to talk about what happened in 2015, the dreams that were laid by a multilateral global community to set pace for the world that will exist without poverty.

“Fast forward a few years later that spirit of multilateralism, that spirit of togetherness, that spirit of social justice is on the threat, is on the decision making and we stand here today as Africa saying we may not meet the Sustainable Development Goals if we do not come back to a sense of stronger multilateralism, a sense of Global community and a sense of global justice for all at the end of the day the SDGs were about Global justice” There has been progress as the report explains and I congratulate the SDGCA for the report. What you cannot measure you cannot fix.” Dr. Songwe said.

Furthermore, she said that Africa has made a lot of progress; Africa has gone below the 50% poverty mark. Most Africans now understand what it means to live in the city or in the township where one has access to education; many more girls have access to primary education. The United Economic Commission for Africa together with the global UN family its commitment to live within this mandate to insure that when we meet again as a UN family in the next decade to celebrate that we have met the SDGs.

In order to accomplish this Dr. Songwe stipulated that there is a need to do three things:

1. Sustainable growth: to ensure that our economies are growing again. When we met in 2015, Africa was growing at 6% while today Africa is growing at 3%. We have to do better if we have to meet the SDGs. This growth has to be inclusive, diversified and it has to ensure that we are exploring all the new technologies that we have.
2. There is still a lot to be done to ensure that we can meet the SDGs. The breath of new innovation that ensures us to serve. In 2018 over 30% Africans are working in poor, we need to find solutions for those who are poor. Women have made progress on the world gender agenda, 39% of the world's employment is done by women but only 27 % of the positions are held by women, In Africa, Rwanda is making a good progress in this but the rest of Africa is lacking behind. Violence against women remains an issue which is part of the 2030 agenda.
3. We need to find new ways of funding the SDGs, Dr. Begashaw has talked about the importance of financing, when we will meet again we will talk about the Addis Ababa agenda to assess if we have made progress on financing the SDGs. We need a diversified central African economy to ensure Central African countries come together so that we can achieve the SDGs. Technology is going to be the solution as we move forward so that no one is left behind.

Dr. Songwe concluded her speech with Nelson Mandela's quote, *"One of the most difficult thing is not to change society, but to change yourself so that you change society"*. She said that what each and every SDGs speaks to us individually and collectively, she is sure that with all participant's multilateral spirit, UN and their partners i.e. International Monetary Fund IMF, World bank and all Multi-lateral and bilateral partners will work together towards the accomplishment of the SDGs.

2.2. ACCELERATING AGENDA 2063



H.E Moussa Faki Mahamat, Chairperson of the African Union Commission, speaking on Agenda 2063 and the SDGs

Excellences, distinguished guests, because it is a reflection, allow me to allow myself some freedom of tone, and let me also use a metaphor to reflect aloud with you on the course of the SDGs for the past 3 years, which is the theme of our conference. In the human life; at age 3, a healthy baby, in body and mind, can walk and talk. He can do it better if the living conditions are good. Even though the conditions are not necessarily optimal in Africa, but it is obvious with a few exceptions, the SDG baby walks, he stammers, his language is not necessarily very intelligible. His parents; the international community and particularly the

African Union dreamed a better life for him which is contained in the two Agendas 2063 and 2030 but one must ask himself the question; have they created conditions for him that if he wanted, he could be enabled?

Also, Excellences, Ladies and Gentlemen allow me to focus my reflection on the cryptic of integration, prosperity and peace which is summarized in the content of the 2063 African Union Agenda. Let us start with integration; without integration point of salvation for a continent of more than one billion inhabitants but fragmented into a consideration of about fifty States.

The transition from the OAU to the African Union which is an organization of integration and expression of political will, the 1991 Abuja Treaty envisioned the establishment of an African economic community; we have seen the birth of regional economic communities. Today there are at least 8 that are recognized by the African Union. More recently as part of the reform of the African Union and I would like to pay tribute to President Paul Kagame who is in charge in this dossier, the reform both institutional as well as financial, has placed particular emphasis on the necessary integration of the continent.

You know that it has been decided that henceforth the June-July AU summit, will be the coordination summit between the Regional Economic Communities and the African Union and we will inaugurate the first session in a few days on July 8 in Niamey.

We have also in 2018 and here in Kigali launched the CFTA "Continental Free Trade Area" this agreement has had the necessary number of ratifications and it came into effect since May 30. We are going on July 7th 2019 to officially launch it in Niamey. This is a significant step in the direction of integration. We also launched the same year the single market in air transport, 28 African States

have adhered to this agreement, which I hope will facilitate the de-compartmentalization of the African sky.

At the same time, we also launched the protocol for the free movement of the right of establishment of the African passport. Unfortunately, we have to say it, so far only two States, Rwanda and another one have ratified. We cannot implement the integration of the continent if we do not open the borders, if we do not give the opportunity to workers and businesses to freely move from one country to another, to settle and work there.

I came last night from Malabo, where the annual meetings of the African Development Bank are held, which also have the integration of the African continent as a major theme. As appropriate as it can be done, I pleaded for the capital increase of the AfDB and the replenishment of the African Development Fund and it was pointed out that despite the efforts, the question of financing arises and is posed crudely. How can the SDGs be a reality in a continent where the funding issue remains almost untouched? How can we connect the continent in terms of energy, in terms of communication, when we do not have sufficient means to be able to do it?

The facts are there; the SDGs can never be a reality if the funding issue is not resolved. In-house efforts are absolutely necessary, but support from the international community as a whole is equally important.

The second focus is prosperity; the focus must be on priority sectors, particularly agriculture. It has been decided for some time at the level of the African Union to devote at least 10 % of its budget to agriculture, a celebrated decision that was made in Malabo and unfortunately in a lot of cases, hardly becoming a reality. How to industrialize the continent? How to develop energy resources? How to access social sectors, education, training, employment, the problem of youth and gender remains important as well as the climate issue?

The third focus is that of peace, I remember in my previous post that when we were discussing the SDGs, African countries insisted on integrating the peace and security dimension as one of the elements that could allow the achievement of the objectives; and this was done. Unfortunately, Africa has become a theater of instability, terrorism; the trafficking of all kinds is a reality in

this continent. I must say that in addition to our peace architecture and security, recently the fund of Peace has been revived, I see Dr. Kaberuka in the room. Thank you very much Dr. for your support and all that you have done in the revival of the peace fund which now has a board of directors that has been able to collect \$ 116 million contributions from the Member States.

While we have not yet reached the target of \$ 400 million, we are on the right track. Africa must be self-reliant and assume the responsibility of ensuring its security. Well expected, some challenges go beyond the continent, they are not due to the continent, including terrorism that is a threat to peace and security and this is as you know from the purview of the UN Security Council, an important resolution is on the table of the Security Council and we urge our partners to understand this urgency and support the efforts of the African continent.

The SDGs cannot be achieved when a big part of the African continent is under the pressure of insecurity.

From countries in the Sahel, in the Horn of Africa, countries sometimes spend more than a third of their budget on security issues, to the detriment of social sectors, indicators that are there to be able to see which countries have completed or are moving towards the achievement of the objectives.

This morning, I went through the ranking that was done, most states are still in the red. It is disturbing but it is understandable. This is because the minimum conditions are not met; I do not say that to remove me from my responsibility. We should strive for excellence, we have to make efforts to improve our economic governance, political, social, rely on ourselves, change our way of seeing things but unfortunately there are also objective constraints, which mean that many of our States cannot achieve the goals as much as they wish they could.

Based on findings from our annual conference with the United Nations held last 6th May, the Secretary General of the United Nations and I had noted the lack of funding for the implementation of the SDGs.

I welcome our cooperation. We agreed, as I was saying in 2018, to work together as there is a total convergence between the two agendas, to do the assessment and to even do the joint reporting. I hope that the reports we are going to make will be a little less severe than the one we are looking at today.

But there is no miracle, it is necessary to gather a minimum of conditions so that the situation improves. Follow-up the improvement and statistics are a necessity.

Excellences, Heads of State, Heads of Delegations, Ladies and Gentlemen, I will conclude by saying simply that Africa is evolving in one of the very difficult contexts but that must not be a reason to despair. There is tremendous potential in this continent; especially it's young or numerous human resources, we must give ourselves the means and self-conviction.

International relations are not good at the moment. The one-sided reflex is beginning to appear dangerously; I hope the SDGs know better fate than the MDGs. Optimism is needed even if it is not a given, thank you.

2.3. OFFICIAL OPENING REMARKS & LAUNCH OF THE SDGS THREE YEAR REPORT



H.E Paul Kagame, President of the Republic of Rwanda and Chair of the SDGC/A Board, officially launching the SDGs THREE YEAR REPORT

His Excellence President Paul Kagame started by greeting and welcoming all participants to Rwanda. He particularly thanked President Lungu, Vice President Howard-Taylor, and Chairperson Moussa Faki, together with all the esteemed guests, for finding the time to join us today. He stressed that Rwanda is proud to serve as host of the SDG Centre for Africa. This institution is a true global partner, which embodies the commitment and expertise needed to deliver the Sustainable Development Goals. He wished

and commended Dr. Belay and his team for the excellent work they have been doing to make the path forward both clear and actionable. A prime example is the SDG Centre's new Africa 2030, Three-Year Reality Check, which he officially launched on this day.

President Kagame stipulated that being an African, this report makes for sobering reading. On almost every Goal, our continent is not on track to achieve the 2030 targets. Even the best amongst us are lagging behind the rest of the world.

This would not necessarily be discouraging if the rate of change was high. We all know where Africa is coming from and how much catching up we have to do.

However, on too many indicators the pace of progress is stagnant or even declining. The facts cannot be avoided and merit our full attention. In addition to the rich discussion that participants had earlier on this day the president added, two brief thoughts for participant's consideration which are;

1. Positive perspective. The SDGs are universal and ambitious, meaning they set targets that apply to countries at every level of economic development. Achieving the SDGs therefore represents the attainment of a significant level of prosperity and well-being, not merely the elimination of extreme poverty. In his views, it is preferable for Africa to aim high, even if it takes longer to get there, than to aim low and congratulate ourselves for doing the minimum. So long as we are in Africa understand that it really is within our power to achieve these goals, we are going to be fine. But it will not happen by accident. We have to do the right things and find the money to pay for it, including investing in strong national statistics agencies.
2. The second point was about the SDG financing gap in Africa, which the report estimates at between 500 billion and 1.2 trillion dollars per year. Whose problem is this?

President Kagame, articulated that the SDGs are a global compact, which is very meaningful, but development assistance is not growing, and it is reasonable to expect this trend to continue. Foreign investment is also flat while speeding up progress towards the SDGs is first and foremost our problem and responsibility as Africans. We live in an inter-dependent world and we work closely with partners. But the political leadership on this topic

has to be heard most strongly from African voices. This is critical for bringing all stakeholders together and maintaining momentum. And yes, we also have to pay as much of the cost as we can with our own resources, which are, by the way, not inconsiderable. It is therefore significant to learn in the report that remittances from the African diaspora are now the largest source of external income for our continent.

This shows that we lack nothing in Africa except a sense of urgency. The idea to establish dedicated African funds for education, water, and health has a lot of merit. This is an opportunity to work with Africa's partners in new and better ways to deliver human-scale projects that directly touch the lives of farmers, families, and schoolchildren.

We are already one-quarter of the way to 2030. Africa can definitely make up for lost time, but we

need a much faster pace. The president we prepare for the SDG review summit later this year in New York, our goal should be to bring new energy and focus to the process. The work of SDG Centre for Africa and the deliberations at this conference are critically important in that regard. I wish to thank all of you once again for your participation, and I look forward to joining my sisters and brothers in the next session for an interactive conversation.

2.4. PRESIDENTIAL PANEL: REFLECTIONS ON SDGs PROGRESS IN AFRICA



A high level panel discussion held by H.E Paul Kagame, H.E Edgar Chagwa Lungu, H.E Vice President Dr. Jewel C. Howard-Taylor and H.E Moussa Faki Mahamat; moderated by Dr. Donald Kaberuka

The presidential panel was moderated by Dr. Donald Kaberuka, the seventh President of the African Development Bank. He began the panel discussion by welcoming all the presidents, reflecting on the previous discussions and shared three things which are that the world in 2015 had the best plan ever for a prosperous world, the picture is mixed and we should do something in order to come back on track. The chances are that by 2030 there will be 600 million people leaving in poverty and 400 million of them will be from Sub Saharan Africa but we have enough room to do something. Dr. Kaberuka gave each leader 3 minutes to share their remarks.

H.E Edgar Chagwa Lungu, President of the Republic of Zambia and SDGC/A Board Member

Was the first to share the remarks and he extended his gratitude to President Paul Kagame for the warm welcome to him and his delegates. His Excellence said that it's a great honor for him to be part of the panel discussion and he shared the concrete initiative and the progress on SDGs implementation in Zambia. In order to meet the SDGs Zambia has aligned the SDGs to its 7TH National Development Plan (NDP). Therefore, SDGs are being implemented simultaneously with the NDP. In terms of monitoring they are using the same mechanisms that they use in the NDP to monitor the SDGs and He is sure that Zambia will do better in the SDGs era than what they accomplished in the MDG era.

H.E Paul Kagame, President Of THE Republic of Rwanda and Chair of the SDC/A Board

Stipulated that the meeting was very important and the SDGCA did a very good job by bringing out what is supposed to be done in a simplified manner because there are several things to attend to within the SDGs framework. As we move forward we really need to be focused in making a difference in real terms. We can have SDGs well defined, but we need to move a long distance and improve life to a significant extend for our people in a different way. We can see on our continent the tendency of massaging poverty and living with it for as long as we can.

H.E Vice President Dr. Jewel C. Howard-Taylor, Vice President of the Republic of Liberia

Thanked H.E President Paul Kagame for taking the responsibility to host the SDGC/A and also following up to make sure that the SDGs targets are met. She added a voice to what H.E Paul Kagame said that the SDGs are indeed possible. It's frustrating that Africa has all the human and natural resources available to us, yet we continue to complain about how our people continue to live in abject poverty, have no access to basic human rights and we keep looking across the streets. The SDGs are possible if we have leaders that will make political decisions, the right choices, find a way to turn some of the internal resources that are possible to begin the process and then find out what addition external resources that can be put together to help us achieve the SDGs. *It is possible and we must not drop the ball.*

H.E Moussa Faki Mahamat, Chairperson, African Union Commission

Said that despite having the ambitious objectives in Agenda 2063 and in the SDGs are it is possible to achieve them. But we have to convince ourselves and *to convince ourselves deeply of it*, it is not just a fact of the words, it needs the political will which must be accompanied by concrete actions on the political level, on the economic and social level. He also said that if the challenge is global, the effort must be global and certainly the success could only be global but as Africans we are all aware that we started badly off but it is never too late to have a good start. We have the potential, it is really enough to be convinced and act accordingly.

Dr. Kaberuka

Articulated that he was impressed with the speech that the H.E president Edgar Lungu presented in Parliament in 2018. The speech talked about Zambia's 2030 vision and how it mirrored exactly what is in the SDGs. However, on the same day there were some concerns from Zambians that the country is taking too much debts but he did not necessarily agree with the numbers. He also saluted the President for his government's efforts in collecting revenue which is one of the best in the region, it was much better in the past but now it's on its way back to ensure that enough resources for the SDGs have been mobilized.

Dr. Kaberuka gave the floor to H.E President Lungu to articulate on how African countries can finance and develop their countries using domestic resources, mobilizing external resources both grants and debts which are needed to achieve the goals.

H.E President Edgar Lungu responded that "All countries owe one another country, there is no country that doesn't have debts, but the question is about how countries use the resources that they borrow. The most important thing is whether the borrowed money was used for the intended objective or not thus what is critical. What should bother us is the capacity to pay back or we are going to bother the future generations, these are key questions. H.E Lungu said that he recently made some drastic decisions on one giant mining company because they thought was a flight of resources from their country, thus tax aversion and dealings/inside trading.

Consultation has been key for their governance system by making sure that they deliver what they promised the population. "Working with civil society and private sector and all of us we can help out to resolve the difficulties." He believes that the system is perfect but they are subject to reform which come to play from time to time, people should check if we are on the right direction and thus why we are here.

Dr. Kaberuka: With reference to what Dr. Vera Songwe said that 2015 was a year of great dreams when the world came together to make great plans and a few years later we live in a different world, commitment has gone. Therefore, there are two ways to look at it; one of them is: this is a temporary address because a few leaders in the world do not believe in multilateralism. The second way to look at is as this is a shift which might return us back to pre2015. And I want you to help us given the work that you have done in the global commissions in the SDGs themselves and in the African Union what this means in Africa in attainment of the SDGs and this changing global environment.

H.E President Kagame:

When we look at these challenges or the problems at global level, the first reaction should not be to despair or want to run away from the problems. Instead he would prefer to look at the situation providing the opportunities as well. There are huge opportunities involved in the change that has been taking place across the global will always be the case. In his views Africa is paving on two tracks, the first one being challenged with a number of things, on the other hand it is also endowed with not only with resources but opportunities. Opportunities in the sense that change we see on the other hand, the populism that has been spreading many parts of the world looking inward. On the first assumption it is the huge problem that might even be surmountable on the other hand we should understand it on different angle that for Africa to be left on its own it's an opportunity to find ways to solve the problems.

"In actual fact I can say Africa has been spoilt, we have been spoilt because whenever there is a problem we cry and then expect somebody else to come and deal with our problem."

It has happened so often for example you raised the issues with Zambia yet as a country it is endowed with a lot of resources, therefore if management of these resources improves governance, skills, and knowledge, which we are all trying to obtain for our countries they can solve a big part of the problem. It can even get better if we establish free trade across the continent for example creating one air transport market. African also needs to mobilize its own funding and better ways of tackling problems and then cooperate with the rest of the world to fill the gap.

Dr. Kaberuka: *H.E Vice President Dr. Jewel C. Howard-Taylor, as H.E President Paul Kagame said that we should not just aim at eliminating poverty but we should aim higher and he also mentioned that the initial conditions are not the same. But your country Liberia has come from a long way, 10 years of bloodshed and worse; I visited Liberia during Ebola crisis. I have seen worse but I never expected what I saw, i.e. the health system had completely collapsed, institutions not functioning. So, I keep wondering if I look at these SDGs while bearing in mind where you are coming from, what is that special effort you will need to catch up for the lost time to overcome those challenges? What will you take?*

H.E Vice President Dr. Jewel C. Howard-Taylor's:

It will take strong political will not only at the top but at every level of governance. Truly Liberia had it challenges, we have held together more than 15 years of peace. We have tried our best to rebuild the infrastructure and we are resource rich country but as most countries in Africa, we continue to do business in the same way.

Having multilateral scam in our country that take our resources and giving nothing back to the country as in form of proper taxes; using social corporate responsibilities as a way to blindfold local areas and nothing really is given to transform those areas. Our government is trying despite the fact that most of the products we sell overseas the prices are very low. The Liberian budget is 80% salaries, so we can't build schools and hospitals, but what the SDGs inform us is that it is a regular problem that ties in the nation, if we put together what we have and change how we do our budgets we can improve some of the problems for example quality education.

3. REVITALIZING NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT BANKS FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT



3.1. BACKGROUND

National Development Banks (NDBs)³ are specialized financial institutions established with a long-term development perspective to address market failure through providing, mainly, long-term financing to key strategic sectors which have critical importance in fostering the economic and social transformation of a country.

3. In this background note and agenda the term National Development Bank (NDB) is used interchangeably with National Development Finance Institutions (DFIs), which are specialized financial institutions established to provide long-term finance to priority sectors of the economy as identified in a country's national development strategy.

The Addis Ababa Action Agenda (AAAA), which is the financial framework for implementation of Agenda 2030, recognizes the potential role of development banks for accelerating the achievement of SDGs.

The experience of different countries including Brazil, the Republic of Korea, India and China substantiates the indispensable role of NDBs in sustainable development. Each of these country's respective NDB played a major role in igniting the creation of industries and implementing development strategies when their countries were experiencing industrial take-off.

Some of the factors that contributed to the successful role these NDBs played in development were a well-articulated developmental mandate, government support and diverse funding base (including debt and equity issuance, resources from other financial institutions and government transfers).

According to a United Nations report⁴, the financing required to support the achievement of the SDGs are enormous, which creates huge opportunities for private and public investments. One of the major answers to the financing gap for sustainable development can be found with the NDBs.

However, many NDBs in Africa are not ready and able to play this important development financing role under their current financial, organizational and policy conditions.

4. United Nations (2018). Media Advisory on High-Level Meeting on Financing the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.

The existing challenges of NDBs include: lack of clarity in mandate and sound governance; lack of robust risk management practices; inadequate capitalization and funding structure; weak monitoring and evaluation mechanism for impact assessment and related factors.

Recognizing the potential and importance of NDBs for the SDGs achievement in Africa, in 2017 The Sustainable Development Goals Center for Africa (SDGC/A) launched a continental-wide program to support the reform of NDBs for the achievement of the SDGs.

The core objective of the initiative is to revitalize the inherent and necessary role that the NDBs must play in financing sustainable development across Africa. Through this initiative, the SDGC/A is working with NDBs to, among other things, align their policies, operations, capacities and eligibilities with globally-available resources for supporting the SDGs and pro-poor projects.

3.2. OBJECTIVES

As a part of the SDGC/A initiative and the conference titled “SDGs Implementation in Africa- Reflections on a Three-Year Journey”, a pre-conference session on “Revitalization of National Development Banks for Sustainable Development” was conducted on 12th June 2019 at Kigali Convention Center, Kigali, Rwanda.

The preconference session on attracted participants with representation from NDBs, Central Banks, Ministry of Finance, Private Sector, UN Agencies, Multilateral Organizations , Civil Society, Academics, NGOs and related key stakeholders in the field.

The overall objective of the conference was:

- Promote the role of revitalizing NDBs for acceleration of achievement of the SDGs in Africa;
- Foster awareness and dialogue on the current situation of NDBs in Africa and proposed solutions to address their key challenges;
- Share expert views and standard practices to known potential impediments in bringing effectiveness to NDBs and discuss best practices;
- Promote and enhance networking and cross-learning among various development finance actors including NDBs, multilateral and regional organizations;
- Synthesize experiences and lessons learned from the NDBs which are participating in the SDGC/A’s initiative; and
- Encourage and enhance research on the role of development financing for economic and social transformation in Africa.

3.3. OPENING SPEECHES AND KEYNOTE ADDRESS



Dr. Belay Begashaw, Director General, SDGC/A delivering his welcome remarks

A. Key note address *Dr. Belay Begashaw, Director General, SDGC/A*

Dr. Belay Begashaw started his opening speech by welcoming participants to the pre-conference session and to the beautiful city of Kigali, Rwanda. He expressed that the conference creates an exciting opportunity to gather colleagues from development finance institutions, central banks, ministry of finance, other development institutions and academics to discuss pertinent issues about best practices of financing sustainable development which is the foundation that helps to fast track the achievement of SDGs in Africa.

Dr. Begashaw in his opening speech highlighted the following:

- Huge financial resources are needed to finance sustainable development in Africa and the estimated investment gap for Africa ranges between US\$ 500 billion to 1.2 trillion annually that creates paramount opportunities for private and public investments.
- Only a fraction of the needed amount of finance has been raised during the last three years Journey of implementation of SDGs with persistent tax revenue gaps and this is one of the major reasons which contributed to the slow progress of implementation of SDGs in many African countries.
- Africa is a continent where there is a significant market failure in financing strategic priority sectors that require long term finance. Most African countries still fall far behind in financing SDG investments from public and private sources.

He underlined that this calls for using innovative means of financing SDGs and one of which is the role that can be played by National Development Banks. NDBs play a decisive role in costing, coordinating, resource mobilization and capital provisioning to address long-term financing needs to key strategic sectors. However, many NDBs in Africa under their current financial, organizational and policy conditions are not ready and able to play this important financing role. Though Africa is home to more than 140 NDBs, they have not received adequate attention in the development agenda and many have a number of constraints inhibiting them from delivering their mandates.

The existing challenges of NDBs include: lack of clarity in mandate and sound governance; lack of robust risk management practices; inadequate capitalization and funding structure; weak monitoring and evaluation mechanism for impact assessment and related factors. Though NDBs have such critical constraints, National Governments have still not lost hope and have interest to strengthen them recognizing their critical relevance for sustainable development.

This indicates that immediate corrective action has to be taken to address the key challenges of NDBs so that they can play better role in sustainable development.

According to Dr. Belay Begashaw that is why the Sustainable Development Goals Center for Africa (SDGC/A) launched a continental-wide program to support the reform of NDBs for the achievement of the SDGs. The core objective of the initiative has been to revitalize the inherent and necessary role that the NDBs must play in financing sustainable development across Africa.

He pointed out that it is as a part of the SDGC/A initiative in reforming National Development Banks, NDB's pre-conference session was organized to discuss and deliberate the current status and prospects of National Development Banks in fostering economic development and achievement of SDGs, innovative sources of finance, policy and regulatory issues around national development banks, synthesizing the experiences and lesson learned of selected NDBs participating in the SDGC/A initiative, promote cross learning and fertilization, and put in place mechanisms to scale up the initiative.



Hon. Alexander Chiteme, Minister of National Development and Planning, Republic of Zambia delivering his key note address

B. Key note address by Hon. Alexander Chiteme, Minister of National Development and Planning, Republic of Zambia

Hon. Alexander Chiteme started his speech by thanking Dr. Belay Begashaw for the kind introduction and work done by the SDGC/A and welcoming participants for joining the very important session on the role that national development banks should and *must* play in financing the SDGs in Africa. He appreciated to see so many leaders from government, development banks, the United Nations and African Union, the private sector and others here in the conference room.

He also indicated that he is very glad to be a part of the Government of Zambia's delegation that come to attend this important event.

He emphasized that he is in full agreement with the objective of the SDGC/A initiative: to revitalize the national development banks which in fact have a very important and necessary role in financing sustainable development across Africa. He indicated his keen interest to look forward to hearing the experiences of the development banks of Rwanda and Uganda as they are two of the “pioneer” development banks in this initiative.

He also pointed out that he is very pleased to announce that in Zambia which believes the SDGC/A initiative as so important that will in the 3rd day of this conference Development Bank of Zambia and the SDG Center will be entering into a Memorandum of Understanding through which they will work together to strengthen the capacity of the Development Bank of Zambia to identify, develop and finance SDGs-related projects in Zambia.

After highlighting strong economic growth recorded by Zambia over the last 15 years and the challenge the country is facing in terms of poverty reduction, Hon. Chiteme expressed his belief that the Development Bank of Zambia should play a critical role in helping Zambia to deliver upon the inclusive and equitable development envisioned by our 7th National Development Plan and by the SDGs. He further elaborated that this is a fact and pertains to most all of the development banks across Africa. He also pointed out that NDBs are very indispensable to our continent's development and together we must work on the necessary reforms, both within the banks and within the regulatory and policy frameworks of the countries.

Among the reforms that he highlighted include improving the risk profile of the bank's financing so that there is increased investment in key development sectors, such as infrastructure, energy, industrialization, agricultural and related sectors; determining different and better options for fundraising and long-term capitalization which will enable the Bank to access affordable sources of funding to finance projects related to our national development plan and the SDGs and recovering our loans, and also measuring our impact.

Finally Hon. Chiteme ended his key note address by indicating that NDBs must now receive the attention they deserve from our leaders and regulators, from larger multi-lateral development finance institutions and other key development partners in order to enable them to realize their full potential and thanked the SDGC/A for convening this esteemed group in order to discuss and share important experiences and knowledge on these topics and, together, to help us continue to elevate the role of our national development banks in achieving the SDGs not only in Zambia, but in each country across Africa.

3.4. THEMATIC DISCUSSION ON ASSESSING THE CURRENT CONDITION & PROSPECT OF NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT BANKS IN AFRICA IN FOSTERING ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & ACHIEVEMENT OF SDGs



MODERATOR NAME:

Mr. Aniket Shah, Senior Fellow, Columbia University and Former Head of Sustainable Investing, OppenheimerFunds

SPEAKERS

1. Dr. Fode Ndiaye, One UN Rwanda Resident Coordinator, Rwanda
2. Mr. Eric Rutabana, Chief Executive Officer, Rwanda Development Bank (representing Secretary General of Association of Africa Development Finance institutions (AADFIs))
3. Mr. Eric Rwigamba, Director General, Financial Sector Development, Rwanda Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning
4. Dr. Khutula Sibanda, Chief Economist, Infrastructure Development Bank of Zimbabwe
5. Mr. Wycliff Bbossa, Executive for Portfolio Management, Trade & Development Bank

Objective of the session

To assess the current condition and prospects of National Development Banks in Africa in fostering economic development and achievement of the SDGs.

Introduction (summary of the panel moderator introduction)

Aniket Shah after thanking Dr. Belay Begashaw and Honorable Alexander Chiteme for setting the stage for the rest of the discussion has proceeded to moderate the first panel discussion by giving the following introductory remark. We are incredibly privileged to have this panel of experts who dedicated their life and career to understand financial system and more specifically in working in development finance and development banking.

The Addis Ababa Action Agenda which is a framework for financing SDGs has mentioned development banks 33 times in 25 page document highlighting the critical role of national development banks. The international community thinks that the NDBs can and should play decisive role in supporting sustainable development. We all know the reality is more complicated than the theory and we have panelists to share us the current status of NDBs and where they should go in the future in playing their critical role.

Discussion Question 1:

Reflection on the current status of NDBs and the way forward.

Mr. Eric Rutabana, Chief Executive Officer, Rwanda Development Bank

- Most NDBs in Africa were born after Independence with intention to become catalysts in development. He also mentioned there are also other NDBs on the other world which were initially created to finance reconstruction after the World War.
- However the NDBs were not supported in the ways they needed to deliver the mandate. The performance of the NDBs started declining due to lack of funding and policy support, until the financial crisis in 2007-2008 when it was realized that NDBs could be a solution during difficult times. That is the time governments started to understand their importance.
- It is now widely recognized by numerous government the importance and need to revitalize the NDBs.
- NDBs have a strong role to play in realizing the SDGs objectives.

Dr. Fode Ndiaye, One UN Rwanda Resident Coordinator, Rwanda

- At the beginning of independence, Africa started to put forward of this important aspect of finance to ensure sustainable development. However there were key challenges facing which include the following:
 - High NPLs due political pressure
 - Resources-resources are diverted to something else due to political interference and pressure.
 - Low internal capacity to undertake project analysis
 - Problem with funding structure-Lack of long term financing- As NDBs are engaged in long term financing, long term resources such as long term saving are needed to address asset liability mismatch.
 - Weak risk assessments due to lack of adequate information and losing track of financial flow of clients.
 - Problem related to how to organize value chain where there are discrepancies.
- As a result the institutions started struggling and many NDBs turned to provide consumer lending which was easier to do than development.
- Such challenges have led to decline of NDBs in West Africa with only 2 NDBs still in existence:
- In terms of where NDBs are heading, the most important think we have to consider is without finance the SDGs and AU Agenda 2063 cannot be achieved. It is critical to have the right financing to achieve SDGs and AU Agenda 2063. In this regards there are three important things:
 - Money is available but not correctly allocated due to corruption and illicit financing. For instance, we need 5-7 billion to finance SDGs which is equivalent to the misinvoicing in Africa.
 - Lack of innovative ways of funding: This include accessing implicit guarantee like for example China development Banks for financing through long-term development bond finding other means to adequately capitalize NDBs.
 - The role of NDBs in counter-cyclical lending which helped a critical role during crisis times and would be used as a buffer to mitigate crisis effects for example on SMEs (ex. Development Bank of Brazil (BNDES) and Korea development bank).

Mr. Eric Rwigamba, Rwanda Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning

- Intention to establish NDBs is right and positive however the challenge is in delivering the mandate.
- National Planning: when it comes to planning and budget allocation, the NDBs are not invited to the table, which led to lower domestic resource mobilization.
- Difficulties to mobilize resources as they are not accepting deposits, low country rating which makes hard to mobilize external sources of funding.
- NDBs are considered as last resort solution making their pipeline very weak
- NDBs are lagging behind in terms of innovative technology compared to commercial banks
- Finally it is necessary to further explore how to develop investment pipelines that are able to deliver SDGs and transform the livelihood of the communities and how to strike the balance between risks faced in financing long term development by at the same time making NDBs sustainable.

Mr. Wycliff Bbossa, TDB

- History has been unfair to NDBs because of largely the way they are set-up.
- NDBs do not have sufficient funding.
- Capacity building for NDBs has always been lagging behind particularly in underwriting loans having longer maturity period of 10-15 years particularly infrastructural financing and internal policies and procedures.
- TDB works with other NDBs to help them deliver their mandate such as co-financing, lines of credit and capacity building.
- Importance of robust risk management system and good governance structure for NDBs to address political interference.
- What can be done (i) work with best practices through partnerships, and (ii) capacitate NDBs to attract resources from outside.

Dr. Khutula Sibanda, Infrastructure Development Bank of Zimbabwe

- There are three main development finance institutions in Zimbabwe- Agriculture, SMEs & Infrastructure.
- SADC have a forum where they meet to discuss performance of DFIs in the region and there are key issues coming out. Even though many of the SADC countries have achieved middle-income status, NDBs in the region still face the following:
 - Though each country 2-3 NDBs, the level of asset base and capitalization is low except few of them.
 - Capitalization is a real issue (e.g. Zimbabwe have a US\$ 1.2 Billion gap in financing infrastructure)
 - Debt challenge which is a bottleneck to raise resources
 - Low saving culture (e.g. In Zimbabwe, 1-5% saving ratio to GDP making raising resources from Pension Fund difficult. This is due to the current macroeconomic situation.
 - Internal issue of governance
 - Shortage of bankable projects to attract essential resources which is a very critical issue.

Discussion Question 2:

Does the fact that most NDBs are owned largely by Government represent a challenge or an opportunity? Reflection on NDBs as instruments of the state and its implication for exposing them for undue political influence

Mr. Eric Rutabana, Chief Executive Officer, Rwanda Development Bank

- Recognized that political influence is alive in NDBs in Africa.
- NDBs are owned by national governments. They need to leverage this government support in their effort to raise resource including capitalization and provision of guarantees to raise additional financial resources. At this level it is not necessarily political influence but it is a matter of aligning NDBs strategy with national development plan.
- Negative influence would be when BoDs are influenced by Government. In this regard, NDBs should have an independent regulatory body and more independent BoDs.
- Regulated institutions have better corporate governance mechanism.

Dr. Fode Ndiaye, One UN Rwanda Resident Coordinator, Rwanda

- External political influence can also impact the business operation of NDBs. Sometimes national governments use NDBs to achieve political gains-for example during political campaigns and NDBs have to resist by providing appropriate response.
- NDBs plans should be aligned to the national plans
- Importance to bring the accountability aspect-meaning accountability to the people.
- Good regulatory framework necessary as it hampers the way NDBs do business.
- Solutions can be implemented the following ways: (i) diversified shareholding structure, (ii) bring in partners that par take directly in the consequences derived from the policies of the Bank, (iii) Government can support by establishing guarantee funds like from Africa Risk Capacity or related organizations and/or reduction in the cost of doing business iv. Need to have financial strategy including how to how to mobilize savings.
- Overall it is not an easy task.

Mr. Eric Rwigamba, Rwanda Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning

- The corporate governance of NDBs is a reflection of how the overall governance system of the country. NDBs do not operate in a vacuum, they operate in the nation.
- NDBs do not work in a vacuum but in ecosystem
- It shouldn't be necessarily interpreted as in a negative way, it is rather collaboration:
 - NDBs financing strategic projects with support from Government
 - Direct capitalization
 - Government collaboration can support to de-risk the typical NDBs pipeline as it is relatively risky business.
- If there is a good and strategic intention, partnership with the government could be helpful. If the intention is not good, it will have negative outcome.

Mr. Wycliff Bbossa, TDB

- State ownership is not bad. Look at the regional development banks; they are owned by governments and performing well. NDBs have to leverage on state ownership.
- Regional DFIs leverage on their rating (derived from country rating) to attract diverse funding. NDBs have to think what else they can do to attract necessary funding.
- There are also challenges related to governance including high turnover of the senior management.
- If NDBs look good, investors will look at them. NDBs should improve internal process, upgrading them to best practices so that they are attractive to capitalization beyond government.

Dr. Khutula Sibanda, Infrastructure Development Bank of Zimbabwe

- Most NDBs in SADC region are rated in the middle (e.g. 50 out of 100) in terms of political interference) and hence there is a lot to be done.
- In the area of infrastructural financing and value chain, the politicians have to be clean in the areas of transparency, licensing, procurement and implementation of requirements related to environmental assessment where by putting in place mechanisms that treat all investors equally.

Finally, discussion was made on why the regional development banks which have relatively similar ownership and governance structure lead by Africans have been able to better perform than the NDBs. It was discussed that this is not only a matter of choice but also the way capital and ownership of regional development banks is structured with 60% owned by governments and 40% with external shareholding.

Q&A (main questions from the participants and answers from panelists)

1. What is the appetite level of NDBs to invest in pro-poor projects?

Dr. Khutula has explained that with an aim to deliver SDG1 (poverty reduction), NDBs have a clear mandate to contribute to poverty reduction. He also explained the difference on how the NGOs work in using grant to implement projects and development finance work where there is business and sustainability element in it. He emphasized there should be more collaboration b/n the NGOs and NDBs by using blending finance model.

Mr. Eric Rwigamba emphasized that NDBs aim to finance pro-poor projects, however there is an issue around the bankability of rural based projects to develop a viable pipeline. These types of projects can only be effectively supported by NDBs partnering with the government. Example of Rwanda: affordable housing projects, renewable energy projects, cooperative of farmers. Robust institutional framework is critical for delivering and measuring the impact of these pro-poor projects.

Mr Eric Rutabana reflected that NDBs finance pro-poor projects by working with NGOs and the government which are relevant in providing affordable service for important but difficult projects such as mini-grids as an example.. Such partnerships helps to have more impact which otherwise may not be possible to implement vital but relatively risky pro-poor projects.

2. Are NDBs rated by credit agencies?

Dr. Khutula Sibanda explained that NDBs are peer rated by AADFI.

Mr. Wycliff Bbossa added that rating makes them credible institutions. There is room to improve and aim to aspire to international rating which helps to attract better funding with reasonable interest rate which can be passed to pro-poor projects. Ex. TDB which is self-regulated aspired to be investment rated and is now rated by Moody's.

There are institutions interested with green bonds and SDGs bonds. A standard framework and method has to be developed for impact monitoring and this is very critical for accessing innovative sources of finance including green and SDG bonds.

Mr Eric Rutabana indicated that NDBs in Africa as member of AADFI submit reports to the association and receive rating on annual basis. He also pointed out that it is also good to depend on external ratings which will help to get access to affordable funding. However the challenge has been the outcome of the rating which is most of the time similar to sovereign rating.

Dr. Fode Ndiaye: the most important things are leadership and accountability. Finance is not an end by itself. It is a means to an end for example the global agenda-2030. The recent report issued by inter agency task force on financing for development highlights the role of multilateral development banks and pension funds on financing sustainable development. The report indicates that the seven big pension funds in the world invest 76% of their resource in liquid assets and 3% on long terms projects. Therefore, the issue of how do you get the right resources is should be further explored. All the issues discussed are important to access such funding including the external rating.

3. How can projects be de-risked for NDBs investment? Differentiation between perceived and actual risk?

Dr. Fode Ndiaye: It is important to understand what is real risk and perceived risk. In de-risking it we need to separately consider social projects and other profitable projects. Some of the mechanisms which have been used in the past include setting up international guarantee fund and UN youth connect project which works in promoting entrepreneurship which is also a way of de-risking.

A mention that NDB investments can be de-risked by use of guarantee funds (from Gov'ts or Guarantee agencies), capacity building (e.g. Youth Connect), also note that startups should be financed by venture capital and related schemes as they are relatively risky.

Mr Eric Rutabana: One of the most important mandates of NDBs is to work with the private sector in de-risking their business. This involves understanding the entire value chain and identification of where the risk is coming from to introduce mitigating mechanism. There is technical support provided by NDBs to deal with risk before even making the decision on investment.

There should be a delicate balance of risk taking and maintaining sustainability.

4. Do export credit agencies have an important role in this eco-system?

Mr. Wycliff Bbossa:

- There is a lot which has not been exploited.
- NDBs have to further explore this avenue.
- TDB works with ECAs. ECA bring subsidized finance to the region.

5. Should sub and regional DFIs be held accountable to supporting the development of NDBs of their member country?

Dr. Khutula Sibanda explained that government expect their respective NDBs to be supported by the regional DFIs. Agree that more collaboration is needed for impactful results.

6. How do NDBs measure their development impact?

Dr. Khutula Sibanda emphasized that measuring systems exist in SADC member NDBs and these are very important as NDBs primary role is not profit making. NDBs use impact indicators such as amount of roads constructed, no. of jobs created etc. in impact monitoring.

Mr Eric Rutabana: Impact monitoring is a way of measuring the performance of NDBs and it is high time for NDBs to introduce effective impact monitoring mechanisms as investors (governments and socially motivated investors) are very keen to see the outcome of their investment.

3.5. PARALLEL THEMATIC GROUP AND PANEL DISCUSSIONS

Thematic Discussion on Creating the enabling policy, regulatory and governance framework for promoting development financing in Africa



Group Discussion facilitators:

1. Mr. Stewart Bobo, Policy Analyst, South African Reserve Bank
2. Mr. Yigrem Kassa, SDGs, Advisor on Development Financing, The Sustainable Development Goals Center for Africa

The group discussion focused on sharing experience on the specific nature of mandates, business model, and ownership and governance structure of the NDBs and over all policy & regulatory practices and key challenges affecting their performance of NDBs.

Panel Discussion

Moderator: Mr. Yigrem Kassa, SDGs Advisor, The Sustainable Development Goals Center for Africa

Panelists:

- Mr. Getahun Nana, former Vice Governor, National Bank of Ethiopia and President Development Bank of Ethiopia
- Ms. Peace Uwase, Director General, Financial Stability, National Bank of Rwanda
- Dr. Ephraim A. Mwasusuti, Assistant Manager, Development Finance Institutions and Pensions, Bank of Tanzania
- Mr. Simon Rutege, Advisor to the Governor of Uganda, Financial Markets Development
- Mr. Stewart Bobo, Policy Analyst, South African Reserve Bank

Discussion Question 1: Should NDBs be regulated and how?

Mr. Simon Rutege, Advisor to the Governor of Uganda, Financial Markets Development

- In Uganda, National Development Banks are not regulated by the government. There is no regulation framework. The BoU is working hard to introduce regulatory framework for NDBs.
- When taking about policy & regulation we have to consider the whole financial system including MFIs, SACCOs, commercial banks, NDBs etc. , understand the mission and vision of NDBs, type of business model they follow.
- Proportional regulation should be followed in regulating NDBs by understanding the risks they face. The special risks they face should be understood and political risks have to be buffered.
- *Mr. Getahun Nana, former Vice Governor, National Bank of Ethiopia and President Development Bank of Ethiopia*
- NDBs should be regulated.

- The justification for regulating NDBs may not be the traditional reason of deposit protection and contribution to systemic risk. The rationale behind regulating NDBs should be:
- Check and balance on the Mandate: Someone should be there to see whether the institution is meeting its mission or not.
- Overseeing the utilization of public funds
- Risk Management: To oversee how NDBs are managing different types of risks. There is always a challenge on remarketing a clear line on sustainability and risk taking in NDBs. There should be a reasonable risk management framework so that the NDBs will not be ending up being a commercial bank.
- Sustainability
- Governance- to check the governance system and ensure NDBs are operating as independent institutions from political interference.
- Regulation should be performed by an independent institution and not by owner like ministry of finance.

Dr. Ephraim A. Mwasausuti, Assistant Manager, Development Finance Institutions and Pensions, Bank of Tanzania

- The NDBs do not operate in isolation, they are part-and-parcel of the country's financial system, and therefore, leaving them outside the regulatory ambit (unregulated) could be catastrophic to the financial system given their interrelationships and interconnectedness with other players in the system.
- Much as regulating NDBs may serve as prudential measures that mitigate the effects of economic crises on the stability of the banking system and subsequent accompanying macroeconomic results, it has its dark side – may hinder some of the key initiatives including plans to introduce new products and services.

Discussion Question 2: Should NDBs be regulated the same way as commercial banks?

Mr. Simon Rutega, Advisor to the Governor of Uganda, Financial Markets Development

- The performance of NDBs should be measured in a different way, we have to understand the specific jurisdiction in the country
- Loan classification and provision should not be a one size fits all approach.

Mr. Getahun Nana, former Vice Governor, National Bank of Ethiopia and President Development Bank of Ethiopia

- NDBs are different animals that require different type of supervision.
- Regulation should be enabling and should not inhibit.
- Regulation should be proportionate to the problem we are solving.
- With regard to permissible activities the following should be taken in to consideration:
 - The important thing here is the mission of the institution.
 - The critical problem for NDBs is funding mobilization b/c of the lack of well-developed capital market.
 - NDBs should not be allowed to mobilize short term deposits as it creates mismatch of assets and liability.
 - Any deposits mobilized from the public should be guaranteed.
 - NDBs should be allowed to mobilize deposits from institutional investors through time deposits or issuing bonds.
 - The use of the fund should not be to compete with commercial banks rather for providing medium and long term funding for priority sectors.
 - Clear mandates should be given to NDBs so that they should not compete with commercial banks. They should work only to address market failure.

Ms. Peace Uwase, Director General, Financial Stability, National Bank of Rwanda

- BNR is a consolidated supervisor except the capital market.
- The performance of NDBs have effect on the performance of the banking sector.
- In Rwanda the loans and provisioning requirements are the same as those for commercial banks and minimum capital requirement.
- BNR is considering coming up with regulatory framework for NDBs taking in to consideration the risk they pause.
- Mobilizing long term finance is something that can be learned from Tanzanian experience.
- The most important thing is to create regulatory environment that is supportive and should not be too lax.

Dr. Ephraim A. Mwasausuti, Assistant Manager, Development Finance Institutions and Pensions, Bank of Tanzania

- NDBs should NOT be regulated in the same way commercial banks are regulated because the two differ from each other as they have different set-ups and balance sheet structures.
- **Capital adequacy requirements:** Due to the nature of business, NDBs are required bigger initial minimum (TZS 50,000 million (equivalent to US\$ 21.74 million)) and on-going capital requirements than commercial banks. Capital Conservation Buffer (Basel III) is not applicable to NDBs. The initial minimum capital requirement is considered as too little which the threshold does not commensurate with the risks and thus a need for a higher capital level would work better.
- **Permissible activities:** DFIs are allowed to do the following activities:
 - Mobilize fixed deposits only, whose maturities should not be less than 24 months. This makes Tanzanian regulatory framework different from that of other countries such as Rwanda, Ethiopia etc.
 - Lending to finance various projects comprising industrial loans, infrastructure loans, SME - financing, service loans, oil and gas loans, financial leasing, and equity financing.
 - Administers Government funds for agriculture and energy projects and provides technical assistance.

- **Corporate governance:** Corporate governance principles should be equally are even more stringently applied to NDBs on the grounds that they have the sole ownership (the Government) which provide for excessive powers which if not controlled may infringe the principles of good corporate governance.
- **Single Borrower Loan Limit:** Single Borrower's Limit requirements apply equally to all banks including the NDBs. However the requirements are restrictive to business of NDBs such that every now and then they are requesting for dispensations. A different set of exposure limits which are less restrictive (say, double the current limits) should be designed to suit the business of NDBs.
- **Liquidity requirement:** The debt service coverage ratio be used as a regulatory requirement limit. The debt-service coverage ratio (DSCR) is a measurement of the cash flow available to pay current debt obligations. The ratio states net operating income as a multiple of debt obligations due within one year, including interest, principal, sinking-fund and lease payments.
- **Loan classification and provisioning:** There is a different loan classification and provisioning requirement for NDBs. It is fair for the NDBs to be subjected to a different loan classification and provisioning framework which is flexible depending on the nature of the projects they finance.

Discussion Question 1: Is Basel III framework appropriate to NDBs?

Mr. Simon Rutega, Advisor to the Governor of Uganda, Financial Markets Development

- Basel III is relevant for attracting investors –to create attractive operating environment. Good to aspire the regulation considering the risk and environment.
- Mr. Getahun Nana, former Vice Governor, National Bank of Ethiopia and President Development Bank of Ethiopia
- Basel III is not appropriate framework for NDBs. Regulation should be fit for the purpose. It should be the issue of proportionality. There is a possibility to customize with a little bit of fine twining the Basel III framework. There are good aspects making it applicable to NDBs.
- Ms. Peace Uwase, Director General, Financial Stability, National Bank of Rwanda
- Regulation creates good -----for international financing.
- Require stronger capital adequacy requirements. Pegging capital to GDP is a very relevant mechanism.

Dr. Ephraim A. Mwasausuti, Assistant Manager, Development Finance Institutions and Pensions, Bank of Tanzania

All Basel frameworks in place (Basel I, II and Basel III) are suitable for regulating NDBs, however, they should be applied selectively in different ranges of rates and limits and there is such consideration in the regulation of NDBs in Tanzania.

Thematic Discussion on Strengthening Capitalisation & Innovative Sources of Finance for Ndbs In Africa



MODERATOR NAME:

Aniket Shah, Senior Fellow, Columbia University and Former Head of Sustainable Investment, Oppenheimer Fund

Speakers (name, Position, Organization)

- Mr. Peter Wamicwe, Associate, Africa Region, Convergence
- Mr. Eric Bundugu, Acting Executive Director, Capital Markets Authority of Rwanda
- Ato. Hailemeleket T/Georgis, Former State Minister of Finance & Economic Development of Ethiopia and Chairperson, Addis International Bank
- Mr. Jacques Mukwende, Head of Resource Division, Department of Strategic Policy, Monitoring Evaluation & Resource Mobilization, African Union Commission

Objective of the session

- Contextualize the earlier group discussions on Innovative sources of funding for NDBs and room for questions.
- Details of the Panel Discussion:
- What are the innovative sources of finance for NDBs?

Jacque Mukwende:

The African Union has developed the Agenda 2063 similar to the SDGs. Before implementing Agenda 2063 they identified a need to talk about financial resources.

Assessment of NDBs took place and identified some major challenges:

1. Capitalization: currently reliant on government support, need to think of other resources and compete with other banks. Improve credit rating, access funds and access capital markets. IPO, introduce a green tax, draw from blended finance, and leverage commercial banks.
2. Management: strong management is required to improve credit ratings and transform NDBs so they can access innovative sources of finance including from the capital market and leverage from blended finance.

Discuss the possibility of using capital market as sources of funding for NDBs. Does BRD issue bonds in Capital market? If they do, will they get buyer domestically and internationally?

Eric Bundugu:

- Source of funding is not the issue, Capital is available and waiting for opportunities. There is an excess of Capital in some regions.
- Need for NDBs to position themselves to attract and tap these opportunities. Governance independence) of NDBs is one issue that should be addressed..
- Capital markets are recognized as being important in AAAA, Agenda 2063 and the SDGs. This are initiatives being taken at high level.
- BRD is not yet issuing Bonds on Capital Markets but in Eric's opinion they should.

- Investors are looking for opportunities, and NDBs have a huge responsibility.
- For example the capital market in Rwanda has been working since 2008 and all products have been oversubscribed including Debt or Equity. Investors are eager for new products and BRD and other NDBs raise resources.

Tells us more about Convergence and blended finance in the context of development financing

Peter Wamicwe:

Convergence:

- Global network for blended finance
- Provided data and intelligence for both investors and investees
- Design funding = provide feasibility capital for entities who have catalytic project ideas

Blended Finance = The use of concessional Capital (private/public) used to mobilize private capital for deals that could not have been possible otherwise. The principles of blended transactions are:

1. Positive Return
2. Ability to leverage & attract private capital from e.g impact investors
3. Must be development in nature

Blended Finance and NDBs:

- Need to be able to raise funds so they can achieve their projects and targets
- PTA, TDB have different credit rating. Non-regional shareholders in the structure allow them to access finance.
- Blended Finance can be realized at organizational level which allows scaling up work and impact.

Give us your reflection on the discussion so far and some of your experience from Ethiopia (what has worked and not worked well) particularly on DBE which is one of the largest development bank in the continent?

Mr. Hailemekot

Possible Solutions:

- Raise public money
- NDBs should enhance the management and technical skill of staff to appraise projects and in terms of governance NDBs has to be independent.
- There should be support from government which is important for NDBs capitalization & access to bonds.
- Most important issue in Africa is Macro-economic stability

National Development Bank of Ethiopia used to be successful but nowadays due to unrest the national economy got shaky and funds that have been financed by NDB are struggling due to political situation. The government is working on reforming the bank.

One of the sources of fund is bond issued for the private commercial banks which constitute 27% of their loan with low interest rate. DBE invests this money in financing long term development projects. DBE no deposit taking experience yet.

What are the pros and cons of allowing NDBs to mobilize customer deposit as a potential source of funding?

Dr. Fode Ndiaye

- One of the factors that has to be considered is the regulation. Some countries does not allow as it may create some regulatory burden.
- Network could increase transaction cost.
- If NDBs are involved in accepting deposits, it will allow them to better understand th business and customers.

**Relationship of NDBs with ADB/regional development finance institutions/
Should regional development banks raise money & on-lend to NDBs or
NDBs should borrow directly from the international market or NDBs
should access both?**

Jacque Mukwende:

Larger institutions have better credit ratings which will facilitate access to finance.

National Development Banks should partner with ADB as they cannot be on the same level in term of their credit rating.

On-lending is one source of funding that NDBs should explore and they should be able to channel funds towards their institution. Institutions like AfDB have window to help NDBs access funding.

Eric Bundugu:

On-lending from regional development banks is ok in the short term as the SDGs cannot wait for NDBs to tap into capital markets. It is an Interim Solution.

Need an inclusive approach to governance, banking regulations so NDBs will be enabled to access capital markets directly. There is no reason why NDBs cannot access the international capital in medium and long term.

Peter Wamicwe:

Use of regional institutions like AfDB as an Anchor investor in the short term is very important. In the long-term there is a clear need to up-skill staff and restructure and re-organize themselves to improve the credit ratings of NDBs to allow them to raise funds on their own.

Mr. Haile Melemeleket;

DBE is getting loans from regional DB through government guarantees. If the regional DBs are good then in his opinion this structure can continue in the long run.

Comment from Kofi Adomakoh,

In NDBs accessing the international capital market by themselves, they must take in to consideration the macro-economic situation and the country in which the NDB is located. This is for the fact that NDBs may not get better rating than the sovereign rating. This is the challenge faced by Afrexim bank and took time to get better rating than Egypt where the bank is located. Aniket Shah also made a comment that consideration of additional intermediaries increase the cost of borrowing. Improve capitalization through different channels, change management structures and focus on the outcome of projects.

Q&A SESSION

I. **Moderator name:** Aniket Shah, Senior Fellow, Columbia University and Former Head of Sustainable Investment, Oppenheimer Fund

II. Q&A summary

Addressing gender inequality in Banks: How do NDBs address 'Soft issues' and help to bring change in the society?

Addressing gender and social transformation depends on the strategy of the respective NDB. Soft issues are very important for NDBs to consider! It is a key factor outside commercial component to ensure they have an impact on Gender Equality and other issues of Social and Environmental Justice. NDBs are there to support national development plan which take in to consideration gender and social issues. NDBs like in Ethiopia work with microfinance institutions and small holder farmers which primarily target women and make regular reports.

NDBs have a Social/Environmental Governance Framework in place with indicators for consideration before investments are being made. Accessing specific Bonds and Funds with purpose such as green bonds or SDG bonds targeted Funds. NDBs need to be inclusive, consider all relevant stakeholders through design and implementation.

Regional development banks and NDBs have renewable energy financing products which primarily target Women clients & provision of services is made to off-grid community. The sector has not been attractive to the private sector and NDBs are working to address the gap.

Are NDBs able to fill the private sector gap in providing access to energy in off-grid communities?

Finance for Energy is high risk. Development Banks may be able to use blended finance to mitigate risks and can be a solution.

Need to manage expectations on NDBs for financing all implementation and need to bring private sector into the discussion.

Lack of awareness of the work of NDBs: Impact investors and others in financial circles have little understanding of the work of NDBs. How can this be overcome?

Understanding of NDBs needs to be given and other financial institutions need to be aware of the capacity of NDBs. There is a need to know all other Stakeholders and the issues they are dealing with.

NDBs have challenges with foreign Exchange risks (currency mismatches) as they borrow in foreign currency and lend in local currency. How is convergence addressing the FX risk as hedging instruments have been expensive? How do NDBs deal with?

Many of the blended finance hedging are executed at funding level by local counter parties or banks. SWAPs are usually expensive and available only at fund level. If the quantum is a lot and with jurisdiction not long enough, we go for JCX. It is expensive b/c of illiquidity of that particular Swap.

Tapping domestic sources of finance is one of the best options. NDBs can do issuing local currency bonds like that of regional development banks. In Rwanda for example, IFC is raising local currency to finance private sector through issuing local currency bonds.

This helps to address the currency mismatches. This something doable. Taping the domestic market is critical. NDBs have to start creating more awareness and engaging their leadership to support such important ideas.

4. THEMATIC PRESENTATIONS ON SYNTHESIZING THE EXPERIENCES & LESSONS OF SELECTED NDBS PARTICIPATING IN THE SDGC/A NDB INITIATIVE, & WAYS TO SCALE UP TO OTHER NDBS

Summary of Presentation by Natalia-HEDERA-Impact Toolkit

Social impact investors are investing at SDGs. The question in implementing SDGs is not a problem of finance but introducing standard measure to understand the risk by enhancing transparency that will help to attract socially motivated investors.

The impact assessment should be based on what has happened at house hold level which is very expensive to track. We have to rethink how we do the impact assessment and start to use digital solution that helps investors, financial institutions and beneficiaries to prove and report what has really happened at house hold level due to the investment.

HEDERA has come up with impact toolkit which is a technology solution which has tools to capture data on what has happened in the field and produce the impact report digitally which reduces the cost. The impact assessment tools are for SDG3 (Health), SDG4 (Education), SDG5 (Gender Quality), SDG6 (Clean Water), SDG7 (Energy) & SDG8 (Decent Work).

Summary of presentation by UDB and BRD

Summary of Presentation by Joshua Mwesiga, Director of Strategy, Uganda Development Bank

Summary of Presentation by UDB	
<p>UDB Overall Performance: Performance (financial performance and impact of UDB has been increasing from Year to year starting from 2017 onwards. Fitch Rating B+ and AADFI A+</p>	
<p>UDB Partnership with SDGC/A Objectives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Long-term collaboration: Development/adaptation of best practices, knowledge and policies • Enhance UDB institutional capacity: identify, analyze, finance SDG-related projects 	
Activity	Outcomes
<p>Needs Assessment</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • On-site institutional assessment • Interviews with key UDB stakeholders • Review of UDB's 2018-22 Strategic Plan • End-to-end review of the UDB policy framework 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Varied inputs into organizational strategy – alignment to SDG's • Inputs into UDB policy framework • Improved institutional awareness (alignment to SDG's)
<p>Project Appraisal Approach:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review of UDB credit policy, project appraisal and related process map • Review of related documentation incl. due diligence checklists, appraisal report, et al 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project Appraisal Manual – now integrated within UDB process <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Project alignment to NDP II & SDGs – M & E framework to scope impact • Financial Analysis guidelines • Project appraisal report template

<p>Regulatory</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review of regulatory frameworks for DFIs – incl. rationale, challenges, regulatory options, et al 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposed regulatory and supervisory framework submitted to the Bank of Uganda (BoU) BoU has undertaken other related activities (incl. research and benchmarking activities) to inform a comprehensive DFI regulation Draft regulatory framework under consideration by line ministry
<p>Funding Strategy</p> <p>Review of UDB capitalization gap Vs</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> UDB growth aspirations; Other DFIs (capital Vs GDP); Funding mix (diversification); 	<p>Comprehensive Funding Strategy:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Diversification of funding sources Diversification of shareholding / equity stake Explore Debt options (incl. concessionary borrowing, blended finance, co-financing, capital markets, Green & SDG bonds)
<p>Reflections: A Healthy Partnership</p>	
<p>UDB better placed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> STRATEGY: (structure, policy, awareness) SDG- conscious APPRAISAL: Ability to identify, analyze, finance SDG-linked projects; thus catalyze SDG adoption/implementation FUNDING: Ability to explore/ source/attract funds to actualize UDB's SDG implementation mandate 	<p>UDB better placed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> M & E and REPORTING: Ability to scope, measure and report the impact generated LINKAGES & COLLABORATION: Ability to identify with related-actors in the SDG implementation REGULATION (when adopted): will see improved efficiency, governance & institutional opportunities

Summary of Presentation by Eric Rutabana, CEO, Rwanda Development Bank (BRD)

Summary of Presentation by BRD

BRD Role: Provides equity, debt and mezzanine instruments as well as technical assistance to investees across key sectors of the economy. Over 90% of lending is long-term (more than 5 years) representing a bet on the future of Rwanda.

Business Model- BRD Positioning to contribute to development Impact:

SDG CENTER & DEVELOPMENT BANK OF RWANDA PARTNERSHIP

Objectives of the Partnership:

- Facilitate a long-term collaboration between the BRD and the SDG Center based on similar and complementary interests and capacities, as well as willingness to work together on key matters related to sustainable development and the achievement of the SDGs in Rwanda.
- Strengthen the development, adaptation and delivery of the best practices, knowledge, technologies and policies to improve attainment of the SDGs in Rwanda through enhancing the capacity of the BRD to identify, analyze, develop and finance SDGs-related projects within Rwanda

Activity	Outcome
<p>Institutional Assessment</p> <p>On-site and off-site institutional assessment covering the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Governance, Strategy, Operations, Financial Health including Capitalization, Credit and investment processes, Fund mobilization, Risk Management, Human Resource Management, Monitoring & Reporting.. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The review also coincided with our Mid-term strategy review which allowed the opportunity to incorporate and align SDG's to our strategy and our National Strategy for Transformation – NST1. • Institutional assessment report with recommendations which provided inputs into UDB policy framework.

Activity	Outcome
Review of Credit Process & Development of Project Appraisal Manual Approach <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review of UDB credit policy, project appraisal and related process map Review of related documentation incl. due diligence checklists, appraisal report, et al 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Project Appraisal Manual Financial Analysis guidelines Project appraisal report template Project alignment to NST I & SDGs Revamp credit and investment processes to create efficiencies and accountability.
Develop Fund Mobilization Strategy & Approaches Proposed key funding mobilization strategies and approaches	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Design Fund Mobilisation strategies and approaches through creating attractive investment stories.
Develop M & E Plan & Framework	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Comprehensive M & E framework with templates and indicators. Developed of an M&E Plan and Framework.
Regulatory <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review of regulatory frameworks for DFIs – incl. rationale, challenges, regulatory options, et al 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposed regulatory framework BoU has undertaken other related activities (incl. research and benchmarking activities) to inform a comprehensive DFI regulation Draft regulatory framework under consideration by line ministry

Activity	Outcome
<p>Integrating SDGs into BRD's Strategic plan</p> <p>Reviewed Rwanda vision 2020, Rwanda National Strategy for Transformation 1 and BRD Strategic Plan and come up with practical recommendations on how to align the strategy, policy & operations, M & E practices and communication and visibility of the bank with SDGs.</p>	<p>Strategy Alignment</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • BRD strategy alignment with NTS1 and associated strategies • Prioritization of SDGs which have direct relationship with Investments of BRD. <p>Policy & Operations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Clear demonstration prioritization of financing investment projects that best contribute to achievement of SDGs. • Institutional strengthening in complying with best practices of social and environmental standards in financing investment projects. <p>Communication and Visibility</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Create awareness of SDGs internally and with key stakeholders. • Consider and reflect the same in the visibility strategy of the bank. <p>Monitoring & Evaluation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Developing programs, targets and indicators aligned to SDGs. • Regular monitoring and evaluation of the progress of implementation of programs and targets

3.7. CLOSING SESSION: KEY MESSAGES & WAYFORWARD

1.7.1. Closing Remarks by Dr. Belay Begashaw, Director General, SDGC/A

Dr. has thanked the participants and speakers for their active participation and expressed his satisfaction for the informative and productive discussion.

He emphasized that after having all this discussion, we should not lose focus on what we exactly want to do.

He pointed out that it is essential to revitalize 140 plus infrastructure in the continent as these institutions are extremely important institutions for contributing to sustainable development. Unfortunately we have not been able to use them the way supposed to be used.

Dr. Belay Begashaw in his remarks highlighted the following:

- We have to take action now and take this as a message. Some of the corrective measures should have been taken yesterday but keeping them for tomorrow is crying.
- We have to start to think green and sustainable development and hence we need to have the right mix of staff can use all this ideas as governing principles for appraising projects and programs.
- We need to look at our structures, have to be efficient and improve the regulatory framework that will work for this peculiar situation.
- We don't have any other policy infrastructure other than NDBs. We do not need to re-establish other institutions when these institutions are around and can be reformed to be fit for the job.
- There is no better place for PPP and blended finance than NDBs.
- He emphasized that this is something doable. We have started working on this with your support and policy makers who are keen to see this work.
- NDBs should be the real beneficiaries for IDA and ADA funding and not multilaterals DBs are the one who are the right and accessible infrastructures to implement pro-poor medium and long term projects for sustainable development.

Finally Dr. Belay underlined that every contribution made by participants and speakers will be captured and shared with relevant key stakeholders for action. The SDGC/A is interested to expand its outreach supporting as many countries as possible looking of more partnerships.

Closing Remarks by Mr. Kofi Adomakoh, Director, Project & Export Development Finance, African Export-Import Bank

Mr. Kofi Adomakoh in his closing remarks reflected that the NDBs are very important. There is a lot of energy in the room to go back and fix the problem.

Mr. Kofi Adomakoh also highlighted that there is a different school of thought that does not support the usefulness of NDBs and their role therefore should be abandoned.

But he emphasised the following:

- Africa is evolving and in a different stage of development which need a different home grown solutions.
- We need to develop our own solution and leapfrog to move the continent forward.
- We need the NDBs to contribute for the development of the continent.
- There is much work to do that cannot be met by continental development banks such as AfDB, TRB, Afrexim bank and others.

Mr. Kofi Adomakoh concluded his remarks saying *“let’s go out and push this agenda very strong so that in 10 years’ time we will see the result; let’s make Africa Great Again”*.

3.8. MAIN CONCLUSIONS & RECOMMENDATIONS

Key Areas of improvement for NDBs

- Improving governance structure and undue political influence on most of NDBs which contributed to low performance of the NDBs. This involves regulation of NDBs by independent regulatory body and following best practices in appointing independent board of directors.
- Alignment of strategy, policy and operations of NDBs with SDGs which requires additional training and capacity building.
- Involving NDBs during National development planning which should be considered by Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning in each respective country.
- Strengthen capitalization and address problem of funding structure-access to innovative sources of funding as elaborated in the table below.
- Enhancing the internal capacity of NDBs in appraising long term projects and making viable investment decisions. There are critical gaps in developing investment framework and pipeline that attract investment and transform the life of the people.
- Improve risk management practice.
- Harmonizing Regulation of NDBs in the continent as summarized in the table below.
- Improve impact monitoring which requires tools and capacity building.

Main Conclusions and Recommendations-Innovative Sources of Financing for NDBs

- **Linkages between NDBs and engagement with regional Development Banks:** NDBs in the medium term should focus working with continental regional development banks (e.g. AfDB, TDB, Afrexim bank etc.) to access funding thorough on-lending mechanism. However they should also work in the medium and long term to strengthen themselves and improve credit rating to access finance from the international capital market directly which will help them to finance development projects with affordable cost.
- **Importance of Credit Ratings** → NDBs can have access to international capital market if only they improve their performance and get good credit ratings. This is in spite of the challenges that the ratings are linked to national sovereign rating and Macro-economic stability.

- **Currency Exchange Risks:** In the international development circle there is a huge discussion on growing consumer of Africa. The discussion of growing saver as saving pools increase in size from pension funds, insurance and other financial institutions is attracting attention. There is a question that NDBs should first tap such domestic before going to the international capital market which helps to address currency mismatches. NDBs should consider raising money domestically by for example issuing bonds in local currency.
- **Strategy & Governance:** Raising capital depends on organizational leadership and investment. Raising capital is not independent of how the institution itself is run and where the money goes to. The way the NDBs are run is very much connected with success of NDBs in raising capital.
- **Opening Ownership:** The benefits of opening up ownership of NDBs to other socially motivated owners such as pension funds, other DFIs, private investors helps to improve its governance structure by attracting highly rated shareholders, facilitates to have a kind of blended finance investments and ease capital constraints. However the extent of attracting private equity to NDBs should be carefully considered as the proportion of the private equity injection increases beyond a certain level, there is a tendency that NDBs will be more forced to refrain from financing long term investments and there will be mission drift.
- **Access to IDA & ADA Fund:** As NDBs are the only local development financial institutions which know the domestic market and are implementing pro-poor projects; they are the right place for IDA and ADA funds and better house for blended fiancé.
- **Mandates of NDBs:** NDBs should work with clear mandates and should not be interference and crowding out of the business of commercial banks.

- **Justification for Regulating NDBs:** The justification for regulating NDBs may not be the traditional reason of deposit protection and contribution to systemic risk. The rationale behind regulating NDBs should be:
 - Check and balance on the Mandate: Someone should be there to see whether the institution is meeting its mission or not.
 - Overseeing the utilization of public funds
 - Risk Management: To oversee how NDBs are managing different types of risks. There is always a challenge on remarketing a clear line on sustainability and risk taking in NDBs. There should be a reasonable risk management framework so that the NDBs will not be ending up being a commercial bank.
 - Sustainability
 - Governance- to check the governance system and ensure NDBs are operating as independent institutions from political interference.
 - Regulated NDBs have better credibility to raise funds as it provides assurance for good corporate governance.
- **Proportional Regulation:** Proportional regulation should be followed in regulating NDBs by understanding the risks they face. The special risks they face should be understood and political risks have to be buffered. NDBs should not be regulated the same way as commercial banks as the nature of business they do and risk profile of the two institutions is different.
- **Who Should Regulate NDBs & Independence of NDBs:** Regulation should be performed by an independent institution and not by owner like ministry of finance. Regulatory thresholds and mechanisms should be put in place by the regulator to institutionalize independent board of directors at NDBs and such process should follow best practices including undergoing fit and proper test by the central bank or other independent regulator.
- **Permissible activities:** The critical problem for NDBs is funding mobilization b/c of the lack of well-developed capital market. NDBs should not be allowed to mobilize short term deposits as it creates mismatch of assets and liability. NDBs should be allowed to mobilize deposits from institutional investors through time deposits or issuing bonds

- **Areas that may need separate regulation:** This include initial minimum and on-going capital adequacy requirements which should be stronger due to the nature of the business; liquidity requirements due to peculiar characteristics of the funding structure; loan classification & provisioning as NDBs are involved in long term lending. In case of requiring stronger capital adequacy requirements, pegging capital to GDP can be a very relevant mechanism.
- **Is BASEL III appropriate framework for NDBs:** There are good aspects making it applicable to NDBs. The issue of proportionality should be considered. The BASEL framework needs to be customized with the nature and risk profile of NDBs.
- **Harmonization of regulation:** There are divergent practices in regulating NDBs across Africa which may hamper their performance. There is a need to work with NDBs, Association of African DFIs (AADFIs), Association of Africa Central Bankers (AACBs) to harmonies following best practices. In this regard SDGC/A should play a role to initiate and facilitate such discussions.



Group photo: Speakers and panelists of the pre-conference session on: "Revitalizing National Development Banks for Sustainable Development" on 12th June 2019

5. ENHANCING NATIONAL M&R SYSTEMS AND CAPACITIES FOR SDG MONITORING & REPORTING”

5.1. BACKGROUND

Most data gathering systems in Africa still use traditional paper methods for data collection and rudimentary data processes that are inefficient and costly. As a result, government data are usually out of date by the time they are released, making it difficult for policy makers and other stakeholders to adequately plan and allocate necessary resources to achieve development targets.

The success of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and the 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) contained therein highly depends on efficient and robust monitoring of its progress. Hence, African nations must have in place quality, accessible, timely and reliable disaggregated data, in order to measure progress and ensure accountability to achieve the SDGs by 2030.

The 2030 Agenda explicitly calls for building capacity to support national plans to implement the SDGs. A sound Monitoring and Reporting (M&R) system will ensure that SDG achievement remains on track and will also allow

governments to improve their management and governance processes by reviewing the design, implementation and results of ongoing SDG-related policies.

In addition, robust, improved M&R systems will augment accountability by publicly measuring policy impact and reach and allowing decision makers to modify policies and allocate resources according to the lessons learnt and based on good evidence. Investing in the improvement of statistical systems contributes to better informed policies, faster response times to pressing issues, increased civic engagement, and of course, markedly improved transparency and accountability.

With this understanding, the SDGC/A has launched the “Monitoring and Reporting on the SDGs Project,” through which it is supporting, assisting and working with African partner governments to build and strengthen their capacity on data and national statistical systems for reporting on the SDGs.

The SDG M&R Project involves assisting countries to develop robust M&R systems, fully owned at the national level, that then allows governments to identify priorities for action, understand key implementation challenges, and identify the gaps that must be closed in order to achieve the SDGs by 2030. In addition, the M&R tools being developed by SDGC/A for use by countries will also assist with collecting and reporting on data for Agenda 2063 adopted by the African Union member states. In addition, in partnership with the Sustainable Development Solutions Network (SDSN), in 2018 the SDGC/A developed and published for the first time the 2018 Africa SDG Index and Dashboard, a measurement of progress on the SDGs tailored specifically to African countries.

The Africa SDG Index and Dashboard supports national governments in tracking progress and setting their own development priorities. However, important gaps remain related to improvement of national statistical systems for better informing policies, creating faster response times to handling issues, increasing civic engagement and improving transparency and accountability. The SDGC/A's work on the SDG M&R Project is meant to support national governments in and statistical institutes in filling these critical gaps and contributing improved and more data for the Africa SDG Index and Dashboard, amongst other reporting tools being employed. The 2019 Africa SDG Index and Dashboard will be launched at the main Conference on 14th June 2019.

5.2. OBJECTIVES OF THE SESSION

Participants from National Institutes of Statistics and Ministries of Planning, and other producers and users of data from amongst UN agencies, private research institutions, civil society and other institutions, are invited to attend this pre-conference session on 12th June 2019 with the theme: *Enhancing National M&R Systems and Capacities for SDG Monitoring & Reporting*.

The overall objectives of this pre-conference session will be to discuss the current statistical capacity, challenges, and gaps of national governments and the purpose and role of the SDGC/A's SDG M&R Project with a view towards:

- Improving harmonization of development data by ensuring that the production and usage of data is reliable, comparable and timely across African nations and, with respect to a production target, aiming for at least 80% of SDG indicators to be produced at a national-level;
- Enhancing an understanding of the remaining SDG data gaps and how they can be resolved for strengthening the capacity for SDG monitoring and reporting.
- Strengthening coordination and SDG results dissemination and analysis for policy formulation among all stakeholders. Session participants will also have the opportunity to learn about the SDGC/A's SDG M&R Project and, further, to discuss the Africa SDG Index and Dashboard as a tool, with a view to understanding data gaps and improving the data collection and reporting processes for developing the Index and Dashboard.

5.3. WELCOME REMARKS

Dr. Belay Begashaw, Director General, The SDGC/A

Key highlights:

1. **Emphasis on data gaps-no update of data in many African countries**
 - It has a negative impact on SDGs monitoring
 - 3 years since adoption, but off target
 - Lack of evidence-based planning due to data gaps
 - Only 40% of indicators have available data
 - No data for poverty, health, nutrition, education, infrastructure
 - Data gaps are key constraints to SDG implementation
2. **National reporting insufficient**
 - 97 indicators on SDGs and AU2063
 - 232 indicators in 2030 agenda
3. **M&R platform: launched by SDGCA in response**
 - Aim: in 3 years' time, 80% of data is reported through the system
 - Raise stature of SDG index
 - 2 interfaces: one that feeds in information to the national level, then another that feeds from national to international level
4. **Aim to build a monitoring system. Cannot wait for evaluations. You learn too late that things did not work, and too late to do anything about it.**

5.4. KEY NOTES ADDRESS

Hon. Dr. Nabil Mohammed, Minister of Higher Education and Research,
Republic of Djibouti

Key highlights:

1. 2013: Africa-driven vision - “the Africa we want”
 - How the African continent should look over 50 years
2. 2030 agenda: economic development, social inclusion, environmental sustainability
 - Progress in Southern-African countries
3. After 3 years, African countries still face capacity challenges in M&R in both SDGs and AU2063
 - Institutional, statistical, and financial constraints
 - Deficit financing is the most significant constraint
 - Approx. every 10 SDG indicators cannot be tracked in Africa due to data limitations
 - \$1 billion USD per year needed to establish robust statistical systems capable of monitoring the SDGs
 - Better data leads to better policy, accountability, response, effectiveness
 - Real-time data is crucial
 - Overarching objective: discuss statistical capacity challenges, with a view to improvement
 - Enhancing and understanding SDG data gaps and how they can be resolved by strengthening
 - Strengthening coordination, analysis among all stakeholders
4. Three critical considerations
 - a. Institution- harmonizing the monitoring process & Inclusiveness- involving all the stakeholders
 - How we can establish an institutionalization of a monitoring process in each country to have national report for each country, helping government assess progress and develop responses. M&R must be inclusive: state, civil society, other stakeholders to improve quality of reporting

- b. Strengthening capacity and partnership, coordination
 - Act locally, with communities to enhance cooperation
 - Bring together public and private stakeholders to develop national strategies for national development, mobilize resources,
 - Global partnership for sustainable development data
- c. Dissemination: take advantage of digital and data revolution
 - More opportunities to collect, produce high-quality data on the right things at the right time in ways that are accessible to everyone

5. Concluded by emphasizing the need to work together

- We all need to work together to achieve agendas, participate in discussions, share experiences
- We have people, universities, laboratories that are invested in SDGs

5.5. SESSION OUTPUTS

Through these pre-conference session participants learnt the following;

- The current state of Africa's statistical capacity for monitoring and reporting on the SDGs;
- The features and functions of the SDGC/A's SDG M&R Project and related M&R systems and tools developed by SDGC/A, including use of the Africa SDG Index and Dashboard;
- Usage of SDG data by government institutions for policy formulation and adoption; and
- SDG data gaps in Africa for effective planning and implementation
- With this knowledge some participants agreed to take part in the coordinated and concrete steps to implement improved M&R systems in their home countries within a 3-5 year time frame, including reaching a shared objective of achieving production of at least 80% of the SDG indicators within countries. These countries are Malawi and Seychelles.

SESSION 1: UNDERSTANDING OF DATA GAP

Presenter: Ms. Abigail Simkoko Chisesa

During this session, SDG data gaps were discussed and how they can be resolved for strengthening the capacity for SDG monitoring and reporting. The SDGC/A provided an overview of the SDG data gaps according to experience from the 2018 & 2019 Africa SDG Index & Dashboard. This was followed by discussions during which participants explored further the data gaps, challenges and best practices to fill the gaps. The presentation included causes, quality, data building blocks in Africa, statistical capacity score, data commitment, data gaps and challenges.

Background

- Data gaps are voids in our knowledge of the world and the people who live in it

Causes:

- Differences of methodologies: hard to harmonize data from different institutions
- Lack of coordination across national statistics systems
- Some indicators are harder to measure than others

Quality:

- Surveys at intervals of 5 years, so we rely on projections that make it hard to know what is happening on the ground
- Estimates may be biased

Data blocks:

- Vital statistics: particularly poor data on death registration and birth registration
- Economic statistics: old censuses
- Health education and safety: UN office on Drugs and Crime homicide statistics
- Land and environment: aerial and remote sensing of forests

Statistical capacity score: 60 for Africa, compared to 75 for Europe and Central Asia

Data commitment: 101 indicators with standard methodology, 84 indicators with standard methodology but not collected, 41 indicators without standardized methodology, 6 have multiple tiers

Data gaps

- No updated data for most indicators
- Many indicators still measured with MDG era data

Challenges:

- Lack of resources and funding, too many indicators, lack of statistical capacity, hard to harmonize national data with global indicators
- SDGCA efforts: Index, M&R system, statistical capacity, implementation efforts

Need:

- Reliable, efficient, quality, time-bound data
- Disaggregation: between groups of people, gender, geography

Mr. Mesfin Tessema Ashagrie, Director of Strategy, Policy Planning, Monitoring, Evaluation, Resource Mobilization, African Union Commission presented remarks on the presentation in the following areas;

- a. M&R challenges in the SDGs equally affect Agenda 2063
 - Progress can only be revealed by data collection, processing and dissemination
- b. Presence of similarity between agenda 2030 and agenda 2063
 - Both agendas have common priorities for Africa's transformation
 - 85% convergent at goal level, 70% at indicator level
 - No reporting two times for two agendas
- c. The framework to synchronize the M&R for the two agendas
 - Differences in statistical methodologies and tools: costly to harmonize for the two agendas. We need to harmonize statistical systems in member states
- d. The challenges: difference in the application of technology, and lengthy & costly process
- e. Inadequacy of statistical capacity
 - 37% of countries have declining statistical capacity, 19% moderate, 40% improving

QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS FROM PARTICIPANTS



Question: From the perspective of the Paris Agreement, it is critical not to have indicators for climate change. The Paris Agreement is the biggest indicator of climate action. We also have information of people affected by climatological disasters. What can be done to engage institutions in Africa that are working or involved in the M&R process?

Answer: Data collection of official indicators needs to be led by governments and NSOs, so that they are custodians of data and responsible for follow up

Question: What is the source of money for capacity building in data collection and related tasks?

Answer: The issue is not money, the issue is how to source it, how to tap into sources.

Question: Regarding data gap for the pre-SDGs era: What can be done in between, if we are not working with data that are recent enough?

Answer 1: For many indicators, the source is the MDG end-line survey conducted in 2015. There is a need for annual data to close data gaps.

Answer 2: You can keep reporting last information, or try to come up with models that can give you information in between. What we aim for is for administrative systems to get information in between. The data revolution is important.

Question: Data gaps: There are 41 tiers, 3 indicators. 17 of these are gender-related. Only 10 out of 41 are tracked due to data gaps-how this can be a concern of UN Women?

Answer: Data gap watch is a source of information for gender data. M&R systems will let agencies report data on yearly basis. We need methodology before tracking tier III indicators. We have seen no plans for creating methodologies and making them available in near future. Nothing standardized no plans. Political will is needed.

Question: In Africa, we collect data but without using modern and adequate technology. We don't have a regional coordination system of data collection. How can we put in place such system (regional coordination) to address this issue?

Answer: When Agenda 2063 was adopted, domestication missions were implemented through consultations with experts, planners, officials, and different sectors in the society. we cannot simply leave the responsibility to governments. We all have responsibilities to engage with different groups, challenge government

SESSION 2: STRENGTHENING NATIONAL STATISTICAL CAPACITY

Presenter: Ms. Olive Dushime, Erick Dagbenonbakin, Massoundi Miradji

Following the discussions on the data gaps, this second session focused on the theme of national statistical capacity to properly track and report on prioritized development goals through transfer of tools and knowledge, training and enhancing human capital, and backstopping. Presenters discussed why there is a need, and how, to update and standardize M&R systems in Africa. Participants learnt more about the SDG M&R System functionalities, capacity building efforts and methods of utilization of the tool. After each presentation there was a brief discussion and Q&A.

The presentation focused on rationale, the center's solution to some of the data gaps i.e the M&R System and how to avoid dormancy of the system.

Motivation

- Strengthen, centralize national system in countries
- Ensure availability of timely, reliable, comparable, disaggregated data, 80% of which is produced nationally within 3 years
- Ownership of production and usage of data

Solution - National MRS

- Incorporate 2030 agenda, Agenda 2063, others
- Cloud-based system and repository
- Centralized system fed by sub-unit data
- Different modules: pivot tables, charts, visualizations, etc.
- Accessibility - data locked on server, accessed with authorization from
- Security - need credentials (customizable)
- Data functionality - capacity to exchange data with other systems, easily synchronized
- Capacity of interpreting different formats
- Dashboards - charts, graphs, scorecards, others
- Communication - users can communicate with each other
- Disaggregation: by location and by sex

How to avoid dormancy of system?

- Engage in continuous follow-up with countries
- Mobilize countries to provide data to international MRS
- Conduct assessment on who is using it
- Conduct refresher workshops to country teams
- Provide backstopping and troubleshooting

Presentation - Mr. Erick Damase Dagbenonbakin, Director of SDG assessment in Benin

- Responsible to report to the national planning ministry the progress of SDG implementation
- Retained 49 indicators as priorities
- Domestication of indicators: baseline of 2014-2015
- Almost 50% of indicators are incalculable
- Different indicators tracked by different ministries: INSAE responsible for 57
- Cycle of surveys ranging 3 to 5 years
- Challenges:
 - Obtaining resources to increase frequency of surveys
 - Mobilizing financiers of the surveys
- Looking at plans of ministries to assess compatibility with SDGs:
 - Nature of activity
 - Associated SDG indicators
 - Localization of activity in SDG framework
- Database of indicators:
 - Perspectives: tools
 - Task force to collaborate with institute to improve the harmonization of indicators
- Need to reinforce statistical capacity

COMOROS - Presentation

- 4 islands, one under French administration
- Fragile economy with structural deficiencies, uncompetitive productive sector
- SSN: 3 levels
 - National Statistic council, INSEED, Statistical services
 - Not working well due to lack of coordination between producers, users, of data

Incorporating SDGs

- 43 indicators are relative for implementation
- 19 for SDG 17
- Now it is necessary to choose strategies to follow indicators
- 3 levels of indicators according to priority
- 57 indicators being produced, 60 indicators that can be produced, 51 indicators that can't be produced in the current state of the national statistical system

The following questions and comments were provided:

Question: How to fill data gap in the system? The system is for the indicators that are available but what about those that are not available?

Answer: System has capacity to be customized according to level of resources in country. There is citizen data, administration. Data is in different areas, the system can fulfill the role of centralizing data. Specialized institutions can contribute to the overall system. We want to see how countries can coordinate in developing the M&R system. We observe diversity among countries in the institutional mechanism of the M&R system. There is a need for a coordination mechanism. There is a need for a proper /standard/ module for data collection. System can also be developed at provincial, regional levels

Question: How are we engaging the African Union? How are we speaking to different frameworks?

Answer: We have an MOU with AU to track and report both agendas.

SESSION 3: STRENGTHENING THE PAN-AFRICAN M&R SYSTEMS FOR HARMONIZED DATA

Presenter: Ms. Lina Henao, SDGs Advisor, The SDGC/A

In this thematic session two presentations were done, the first focused on the Pan-African system and data portal being developed by The SDGC/A as a centralized SDG database and reporting platform, and the second on the Africa SDG Index and Dashboard.

The Pan-African system, and the Africa SDG Index and Dashboard, are key ways to improve coordination for publicly sharing and communicating SDG indicators amongst countries and other stakeholders. Discussion focused on the need for harmonized data in Africa to compare progress towards the SDGs and identify gaps, as well as to better influence the allocation of resources and foster performance-based financing. The 2019 Africa SDG Index results and discussed the need for the country-level SDG Index Data.

There are limited budgets among African institutions to collect data., they have needs, and sometimes they should collect certain data, our data is collected by institutions. And within that the data should be recorded. So once the data is hosted by the origins, and the idea is to have as many countries as possible, they're rolling into the system.

The users can actually use the system and what are they teach and take and make their decisions, because this is something that is also the key of decision-making program, it can cause us issues based on areas like what is it what are the numbers. Hence, with this system in place, we also want like all these data that is scattered in the countries that are related by the elder level created by the Ministry of Education to be centralized, and innovate. So, the report you have more effective way to improve his productivity.

So, after the data and the conference of this revision, of course, enroll into the season, we ambition, the countries to share the data to have efficacy. Thus, this pan African system will be hosted by the center but then sorted centralized data in a continental way we are.

There isn't any permission to clean data to modify data to erase data because the countries as the country send the data to us and that is the data that we will have in the system. SDGCA has quite an oppressive objective from 2019 to 2022 at least 80% of the countries have trained how to the system. Africa Agenda 2063 and SDGs are overlapping 80%.

Presentation remark by Mr. Stephen Rodrigues, Resident Representative, UNDP Rwanda



Allow me to also extend my congratulations to the SDG center for Africa, for organizing this conference at a very important time, I think it is indeed quite a good moment for us to collectively take stock of not only where we are, where we should be. And this session is wonderful was very informative sessions in terms of giving us a sense of exactly what's happening across the continent.

Having good chance to present myself a first system in the pan African system, but shared some of that with me before so I had a chance to look at it. I must say that a SDG dashboard, which she presented, does contain a wealth of information. And I do encourage you to take the time to go and look at the system play with it a bit. It is really quite powerful. It is comprehensive; it has a lot of information.

I want to endorse the call for harmonization and collaboration between the UN and, the African Union. One of the benefits of a system like this where you receive comparisons. Of course, it draws all kinds of criticisms and comments when you see countries in comparison.

But I think the hope is that by seeing those comparisons will stimulate a race to the top, where countries are competing to outperform, actually, even the SDGs is achieving more greens.

UN Statistics Division last year against the last six countries looking at the data gaps in these countries. But what they found was that the data was readily available for 23% of the surface 20% of the indicators, and another 23% was considered feasible. But roughly 57%, we did not have the data or the statistical systems to capture.

We have an issue of collecting data. Some of it is expensive, some of which is not aligned to the global framework. And of course, there's also the issue of managing that data, data sets that need to be checked to be cleaned up to be prepared and analyzed, etc. And this is often a very labor-intensive process. That requires a lot of training the personnel.

Let's take the message that we are not on track in terms of improving the lives of people and the planet. Let's take note of the challenges that exists in terms of the data management and data gathering process. But it's harmonizing those efforts across institutions. Let's see if we can generate more partnerships, the UN, the center, or the bilateral development agencies to support countries or systems to have big jobs. But let's also look at the new sources of data and big data of opportunities that exist today. you can put together the photo, such as we're seeing here in Rwanda, and the consistent investment in infrastructure and capacity creation that is needed to build strong SDG monitoring systems.

QUESTIONS AND REMARKS

Question: You have said that there is unavailability data, how do you get data for dashboard?

Response: Where the data is coming from, and the data comes from institutional international organizations such UN, World bank, NGOs; and national statistics institutions as well. These data that has been harmonized to the pan African system.

Session 4: Strengthening Coordination and SDG Results Dissemination

During this final thematic session of the day, participants discussed how they could strengthen coordination mechanisms for data monitoring and reporting that includes, among other things, the pipeline process of data collection up to data reporting with the outcome of analysis for policy formulation and decision-making. Use of the Africa SDG Index & Dashboard.

Best Practices on Data Production and Usage Frameworks by Ms. Laura Ah-time, Chief Executive Officer, National Statistics Bureau, Seychelles and Mrs. Mercy Kanyuka, Commissioner of Statistics, National Statistics Office, Malawi

- They both mentioned that there is data need or policy making, they established a baseline information, and then monitored the way forward, and assessed whether they were making progress or regressing.
- For both countries data is very important. Without data, they cannot monitor and evaluate any of their processes.
- All the goals are important when we're looking at the SDGs is like three main pillars, the economic, the social, the environmental that work together. So, they took it in that context, that they cannot just be just saying something about education without mentioning health, environment and poverty eradication.
- They use memorandum of understanding with a lot of the agencies to facilitate data exchange, so that they know what it is that they need. They also have to guide them in terms of advocating the use of classifications and existing methodologies for data collection.



Group photo: Speakers and Panelists of the Enhancing National M&R Systems and Capacities for SDGs Monitoring & Reporting

5.6. CLOSING REMARKS

Director General, The SDGC/A

Dr. Begashaw said that the way things are structured is 15 times 365 days. So, anything that doesn't allow podcasting is 15 times 365 days, because every single day we have to deliver. Consequently, if you don't deliver the last race, then the next race you deliver for the next race. Also, the carryover from philosophies is complicated, so the longer we stay without performing, the more the application will be.

And then we're surrendering, that won't work. Therefore, we don't want that to happen. Again, this is your opportunity to work together and make it. And this is a brain and the mindset that actually is capable of being we're about to experience a lot to come and help us because we're capable of making it.

Deputy Director General (DDG), National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda

Mr. Ivan Murenzi highlighted that there is a need to reassess national stethoscope systems and focus on the minimum they are trying to do to respond the needed keys. In terms of mobilizing resources, which is what matters at this point, it is needed to mobilize resources to build a system that is not only for national reporting but also for international reporting.

Another take home from the conference is that we need to work together to fix the systems and strategies. Rwanda is currently reporting 73 indicators out of 150 indicators in our national reporting. We need high expertise to be built up to require money. So, capacity building in Rwanda National statistical institute the budget is going to double in terms of us being able to achieve this large scale of what may be the same for other countries.

6. FINANCING HEALTH, EDUCATION AND GREEN WATER IN AFRICA

6.1. BACKGROUND

It is without argument that achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) will require filling a large financing gap. According to UNCTAD's World Investment Report 2014¹, it is estimated that the annual investment gap in major SDG sectors in developing countries alone is approximately \$2.5 trillion.

The additional financing gap is even larger for low income countries – estimated to be in excess of 14% of GDP or requiring additional annual outlays of \$520 billion, according to an IMF 2018 report. However, approximately 20% of African nations have domestic revenue of less than 15% of GDP.

Africa is at cross roads: on one side there is narrowing fiscal space due to growing public debt (e.g., 4 out of 10 African countries are at high risk of becoming or are debt stress); on the other side, there is an ambitious development agenda agreed to be achieved in only 12 years.

Although net official development assistance (ODA) to Africa has been increasing, the annual growth rate has slowed compared to historical average and it is considered a more and more unreliable source. Foreign direct investment (FDI) also has dwindled over recent years. While more than a third of the required financing for the SDGs is expected to come from the private sector, private sector financing for development in Africa remains low at only approximately 4-8% of total funding. Other funding modalities also remain small, whether from south to south cooperation, triangular cooperation or National Development Bank.

Resources for the SDGs must come from a variety of sources, not just the traditional ODA avenues, but from increased and more effective mobilization of domestic resources, eliminated and recaptured illicit financial flows (e.g., from tax evasion, corruption, smuggling), better and more creative engagement with the private sector and philanthropic institutions and other innovative financing mechanisms (such as from climate financing).

Through the Addis Ababa Action Agenda of the Third International Conference on Financing for Development (13-16 July 2015), Heads of State and Government High Representatives affirmed their strong political commitment to address the challenge of financing and creating an enabling environment at all levels for sustainable development in the spirit of global partnership and solidarity.

There is an urgent need for financing the SDGs in Africa. Africa remains low in human development, characterized by a lack of demographic transition. Social inclusion is constrained in part by the rapid population growth, which outpaces most incremental progress being made on the SDGs. Poverty concentration remains high and inequality in Africa ranks amongst the highest in the world.

Nearly 1 in 3 Africans are at risk of food insecurity. Very low education and health indicators predominate, and this then manifests late in low productivity. An African child born today will be less than half as productive at 18 years as a child who has received full education and health life.

The pace of achieving social inclusion goals is off target and unlikely to be met by 2030. Consider just the following:

- Education systems in Africa lag substantially behind from all other regions in the world and no African country has achieved universal primary education: 63.3 million primary age children are out of school; 34.1 million (54%) live in sub-Saharan Africa; 56% are girls. Likewise, for both lower secondary and upper secondary school, enrollment rates in Africa are the lowest in the world at 50% and 32%, respectively.

Per capita spending on primary and secondary education approximately \$242 and \$613, respectively in 2015 remains significantly lower than what is required for African countries to reach the SDG 4 (**Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all**).

- Health indicators in Africa are also low compared to other regions of the world, and as with education, there is a large financing gap needed to be filled in order for SDG 3 (Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages). The under-five and neonatal mortality rate in Africa in 2016 was approximately 8 and 5 times, respectively, higher than that in Europe.

The maternal mortality rate (2015) in Africa, at 542 per 100,000 live

births, was approximately 34 times higher than in Europe. There are only 12.8 skilled health professionals per 10,000 people in Africa, compared to 115.3 per 10,000 in Europe. Africa suffers more than 24% of the global burden of disease but has access to only 3% of the world's health workers and less than 1% of the world's financial resources.

Per capita government expenditure for health in Africa in 2014 was on average USD \$51.60 compared to USD \$1,828.10 in Europe. Further, of the financing allocated to health, only a small percentage of Development Assistance for Health (approximately 11% on average) is allocated to health systems strengthening which is essential in Africa in order to improve basic health services, accountability and governance.

- In sub-Saharan Africa, 95% of agriculture production depends on rain-fed subsistence farming that is affected by unpredictable and erratic rainfall pattern. Rainfall remains unreliable and cannot guarantee enough food production for the population throughout the continent which is under persistent threat of hunger, and ensuring achievement of SDG 2 (End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture).

According to FAO, in 2017 about 30% (close to 375 million) of the total population of the continent faced severe food insecurity. Effective harvesting of green water through increased infiltration and storage is a proven and cost-effective way to improve output at the farm level, yet is not happening at scale across Africa. Scaling up green water and enhancing rain-fed agricultural solutions across Africa through increasing financial investments and political leadership is a necessity².

It is against this backdrop that The Sustainable Development Goals Center for Africa (SDGC/A) believes that there is no time for Africa to wait on financing from the international community. Instead, SDG-tailored investment vehicles must be put in place on the continent that will take into account the urgency, magnitude and complexity of challenges faced in Africa, as well as the opportunities to be seized here.

The objective of the Financing Health, Education and Green Water in Africa session is to bring together key decision makers in governments and in the financing and donor community, including the private sector, to discuss financing for education, health and green water for sustainable agriculture across Africa.

More specifically, the focus will be placed on financing for:

- Improving the quality of primary and secondary education for all children in Africa;
- Programs aimed at strengthening African health systems, with strong focuses on accountability and governance; and
- Increasing the productivity and resilience of smallholder farmers in the African dryland regions, mainly through scaling-up rainwater harvesting technologies.

These are three areas that the SDGC/A and its Board of Directors have identified as “game changing” and “key levers” for the rapid development necessary for SDG achievement in Africa, and most directly related to SDGs 2, 3 and 4.

Likewise, these topics have already been the subject of previous gatherings³ by the SDGC/A, with its partners, of large and diverse groups of stakeholders to improve knowledge, identify best practices, build the financing and business rationales and issue “calls to action” that will now be taken to the highest levels of leadership in the government and financing communities during this session. Prior to the session, participants will receive more detailed background concept notes on the Africa Primary and Secondary Education Fund, the Africa Health Fund and the Africa Green Water Fund.

These notes discuss the gaps in achievement of SDGs 2, 3, and 4, the rationale and business case for investing in these intervention areas, the costs and benefits, and the proposed funding mechanisms, among other things.

The pre-conference session which will occur on 13th June 2019 built on these concept notes to further inform financiers and decision-makers of the gaps to SDG achievement, rationales, financing needs and mechanisms by illustrating successful cases, investment costs and potential impact for increased investments in these specific sectors. A range of financing sources, financing facilities and coordination mechanisms will be proposed and discussed.

Amongst such mechanisms will be proposed funds dedicated to the initiatives. Such funds

- ♦ The africa primary and secondary education fund, the africa health fund and the green water fund
- ♦ Will be hosted in africa and will be conditional, incremental and target-performance based. It is expected that countries will commit to invest in the funds from their own budgets and take the necessary national reform measures, and that the international community would stand ready to offer increased finance, collaboration and coordination necessary to support them, including the mobilization of new resources from a wide range of sources. The structure, governance, source of funding, performance monitoring and other aspects of these funds will be part of detailed discussion occurring during these this pre-conference day.

6.2. OBJECTIVES OF THE SESSION

To share and have a common understanding with session participants on the rationale for and solutions proposed for the three intervention areas believed critical to SDG achievement in Africa:

- i. Implementation of cost-effective primary and secondary education strategies to boost access, quality and equality,
- ii. strengthening African countries' health systems and
- iii. upscale of enhanced rain-fed agriculture in Africa by means of rainwater harvesting, storage and effective utilization.

To address the financing requirements and funding mechanisms, including raising domestic financial efforts and engaging the private sector, for the proposed interventions related to improving primary and secondary education, strengthening health systems and scaling-up enhanced rain fed agriculture.

To inform and convince financiers and decision makers on the rationale of establishing the Africa Primary and Secondary Education Fund, the Africa Health Fund and the Green Water Fund.

6.3. KEYNOTE ADDRESS



HE. Chief Dr. Jewel C. Howard-Taylor, Vice President, Republic of Liberia delivering her key note speech

“Why Africa Needs New Financing Vehicles for Health, Education and Rain-fed Agriculture”

Key highlights of the address:

H.E Vice president started her key note speech by expressing her gratitude to His Excellency Paul Kagame; President of the Republic of Rwanda; Excellences; Honorable officials of the Rwandan government present; Special guests and panelists; Dr. Belay Begashaw, Director General, SDGs center for Africa; Mr. Hiroshi Kato, Sr. Vice president, Japan international cooperation agency ([JICA](#)); Distinguished ladies and gentlemen;

Excellences, Distinguished Ladies and Gentlemen; today's topic speaks to very critical matters affecting Africa's growth, development and prosperity as a continent. Since 2000 – Africa has made some progress but it is not enough. Many Nations lag behind in their commitment to working to achieve the MDG's and subsequently the SDG's.

As a result, across the Continent there is dire poverty, a sense of hopelessness, despair amongst the youth, huge levels of illiteracy and mortality due to poorly functioning health and education systems; and to make things worse, most African Nations are unable to feed their people. It is this prevailing situation and the urgent need to begin to do something about it, which brings us here.

Thankfully, the passion behind the drive of the SDG's is to see "the leave no one behind policy" become a reality with full-fledged results materializing in the quality of lives of people not just in a few places; but across our Continent. What makes this program a life line and one of the best options for National Governance Systems, is that the SDGs emphasize not just the opportunities to lift people to a better standard of living, but it also provides opportunities for prosperity.

Sadly, at the current pace of development, African Nations remain at a high risk of being unable to realizing these aspirations. Especially when one considers that Africa is a youthful continent – with 40% of the population below the age of 15 years and approximately 33 million babies born every year.

Further still, Africa remains the only region without demographic transition and as a result limits social economic transformation on a greater scale. This scenario shows that population growth will continue to undermine Social economic progression as reflected in the stagnation of the SDG results.

The Vice president gave one glaring example that the poverty rate reduction over the past two decades has not translated to a reduction in the number of poor people on the continent. In order to change this trajectory, African leaders must consider which priorities to prioritize. The matrix contained in the SDG's, gives a laundry list of what is the optimum aspiration.

But it is clear, that in order to reach this optimum level, one must begin at areas most important first for survival. As a result, *"I hope you will consider the perspective of the African SDG program that the survival and prosperity of our people depend, firstly in agreeing that the basic needs which should form our priorities are Health, Education and Agriculture."*

Once this decision is taken, then we can begin considering ways to plan, finance and implement programs under these sectors which directly impact and improve the lives of our people. Though all SDGs matter - some have stronger synergies, better tradeoffs and higher correlation with other goals. These areas are most directly related to SDGs 2, 3 and 4 and are identified as “game changing” and “key levers” for the rapid development necessary for SDG achievement and African transformation.

Furthermore, H.E Vice President explained that the statistics from the Continent shows that there is an enduring trend of food insecurity paradox, with nearly 1 in 3 Africans are at risk of starvation. There is an increased vulnerability to the climatic and weather conditions, which were not previously a regular part of the African weather pattern, but is now becoming a regular phenomenon, such as El Niño related droughts.

To make things worse, agriculture production in Africa is centered on exports for foreign consumption and not food security which predominantly depends on rain-fed subsistence farming that is affected by unreliable, unpredictable and erratic rainfall patterns; thus leaving the continent under a persistent threat of hunger, thus making it difficult to achieve SDG priority 2 which is to (End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture).

Similarly in the Health and Education sectors there are very low scores, which automatically manifests into low life productivity and low life expectancy. This reflects a very disturbing paradox which if not arrested, will make the next several generations of Africans unable to survive or be adequately prepared to deal with the challenges they will face.

This paradox is that most African countries boast of more children being in school, the large numbers look great; but truthfully, a majority of those children unfortunately cannot read and write at expected levels because of the associated very poor quality of the educational system. So while African Nations boast of their enrolment numbers, the quality and completion rates have stagnated or continue a downward trend. The situation is even worse for the girl child – who risks ending up as sex workers, child brides or being denied opportunities to go to school because the parents are unable to afford same.

This negative trend also exists in the health sector, where we have high rates of HIV/AIDS, Maternal mortality, regular instances of Ebola and TB. There are also high rates of death from Malaria and other childhood diseases because most Africans do not seek health services because they simply cannot afford the point of service payments.

To further compound this dire situation, most African Nations faced with difficult Per capita spending choices currently show a constant decline in allocations for education, health and agriculture.

These facts show that Africa is off track on social inclusion goals, which make it unlikely that they will meet targeted goals by 2030. As we consider solutions for these issues, let us note that it is no longer a secret that the financing needed for sustainable development goals in Africa remain far below the expected amount necessary to meet 2030 targets.

In fact, Africa's current additional financial needs per annum are much lower than it receives collectively from both internal and external sources. There is therefore a financing gap too large to fill, if left to the continent but relatively small when compared to available global resources. If one looks at Official development flows to Africa, they have either grown marginally, remained stagnant and in some instances have drastically declined.

Resultantly, there is increased pressure on annual available allocations between funds for infrastructure development and much needed social development initiatives. Resulting in a steep decline in social sector spending and a reversal of the social inclusion progress.

The question then is - [How do we finance SDG tailored investment vehicles which will take into account the urgency, magnitude and complexity of the challenges being faced in Africa?](#)

Excellences, Distinguished Ladies and Gentlemen, as we ponder the how, it is critical to take a glance at the challenges in National Systems which must be overcome in order to have the space to create the new paradigms for both internal and external resources; some of which are :

[Securing the political will of national and local leaders for effective reform management and localized achievement of sustainable development goals:](#) In a report from the Independent Journal of Management (09/17), one of the writers (Kpundeh) opines that political will is a critical first starting point for sustainable and effective reform programmes, and that lack of political will is at the root of lack of transparency, accountability, good governance and leadership.

Ensuring administrative reforms: Governments can do little to concretize plans for achieving the SDGs without reforming public administration structures, processes, practices and values. A system with the right combination of reforms can then be used to plan, implement, evaluate and monitor progress.

Ensuring the inclusion of CSO's and watch dog agencies in the governance space: The inclusion of such agencies in this process is imperative, for these actors play crucial roles in society as agents of information dissemination, oversight, accountability, monitoring and evaluation, and in securing service delivery.

Encouraging the building of a strong democratic parliament: Parliamentarians are the true Representatives of the People and must always have the people's interest in sight. They have a constitutional and social responsibility to play a significant role in supporting and monitoring all programs that have direct benefits for their people, including the SDG program planning, financing and implementation.

Ensuring the adherence to the rule of law: A system underpinned by a robust commitment to upholding the rule of law can be used to advance equity and people-centered development; whether in reducing inequalities or fostering social justice and inclusion for peace.

Ensuring public awareness and involvement: Any Government that wishes to succeed must carry its people along. Numerous Data show that developing awareness-raising activities is a crucial step towards achieving the SDG's. National associations should be given the space to work hand in hand with central governments in identifying awareness-raising national indicators so that citizens' knowledge, participation, acceptance and buy in of Governments plans and programs can be accepted, monitored and evaluated.

Elimination of the culture of corruption and mismanagement of scarce resources: Sadly, evidence from across Africa confirms that corruption is the engine to an anti-democratic environment, characterized by lack of trust, uncertainty, unpredictability, declining moral values and disrespect for constitutional institutions and authority.

Clearly there is no other way to consider the new paradigms needed to solve these critical issues unless we build the necessary governance platforms, which then forms the basis for the critical evaluation of how to implement the new paradigm shifts needed for the proper combination needed to finance and achieve the SDG's.

H.E. Vice President recommended two prong approach which harnesses both internal and external sources of funding as the best way to insure local commitment, obtain external assistance and set the basis for sustainability.

INTERNAL OPTIONS:

- **Restructure national budgets:** To reflect direct financing for sdg priorities; reduce recurrent expenditures and wasteful spending; and increase expenditure in relevant sector areas. Which will also create new funding for social protection measures that target disadvantaged groups ; and creates greater capacity to achieve sdg's benchmarks.
- **Strengthen revenue administration:** Through better enforcement and policy regimes (e.G. Revised tax regimes); creating avenues for increasing the revenue base thru ict opportunities which would provide incentives for new and off grid businesses to come online; creating avenues for investments in non- traditional business opportunities (ie. Agro-businesses, culture and tourism); putting in place creative and innovative ways for the industrialization and processing of natural resources, thus diversifying economies, creating wealth and building new tax bases.
- **Open up the governance space:** For the inclusion of innovative youth driven ideas and capacities, which create new cross cutting innovative solutions, programs and businesses, which provides inclusiveness and further increases the revenue base.
- **Support inclusive social growth initiatives:** For the creation of small businesses which provide job opportunities targeting the youth and other disadvantaged groups. And providing funds for support to social programs, industrial action plans, promotion of agriculture and rural development, skills and training initiatives and investing in housing and municipal services which are aimed at building prosperity, equity and broadening economic participation. Ensure gender equality initiatives form a cogent part of the governance space.

EXTERNAL OPTIONS:

- Advocate for the creation of a Special Africa Global Fund for education, health and agriculture;
- Develop a formula for the full participation and contribution from all AFRICAN Nations;
- Create a secretariat whose sole responsibility will be to convince and source contributions from African Philanthropist for this generational initiative;
- Seek additional contribution from Affluent African Nations;

H.E. Dr. Jewel C. Howard-Taylor highlighted that drawing lessons from other global fund initiatives; these funds will build the impetus for the provision of urgent response, scale resilience and sustainable mechanisms of financing to help Africa achieve the SDG's by 2030. Though she believes that the impetus for the achievement of the SDG's must begin at the internal and National levels; **"I know that - no one is an Island."**

For no Nation has the capability to provide all of its needs and wants. Therefore, the holistic approach that Governments need to achieve the SGD's is this two prong approach; which firstly include the maximization of available local resources and then a robust advocacy for the creation of a GLOBAL FUND for health, education and rain fed agriculture as a way of attaining the SDG's.

The formula being suggested is that by removing constraints, transforming national budgets and programs to reflect priority areas; supporting innovation, diversifying our economies and exploring new financing opportunities, Nations can expand their growth prospects, work assiduously towards achieving the SGD's, broaden participation and inspire confidence in our societies.

H.E Vice President concluded that the fulfillment of the SDG's across African Nations is possible; but require bold, innovative and committed leaders who can build teams that will create National platforms for a shared vision of a better Africa; with a common purpose of creating an enabling environment of peaceful coexistence, equity, open participation, innovation, development and growth.

For the bottom line vision is simply the improvement and prosperity of people on the African Continent. It is glaring as we look across the African landscape that our people are no longer interested in empty promises of a better day; for they have waited for far too long, are now very impatient and long for the day when their needs, hopes and aspirations will become realities thru sustained national priorities.

Therefore, as we consider the way forward in helping African nations achieve the 3 critical areas of the SDG's before 2030; barely 11 years away, it is important that we unite as a team, have a common vision, share our skills and resources, build social solidarity, build and defend the institutions of our democracy, uphold the rule of law, create incentives for achievement and seek out those who have the financial capability to help create a more equitable World for all and not just a few.

Keeping in mind that though - our People are resilient, committed and resourceful; they can no longer wait in the shadows of dire poverty and exclusion; while their natural and human resources are plundered for the good of a few.

H.E Vice President concluded her speech by sharing a short inspirational video about - The man who stopped the desert. It showed how, with vision and tenacity, we can indeed create a better Africa.

6.3. SESSION OUTPUTS

- Programmatic recommendations from stakeholders on the establishment of the Africa Primary and Secondary Education Fund, the Africa Health Fund and the Green Water Fund, including highlighting new resources from a wide range of financial sources.
- Commitment of the representatives of the national governments, donors and financing institutions to support the Africa Primary and Secondary Education Fund, the Africa Health Fund and the Green Water Fund.
- Commitment of stakeholders to establishing the Funds and implementing their interventions for achievement of SDGs 2, 3 and 4.

The SDGC/A planned that by the end of pre-conference session day, a signed declaration would be developed on the operationalization of the three Funds (as well as a determination on other mechanisms or funding streams to be used), and concrete financial offers would be made so that implementation of the initiatives could be launched during the second half of 2019.

Parallel Sessions: Presentations, Panel Discussion and Q&A

For this session, participants attended one of the three parallel sessions on either health, primary and secondary education or green water during which they first hear an in-depth presentation on the rationale for financing these sectors, proposed interventions, funding requirements, potential financing sources, and suggested financing and coordination mechanisms, including the three proposed fund (the Africa Primary and Secondary Education Fund, the Africa Health Fund and the Green Water Fund). Following the presentation, a panel of experts shared their points of view on the information provided and offered their insights.

SESSION 1: STRENGTHENING AFRICAN HEALTH SYSTEMS

Presenter: Dr. Koffi Houngbedji, SDGs Advisor, Public Health, The SDGC/A and Mr. Donald Ndahiro, SDGs Advisor, Agriculture, The SDGC/A

Dr. Koffi Houngbedji opened the session by giving insights on the current health outcomes: progress and challenges, the health financing issues in Africa, and the rationale, the management, sources, monitoring and evaluation of the African health fund initiative.

Related to on the current health outcomes: progress and challenges, Dr Koffi presented the main progresses made during the MDG era such as and the reduction of new HIV infections by more than 38%, health systems in Africa are still undergoing more and more important challenges and seems to still operate largely below the needs and expectations of the populations.

- The life expectancy at birth increased by 5.1%, from 57 years in 2010 to 60 years in 2015
- The under-five mortality rate per 1000 live births decreased by up to 64% from 153 in 2000 to 81 in 2015.
- The reduction of maternal mortality by 43%
- Steady decline of adult mortality rate by 12.8% (from 341 to 300 per 1000 population in 2015)
- Steady decline of 22% of malaria rate (from 299 to 240 per 1000 population between 2010 – 2016)
- The reduction of new HIV infections by more than 38%
- The HIV mortality rate declined by an average annual rate of 13% from 139 in 2011 to 71 per 10 0 000 population in 2016

- Despite the progress, health systems in Africa are still operate largely below the needs and expectations of the populations and still faced to challenges to reach SDG health outcomes:
- According to Africa SDG Index and Dashboards Report 2018 produced by SDGC/A, most of African countries are in red status for the goal 3 that highlights major challenges.
- The burden of malaria in Africa remains very high, about 194 million new cases of malaria In 2016 and the related death remain high up to 405,880 malaria deaths in 2016.
- The burden of HIV death rate is still challenging. 72% of the death related to HIV in the world occurred in Africa
- Compared to others region in the world, Africa is still behind
 - 1 child in 13 dies before completing 5years – 15 times higher than in high-income countries (1 in 189).
 - Under five Mortality Rate is 8 times higher than in Europe in 2016
 - Maternal Mortality Rate is 34 times higher than in Europe. Almost all maternal deaths (99%) occur in developing countries with more than half in sub-Saharan Africa.
 - Life expectancy still very low: People in South-East Asia live at least 9 years longer than Africans; people in the Americas and Europe live at least 17 years longer than those in Africa.
- Persistence of a high burden of illnesses and deaths that most are preventable. More than half of all deaths in low-income countries in 2016 were caused by communicable diseases, maternal causes, and conditions arising during pregnancy and childbirth, and nutritional deficiencies while less than 7% of deaths in high-income countries were due to such causes.
- Lack of quality of care; Quality-adjusted (effective) coverage averaged 28% for antenatal care, 26% for family planning, and 21% for sick child care. Over 40% of facility-based deliveries in five countries in sub-Saharan Africa took place in primary care facilities with major gaps in resources and technical expertise.
- Lack of accessibility to the formal health care: 62% of people living in informal settlements and rural areas had little access to health services; Marginalized communities often do not participate in the formal health care system

- New epidemiological transition such as an increase of the non-communicable diseases and an increase of emerging diseases like Ebola.
- Still Challenges related to governance and leadership in Africa: inadequate legislation and enforcement; Lack of accountability and transparency within health; weak cross-sector action to address health determinants; Inequities in health systems; under-resourced national health information and research systems.

About the health financing, Africa is faced to challenges such as:

- Low Public Investment in healthcare: only six African countries had achieved the target of 15 percent of their national budgets to the health sector committed by African countries through Abuja Declaration
- Weak Financial Management system: it has been estimated for Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development countries that improvement of efficiency to the standard of the best performing countries would bring, on average, an increase of 2 years in life expectancy
- High Out-of-pocket payments (OOPP): OOPP per capita had increased by 150% in nearly all countries in a decade (from US\$15 per capita in 1995, to US\$38 in 2014).
- Reliance to Development Assistance for Health (DAH): According to IHME's 2017 database on Financing Global Health, in 2015, the total health spending per person in Low Income Countries was \$110; the DAH contribute to this for 32.3% and the governments for 21.6%. In 2016, the sub-Saharan Africa received a total amount of \$12.3 billion from DAH (32.9% of global DAH). While the health need is increasing the contribution of DAH is going decreasing. By 2030, The proportion of DAH in is expected to be 25.7% of the total health expenditure (\$ 147 per person in 2030) expected in LICs countries.
- Africa suffers more than 24% of the global burden of disease but has access to only 3% of the world's health workers and less than 1% of the world's financial resources.
- Compared to the other regions, the per capita government expenditure on health is still low. In 2014, it was an average of \$51.6 US in Africa versus \$1,858.3 in America and \$1,828.1 in Europe.
- African countries are far from having a full UHC (UHC index score ≥ 80). By 2030, if the current pace remains, only 43% African will be cover in African LICs and Just under 50% in African LMICs

- Overall, an incremental annual cost of \$67.3 billion (2017 USD) per year or \$59 per person per year including \$31.7 billion for African LICs and 35.6 billion for African LMICs is needed to fill the gap between current UHC coverage and full UHC coverage in African's low and lower middle income countries.
- Come back to African Health Fund initiative, Dr Koffi explained the rationale, Fund management, sources, monitoring and evaluation. This initiative is welcomed because Africa needs to think collectively and act locally, think big and think finally building a strong foundation of their health system rather than continuing with the firefighter approaches aiming at fighting diseases.
- The pace of progress remains too slow and interventions are still working as business as usual
- The African Health Systems are still substantially lagging behind compared to the other regions
- The health system and the availability of the services delivery and its readiness are still weak across the continent
- The strong and sustainable health system should be the foundation of any health interventions. However, it remains very underfunded and vulnerable to various shocks
- Implementation of SDG3/UHC requires huge investments and huge gaps remain to succeed.
- The fraction of DAH dedicated to the sub-Saharan Africa remains low around 32% of global Development Assistance for Health (DAH) while the region is faced with a greater number of population and burden of disease. Only 11% of DAH is dedicated to the Health System Strengthening (HSS).
- Health system strengthening initiatives on the continent remain either related to the vertical programs initiatives or pilot projects, most of which stop as soon as funding ends.
- Lack of political leadership and commitment
- Misallocation of resources in the health system. The current situation in most of the countries is characterized by a low allocation of resources at the intermediate and operational levels where health interventions are implemented while the national level seems to receive more attention. The desired situation in the future is to invert the current situation by putting more resources at the operational level.

The technical solution for most of health challenges are known and should be implemented. However, people cannot afford and access to a good health and continue to die at home. The scaling up of know technical is still limited to solve effectively the know health challenges. Most of the existing fund initiatives in the continent are financing the fight of diseases instead of building the system and those initiatives are initiated out of the continent with lack of African political leadership and commitment.

The new African Health Fund will collaborate with the existing health funds and global health initiatives to provide support to countries in strengthening the long term and resilient African countries health system and achieve the health related SDG and UHC in particular.

The interventions of the AHF will focus on:

- Expanded UHC policies and implementation;
- Promote Health accountability at all level, leadership, stewardship, governance at decentralized level;
- Health human resources strengthening;
- Health infrastructures reinforcement;
- Foster cross sector collaboration in tackling the social determinants of health;
- Expanding health prevention programs (including NCD);
- Real time epidemiological surveillance (focus on community surveillance);
- Innovation in products, service delivery;
- Health information system strengthening (data, digital health, R&D);
- Access to essential medicine and vaccine; sustainable health financing and financial protection.

The amount requested for the new African Health Fund is about \$67.3 billion (2017 USD) per year or \$59 per person per year including \$31.7 billion for African LICs and 35.6 billion for African LMICs to fill the gap between current UHC coverage and full UHC coverage which is vital to achieve SDG3.

The sources of fund will include African government participation, foreign governments, private sector organizations, philanthropists, Health foundation and non-governmental organizations, the DAH globally.

The fund is conceived by African leaders and will be hosted in Africa. It will be managed by the secretariat that will be composed of a technical team (health expert and technicians), the representatives of donors and the representatives of the Ministers of Health. The Board member will hopefully be renowned leaders and experts that will advise and monitor the performance and effectiveness of the fund and its beneficiaries.

The African Health Fund will be conditional, incremental and target-performance based. It envisions supporting countries' pledge to invest in health if there is a clear alignment of countries health system priorities with global 2030 and 2063 agendas.

The countries with strong commitment to invest and reform their health system will benefit from international community funds and necessary expertise to support transforming their health system.

Countries with high disease burden level, mortality, countries with evidence that they cannot reach the target by 2030, and countries with weak health system strengthening will be eligible to the fund. Access to the fund will be performance based. The performance will be gauged according to the international standard. Countries with commitment in increasing domestic resources in their health budget will be awarded by a proportional matching.

The AHF will set a meaningful monitoring and evaluation system. Countries performance will be rigorously tracked, after setting standardized targets for the interventions and programs where the grants will be allocated. A clear framework for monitoring and reporting, stating which governments are delivering to their responsibilities, must be established and independent reporting against this framework will be encouraged.

The AHF will be replenished every three years when the level of 75% disbursement is reached.

The AHF will replenish the beneficiaries' countries when they reached 75% of disbursement and achieved successfully the committed targets.

After the presentation done by Dr Koffi Hounbedji, Dr. Joseph R. Nkurunziza, M.D., Co-founder & Executive Director of Never Again Rwanda; Chairperson Rwanda Civil Society Platform moderated a panel discussion.



Dr. Joseph R. Nkurunziza; Dr. Jeannine Umutesi Condo, Director General, Rwanda Biomedical Center; Dr. Delanyo Dovlo, Former Director of the Health Systems and Services Cluster, WHO Regional Office for Africa (AFRO); Professor Stanley Okolo, Director General, West African Health Organization (WAHO); Dr. Elizabeth Wala, Program Director, Health Systems Strengthening, Amref Africa ; Ms. Zouera Youssoufou, Managing Director and CEO, The Aliko Dangote Foundation

Moderator:

Political will is still a challenge in funding adequately the health sector. How can we bring political will to action?

Paolo Belli:

Money does matter. Many countries that made best progress have invested a lot in their health system but it is not the end of history. Within countries with the same expenditures, there is a large variability in their results (from bad to good). If resources do matter, how money is expended is even more important. In addition, there is no budget allocation for the health sectors. This is due to a combination of factors.

The most important factor is the fiscal capacities of the countries that are challenging for all countries mostly the sub-Saharan African countries. Countries like Kenya collect only 15.7 % of GDP and many other countries collect lower. This low capacity to mobilize fiscal revenue leads to tight budget constraints. Countries that move to UHC did it in the context of economy growth and the governments collect 20 to 25% of their GDP.

While countries are facing to the limited envelop, there are so many competing demands. The ministries of finances (Mof) are overwhelmed by demands from line ministries and it is challenging to determine final priorities according to the criteria.

Quote Paolo “...the way the governments function is that ... the programs and projects with high visibility get priority for political view. Projects with long-term structures and impact get lower priorities. We collectively need to do a better job promoting the development impact and investment in the health sector and make sure that Mof understand that expenditures in education, health and water are among the best buys actually that any country can invest on to achieve a long-term development...”

Countries need to work as business unusual with transformative action otherwise we cannot achieve the SDGs considering that they are ambitious.

Moderator:

the lack of real planning taking into account the ground reality is an issue. When it comes to the implementation, the policy and the budget cannot respond to the reality of the ground. What should be done by the African government?

Paolo:

Political leadership is absolutely important and we have to learn from the countries that are doing well on it. What make change is a combination of things, For example Peru reduced stunting in few years by a large share because of a combination of budget, political will, accountability provided on the ground with strong pressure for people to work together. The whole system was driven to work. The designing of the project is an easier part. The real challenge is in its implementation. The designing of the project can be reasonable, even excellent but the project fails. One of the reasons the project fails is that there is no ownership, there is no champion that really running with this project and putting their full political capital into it and make sure that they are delivered as planned.

Moderator:

Rwanda is an interesting case for those who are interested in political science and economic development. Africa is characterized by a weak health system leading to a shortage of even very basic services. Rwanda improves accessibility to health especially financial accessibility. What others can learn from Rwanda about it and about the health system in general?

Condo:

The poor of poorest need to be targeted by the financial accessibility. The UHC is coming to play the role of giving such accessibility to the vulnerable population because they are the ones, if you look at the health burden diseases, who are bearing a lot burden. If you look at the health financing, most of them are looking into supporting middle class and not really the poor.

So if you have the system that are looking to the poor, you are looking to the prevention so that you predict or stop people to get sick or get complication for which the cost of the services is very high. Couple of things Rwanda did in its health system are about: (a) harmonization of the partnership around one health action plan. Rwanda have one national plan of action taking into account all the partners.

Everyone sees himself playing a role in achieving the goals; Example of collaboration with Global fund: Most of the countries go with project model. In Rwanda, we say we need to go by government support model. I have my plan of TB, HIV and Malaria, and the Global Fund comes to support a piece of that plan, to support the concept note of Rwanda. That is easy to build the foundation that we have. And we have seen more partners come in like GAVI; (b) Multisectoral approaches.

The example of fighting stunting involving many sectors including ministries of agriculture, education, gender, health, etc working through only one action plan across all the ministries prove to be effective to tackle the malnutrition in Rwanda; (c) Bring the health services really close to the population through the Primary Health Care (PHC) that reduce the delay in accessing the healthcare; (d) Private sector.

We used to work in a silos but now we approach the private sector as another pillar to support the missing piece. For example, with its eliminating plan of Hepatitis, Rwanda has collaborated with big companies to reduce the price of drug from more than \$1200 to \$60 per cure; (e) political engagement: Everything is about commitment. We need first to build the health system, the system that is the foundation, strong and sustainable, resilient to respond to threat. After building the system, it is easy to see what we are missing.

Quote Condo: *"What I really want to strengthen is the political will, political engagement that is growing hand to hand with the vision of the country. Everyone is talking about the Rwanda achievement but it about that leadership, that governance, those laws that are looking into no or zero corruption. And this brings trust to the partners, this brings accountability, this bring sustainability."*

Moderator:

Resilience capacity of Rwanda and experience of AGACIRO Fund. Some years ago, Rwanda had challenges with donors funding and created this AGACIRO FUND INITIATIVE. Even it is at the national level it's also addressing some issues that African Health Fund at the regional level will be focus on. What can be shared with the rest of the countries?

Condo:

AGACIRO FUND is put in place by the government of Rwanda to respond to many threats that could not be supported or when are not in line of the donor vision. The principle is to see what we can do locally. Most of time, especially the African countries are looking to the western countries to actually solve the problems instead to find solution locally. The issue is what we can do today where we are to actually respond to the questions that are raising including health. Time is come that Africa thinks about African for themselves

Quote Condo: *"Most of time, especially the African countries are looking to the western countries to actually solve the problems instead to find solution locally...Time is come that Africa thinks about African for themselves"*

Moderator:

Healthcare financing which is the key health system building blocks is one of the many challenges faced by African Countries. What Africa can do to able sustainably address this challenge?

Dovlo Delanyo:

68 to 70% of fund dedicated to the health is from domestic sources. About 30 to 32% will come from external sources. So part of the challenge is that we have this large proportion which is inefficiently mobilized and utilized to support the health system. What this AHF is going to do? Is it going to be different of what we had in the past?

Quote Dovlo: *"For me one of the critical thing we need to do in the same way as when go to a bank to get some money for a new house, we show a clear plan , sometimes we are requested to put a certain amount of money to show our commitment to what we are going to do. There is a clarity that we are going to be held accountable for this and that if we are not able to meet this end, we might lose our building or whatever investment we are back to the bank."*

What should be critical to build our health system in Africa are:

1. What are we doing with our own internal resources? When I look at some of studies we did in the past, still 60 to 80% of health expenditure is direct out of pocket payment. It is completely inefficient. It does not in line of the health system we want and also affect the economy and the wellbeing of the population we are trying to serve.

I would like to see part of the focus of this fund looking at how we can manage this domestic fund far better that we do currently. One thing I learned from Rwanda is *"Be clear what you want to achieve, and more important you do actually achieve what you said you are going to do"*.

Rwanda is the first country where substantial Global Fund investment came in and went also to build the health system, build that sustainable foundation. Most of the countries are saying that the global fund doesn't use their fund for health system building and this happens just because they have not been able to build that foundation of trust and ability to show results and I hope we can work with countries that are going to do this, who are going to raise money to build that sort of trust production

2. Issue about efficiency: be careful about inflect of high amount of money. There is a thing call “dash diseases” which means that you inflect the cost of doing things when huge amount of money comes into your system. For example the polio eradication attract huge amount of money in the system for the benefice of the worker but nowadays it is difficult to sustain this work that because the level of resources decrease even it still feasible to achieve the result with the available resource. We have then to work to achieve better health for a dollar instead to only increase the fund celling to be invested in the health system

Moderator:

Human resources and mainly the CHWs are one of the core element to achieve UHC but still reliant to the development assistance. Do you think that this fund should take this issue as priority?

Dovlo Delanyo:

Yes and maybe partly no. I say this because, of course CHWs are very essential for the work we need to do and they should be part of the broader Human Resource plan not a panacea on its own.

Quote Dovlo: *“Part of challenges in the healthcare is that the communities themselves have not been mobilized and made aware and engaged to fight for their own health in the way that allow us to move forward. Part of this fund will be about to raising awareness. ”*

For example in Kenya even in Ghana UHC system, the annual re-registration tends to drop because communities don’t quite see what the mean for them. We was not able to communicate adequately to get them understand and appreciate the good that is in to invest in the insurance scheme. Let’s make a big effort in creating aware communities that are invested in developing their health system.

Moderator:

The African Health Fund is one of the solution that is seen to address the health challenges in Africa, what and how it will be different from other global health initiatives such as Global Fund, PEPFER and other Development Assistance for Health?

Pr Okolo Stanley:

A situation where there are a lot of input in term of development assistance but it was almost as if there wasn't that structure in terms of looking at the output. And in fact, some development partners encourage spend, spend, spend without limit. And you sometimes wonder whether the term budget execution and all that should actually be removed from our language. We have to first of all know that if we are going to achieve the quantum and radical change we want, we need the business unusual (and other question is How do we related the AHF with the existing funds).

There are 3 thing that are important:

1. The political will but it is not only political will but also consensus of the political elite and that is slightly a nuance change for political will. And i think one of the reasons that you have the achievement that people are talking about rwanda is sustainability and consistency and the longevity of the process because of consensus;
2. The leadership and governance: not only leaders are politicians. You have leadership and governance from the top to the bottom, to the district, health centers to the communities. Leadership and governance are very import because it affects everything we are talking about, for example value for money;
3. Innovation and disruption. We really need to start disrupting our way of thinking. The example of rwanda with gf says a lot because i was with gf two week ago, they still don't invest much in the health system. Rwanda made them do that because there was a project that rwanda designed for themselves and say to people this is what we want and we want you to join us as player. Of course they have to be trust.

That why I said that they have to be some disruption. Because if we continue for example to have project that have mapped out some project, some project activities which ultimately when you look at it, it has no population impact and they spent their money,

we will be where we were 10 years ago because people will say this is the money we were putting into the system and where they get loss. As health leader I know that when you want to train health practitioners, the way you train the macro worlds, we will not get close to 115 per 10 000 population

What would be the special niche for the AHF? We have an African risk capacity fund, we have a pandemic epidemic fund and I think from what I hope to be an African solution for African problem should require a continuous cost improvement program as prerequisite for going into that AHF.

There are 3 things to be considered as enablers:

1. Digitalization and information. Without information you can't know where you are, you can't plan, you can't monitor, and you can't improve.
2. Community involvement: often a lot of money go to NGOs and others institutions who are talking to the communities and the question is: what communities have got that are community-led with participation of expert. Expert-led with community participation approach will not change behaviors.
3. The parliament who are the elected people. They are important in term of financing health.

Moderator:

In order to minimize poor governance, to have accountability and transparency, to fight corruption, it haven the citizen participation, public engagement. How to engage public to the health planning, monitoring and make sure that they hold different position within the health system accountable?

Wala: *"Things don't go wrong, they start wrong". If we are in the stage we want to set up a fund we have to start right and starting right means to involve the end-users here being the communities or the patients".*

When it comes to the accountability, we have the financial accountability, accountability on performance (do we have indicators which we can use to track the progress) and accountability on political engagement; our leaders have signed numerous of manifestos.

Is there anyone hold them accountable for the outcome of what they signed? In the relation practitioner – patient, the Community need to get back that power of their health, of the decision they are made for them and when this is done, and then they are able to come from a point of the information and realized that whatever service is being provided for them are for their own good and if something is wrong they are able to question

For the fund,

1. The planning mechanisms are very clear and transparent and the involvement right in the beginning;
2. Building capacities of the governance structure at the various levels right from fund to the countries, to the implementers and make sure that the capacity to manage this fund is built and continue to be strengthened;
3. Timely release of the fund: learning about other development initiatives we do know that sometimes they are quite number of delays in releasing this fund. For program continuity when you experience delay (like for example in a vaccine program), you are affecting the beneficiaries people. How is this fund going to be different in term of timely release? How are we going to ensure it?
4. Application and availability of regulatory and legal sanctions: if we talk about accountability are we going to lay down sanctions and legal framework that will say if you contrivance some of these processes, these are the consequences for that.

Quote Dr Wala *“Things don’t go wrong, they start wrong. If we are in the stage we want to set up a fund we have to start right and starting right means to involve the end-users here being the communities or the patients ... I think Africans it’s time we took back the power to control some of the functions especially the health sector and this fund will be the one of the ways to achieve that.”*

Moderator:

With the AHF we want to champion, how we bring the private sector on board. What innovations should be used in order to make sure that they are also part and process of funding the AHF?

Zouera:

when we talk about private sectors we are talking about private foundations and enterprise, we are talking about cooperation. We have several example where the private sector have very been involved in trying to solve health issues. Typically when we are about health we always expecting things to be handed by the government and by organizations like WHO, etc.

They are the only ones who are supposed to be responsible for health but the reality is that private sector has been involved to have specific impact in health. For example, within Nigeria, five years ago, we set up something called Private sector Health alliance of Nigeria including at the beginning four organizations, Dangote, Access Bank, Zenith Bank, Stanbic bank. The idea is how can they as private sector, fund innovations and disruptive ideas that could really bring about change in health system in Nigeria. From four organization at the beginning, the alliance includes 25 organizations nowadays.

We have also in Nigeria the so called Nambucca is a private sector group starting 15 years ago fighting HIV/AIDS with about 50 members. A new HIV trust fund is currently setting in place to supplement the gap in the funding from Global Fund (as GF is reducing its support to Nigeria). This is the concrete step private sector is taking. The Global Business Coalition for Health launched in US 20 years ago and including members like Total, Shell, and others organizations.

The GBCH is working around public health issues and how private sectors do things that affects their staff internally. Then from that example, the Dangote Foundation launched the African Business Coalition for Health (ABCh) in February 2019 that aims to bring private sectors to contribute to African health. Other initiative launched a year ago in Nigeria is a basic health care provision fund with the aims to achieve UHC. The idea is to leverage an extra tax from private sector to finance this fund. The issue now is how to manage that fund, how this will be disbursed what are the modalities to make it sustainable.

Quote Zouera *“I think one of the issues we have is how to socialize idea that private sector have a role to play with health issues Some of the lessons we need to learn are how do we really set up a fund that will address issue of governance and accountability”*

Q&A Discussion

Business as usual and some aspects to be considered when it comes to set the AHF: We have a lot of funds but business as usual is a problem. Debates related to liberalizing of pharmaceutical industries, pricing of drugs show different views from western and south countries. While the western democracies are against the liberalization, the poor countries want liberalization. We need to considerate this when we are talking about Health African Fund. If we continue to things as we are doing now by treated diseases instead to look at the health determinant, we will never succeed.

We shall begin to examine the concept called “destructive construction” that drive innovation, research for solutions. We have to deeply examine why developed countries are ahead of us. Before set up the AHF, we have deeper analysis about why we are put the fund in place, and why the existing fund are not seen to do better. Put in place the process through which we agree on the fund.

Suggestions on where the fund should be invested:

Some questions persist: Manufactories of drugs because 60% of our spending go to drugs and medical device and we still have shortage on those items. If we continue like that we cannot succeed and cannot even get money to pay health workers. Leadership and governance are some aspects we have to invest on. We need also to focus on social determinants. Invest in the communities to take charge of their own health. Non communicable diseases are increasing and need attention and investment.

Why now creating this fund why not before? Countries are shifting from low income countries to Low Middle Income Countries. Even diseases are shifting. How are countries ready to face to new challenges? We have to do more in research. To test Ebola or Zika you have to go outside of Africa. What are we doing to create our capacities in term of research?

What you do for me without me is against me. It seems that we are always focusing on the curative care which enriches the pharmaceutical companies. We have to work more on prevention care and involve more communities in taking care of their own health.

There are many funds. Are we going to merge all the existing funds? What we know from experience is that more than 30% of fund is invested in the fund management and little reaches the final beneficiaries. We have to look into the governance and transparency of that fund to be convinced that this fund is not going to work without producing results. We agree with this fund but aspects about governance and transparency, the interrelation between health and others sector like agriculture, education and water must be taken into account. Finally, Africa is full of money but this money is not use for the African benefit. The leaders use that money for themselves. We need to start paying attention about the accountability.

People don't put money together without expecting some returns. The question is how do you put the interest of communities first?

Prof. Okolo quote “traditionally we have trained HealthCare Workers not to be interested in health and wellbeing. Traditionally we have trained them to be fascinated by illness and diseases and we really have to review this training and change it so that we can now start to look at social determinants and multi-sectorial approach to health.

That is the answer to the prevention care ... if we import 80% of the drugs that we require to treat illnesses in our countries that means that the money is given to us but in term of commodities, that money goes out that why we have to think about regional manufactories of drugs. We have to create a niche if we have to create that fund”

Conclusion

Finally, the participants agreed to set the African Health Fund and think it will be an added value to tackle several challenges the health systems in Africa are facing. We have to learn from the failure of existing funds and focus the investment on the neglected fields that have great impact on health outcomes such as governance, accountability and leadership, prevention care and community engagement, social determinants and multi-sectorial approach to health, drug manufactories, laboratories and researches, Non communicable diseases. Define what kind of incentives for governments and private sectors, who to involve in the funds.

SESSION 2: SCALING-UP ENHANCED RAINFED AGRICULTURE

Presenters were: Dr. Tekalign Tsige Sahilu, SDG Advisor, Water Resources, and Mr. Gert-Jan (Gary) Verburg, Programme Analyst from The SDGC/A. Kathrine Madden from SIWI (Moderator of the Session), explained the overall structure of the session which include; presentation, panel discussion, question & answers and group discussions. Katherine, after giving an introductory remark about the SDGs and SDG 2 in particular, she asked the session participants whether Africa can achieve SDG 2 (Zero Hunger) until 2030. The response was that the majority of the participants were slightly pessimistic on SDG2 achievement until 2030.

Dr Tekalign Tsige Sahilu made an opening remark which included:

- It is better to be optimistic about SDG achievement - plan something high and try to achieve as much as possible!
- Last year in June there was an expert meeting on enhancing rainfed agriculture in Africa under the theme of “Africa Water Revolution”.
- After recommendations of partners, the name “Africa Water Revolution” has been changed to mean “Transforming Investment in Africa Rain-fed Agriculture (TIARA).
- There are still strong struggles remaining, and the situation is worsening as the climate gets more unpredictable negatively impacting agricultural productivity.
- We have divided the presentation into two parts. The first is on technology options and cost estimates by Mr Gert-Jan Verburg. The second is about the establishment of the green water fund by Dr Tekalign Tsige.

Mr. Gert-Jan (Gary) Verburg made presentation on Technology Packages and Cost Estimates that covered the following key areas:

- The key problems of Africa agriculture (the risk of food insecurity and dependence on rain-fed agriculture, the quantity of rainfall)
- Motivation (population in drylands Africa, rainfall pattern, climate change)
- Interventions (use of rainwater harvesting technologies for smallholder farmers)
- The reason for not happening at a scale
- Approaches (estimation of the number of smallholder farmers, identification of rainwater harvesting technologies based on catchment, storage, withdrawal, delivery systems)

- Technology packages and estimated unit costs (cost per farm by technology type)
- Estimated aggregate costs at constant and current prices
- Implementation plan

Dr. Tekalign Tsige Sahilu made presentation on the Establishment of the Green Water Fund that covered the following key areas:

- Objectives and purposes of the green water fund
- Challenges and opportunities in establishing the green water fund
- The funding framework highlighting the institutional system, partnership, eligibility, operation, disbursement & replenishments, monitoring and expected outcomes.

The presenter concluded his presentation by emphasising:

- The need for the presence of strong POLITICAL LEADERSHIP to ensure the effectiveness of the fund
- The initiative does not silence or exclude anyone from the processes of planning, design, implementation, M&E, and assessment.
- The need to work together in a non-rival, cooperative fashion to tackle this long-standing African problem
- The need to raise the collective voices of the voiceless million farmers of Africa

Panel Discussion

The facilitator Dr Tekalign indicated that the green water initiative that is being promoted by The SDGC/A had been undertaken in partnership with the Stockholm International Water Institute (SIWI). Accordingly, he announced the presence of Mr Torgny Holmgren, the Executive Director of SIWI and introduced his role as a moderator during the panel discussion. He invited Mr Holmgren to come to the podium. He then invited the panellists to come to the stage and join the moderator. The panellists included the following:

- Opening Remarks and Moderator: Mr. Torgny Holmgren, Executive Director, Stockholm International Water Institute (SIWI)
- Mr. Savio Carvalho, Global Campaign Director, WaterAid
- Dr. Ahmed Khalid Eldaw, Regional Coordinator, Global Water Partnership
- Mr. Gualbert Gbehounou, FAO Country Representative, Rwanda Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO)
- Ms. Sara Mbago-Bhunu, Director, East & Southern Africa Division, International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD)
- Mr. Daniel Ogbonnaya, Lead, Rwanda Program Coordination and Rwanda Country Program, Global Green Growth Institute

Mr Holmgren (Moderator)

After introducing the panellists to the participants, Mr Holmgren made the following introductory remarks.

SIWI engagement in rain-fed water in Africa: started a long time ago, Falkenberg coined the expression Green Water, and over the last 6-7 years, SIWI worked on raising the profile for this solution for Agriculture in Africa. Policy makers and scientist are concerned about the future of agriculture in Africa. In 2017, SIWI joined efforts with SDGC/A and held an expert meeting last year as a result of this Partnership.

Why is the need for investment in rain-fed solutions in Africa? It is because 95% of cultivatable land is not fit for another irrigation method. Finding local solutions is important for the continent and consuming home-grown food rather than imported food is very important to assure the potential of rain-fed water solutions.

Several factors that need to be addressed if we want to make this happen:

- Leadership, willingness
- Awareness
- Funding, regional local
- Non-public actors e.t.c

Should also look into insurance schemes which are important for smallholder farmers. After making the remarks, the moderator (Mr Holmgren) asked the panellists to reflect their opinions, and each of them made the following points.

FEEDBACK/RESPONSES FROM THE PANELIST

Ms. Sara Mbago-Bhunu;

“Without access to green water, access to nutrition cannot be secured. It has been promoted in the wider context of rural transformation in Africa. Water cannot only be used for agri-purposes but also domestic use. Growing population 375 Million young people by 2030 on the continent urges for the creation of jobs, rainfed solutions and green water can reduce the seasonality of agriculture and increase productivity on the continent. Agriculture is not competitive, not modern and not attractive for investment”

Dr. Ahmed Khalid Eldaw.

“Does Green Water have the potential to be unlocked and does it contribute to solving the SDG task? Yes! Almost 80% of the food on our table comes from rain-fed agriculture. Green Water solutions are technically, socially, and environmentally sustainable. Global Water Partnership takes an integrated approach; the proposed solution has to be integrated as well, technology, a social dimension and environmental aspects need to be considered, and smallholder farmers need to be the targets”.

“How can we link with other SDGs? Focus on SDG 2 but contributing to 1, 6, 13 and others. We have to link and try and map those relations so that donors and stakeholders can see the impact not just on SDG 2 but also 5 and 8 and others. We don’t only have to look at infrastructure but also on skill and capacity building. Nutrition and hunger, fisheries open water bodies are all interconnected with the topic”.

Mr Gualbert Gbehounou;

“The best model is integrated farming: Crop + Livestock + Aquaculture. If one sector declines, others there to capture. Water Matters! Rainwater seems to be the easiest for smallholder farmers. If we managed to secure water access for farmers, we also address SDG 1 and 6 not just 2, 5 and 8 and 10. Solving the Water issue solves so many other issues for us. FAO has set up a Global Framework on Water scarcity in Agriculture. There to address water issues, with thematic working groups. One of them is water migration”

Mr Gualbert Gbehounou

“Water governance is key to improve access to water. FAO has models in place that they use in all member countries. Water scarcity does not have the same dimension in all areas; we might consider prioritising places where there is no access to groundwater resources”.

Mr Savio Carvalho;

“We need bold and new approaches for financing SDGs that are not driven by profit alone, Public-Private is fine, and we need a new Green-Marshall Plan.

ODA is a historic commitment; it is bound; it is a commitment by developed nations. It needs to be there as far as it is legal and moral commitment. Most of the countries have not delivered on their 0.7 ODA commitments. Global tax architecture, the voices of developing nations have to be heard; tax havens need to be closed.

And tax holidays need to stop Illicit financial flows, amount of money that leaves this continent. 30-60 Billion leave this continent as capital flight. Africa is a creditor, not a debtor, and we need to have a mental shift. Bleeding of the continent’s resources is happening, which hinders the continent from tackling its problem.

Green Fund is important, and we need to focus on Climate change as we are heading towards global warming. We need leaders of the continent as a collective and keep up multilateral commitments and push for the SDGs. Leaders have to support multilateralism”

Mr Daniel Ogbonnaya:

"Hunger is an age-old challenge that we need to put to ourselves. Rainwater harvesting: what will happen if there is no rain - our money cannot make rain. Climate change is a real issue for agriculture, and our current economic model is kicking back. We are now paying the price for it.

The idea of setting up a fund is a long time overdue! Those who are at a lower level have a way of doing biz in their communities without access to these resources.

If we can solve hunger through rainwater harvesting and if we can raise funds needed for green water, is it necessary to set up several funds, is it possible to have the political will so that subsistence farmers are reached by this projects? We will be sending ourselves on the right path if we manage to do it. What lessons can we learn from previous projects, having tangible lessons will enable us to scale the right solutions.

Linkages to SDGs, what are we doing as a government and as the people. If we are obstructing the way that people are moving forward, we might – the issue of the public institution at hard of right awareness. If you don't have water, these are the things you need to do, and the government should know.

Climate impact on vulnerable people is real, and bringing solutions to this is important so we can find solutions to the problem".

Question & Answers

Some of the key questions asked by the participants include the following

- What does it take to set up a Trust Fund?
- How do we measure if the beneficiary is involved in the process and his knowledge is included in it?
- Synergies of Health, Education and Green Water?
- How does the initiative correlate with CADAP comprehensive African agriculture initiative?
- Nexus Energy Water Food, strategies on fund concentrating on one of the issues, what is your proposition to tackle this nexus? Measure indicators, decreasing risks, etc.? What is the recommendations to fund managers and donors to tackle synergy of SDGs and development aid and to tackle this?

In responding to the key questions raised from participants, the panellists and the moderator reacted as follows:

Sara:

High synergies while tackling water: livestock, technologies, etc. supply chains for providing the technologies have non-functioning markets at the minute, and smallholder farmers need the capacities and finance to use and maintain the infrastructure. They have to be at the centre of what they demand: need demand-based strategy. We need to shift away from supply driven

Issue: Have farmer-led Solutions!

Ahmed:

Linkage between health, education and water: 80% of diseases are waterborne linkage is there, you have to have synergies between the three of them. Need Anchor cannot go for all three after one another because they are interlinked; it could be one Goal. Water is not an issue of SDG 2 alone; we need to have it at the Board, you have to have issue experts that work together to work on those areas. Integrated approach. Very related to Nexus. CADAP and other issues have to be reviewed.

What are the challenges for this initiative? They have to be identified.

Gualbert:

Beneficiaries: reiterate the 10 FAO principles, if you refer to them, you'll have smallholder farmers on board: respecting cultural.

Need synergies with CADEP and this initiative. Message: look at ongoing initiatives and examine the success stories to take them on board

Savio SDGs are integrated and Universal, so they are highly interrelated, water and health and how do we generate this political momentum.

Daniel:

At the national level, it is important that partner countries set up financing vehicles for projects and programmes. Here in Rwanda, there is the Rwandan Green fund, and in Ethiopia, there is a fund. SDG implementation has seen a shift for financing projects. Environmental Tax, and increasing private sector participation by leveraging investment. This financing for SDGs by national financing vehicles is important that national targets are in place first.

Holmgren:

Issues that need to pay attention to include:

- Nutritional aspects important
- Young people and their employment and the future
- How to set up funds and mechanisms?
- To take an integrated approach and take a broader perspective
- Link to other SDGs and look at the wider impacts
- Look from Sustainable Agriculture and bring in another aspect like migration into the discussion
- Climate Change
- How to manage governance and water governance?
- Fund availability “Green Marshall fund for Africa”, Reduce and tackle illicit Flows
- How to address the political will?
- Beneficiary lead interventions
- Learn from other successes
- How to generate political momentum for revenue collection and other existing mechanisms?

Group Discussion

The group discussion was held after the lunch break. The group formation was aligned with the presentations, and two groups were formed. The first was on the rainwater technologies and cost estimates, which was coordinated by Gary. And the second was on the establishment of green water fund, which was coordinated by Tekalign. Katherine Madden (SIWI) facilitated the overall coordination of the group discussion.

Katherine started the session by asking participants on their reflections on the morning sessions. The participants highlighted the following points.

- We would have wanted more time for Q&A about the presentation. Panellists were very good. Glad for the engaging panel, would want more questions on the session.
- Liked how Panellist linked three sectors to rest of SDGs. How do we feed all this good information and well-researched ideas into the decision-making process of Leaders?

- Enjoyed Daniel's Presentation and the link to climate change, a lot of people, prioritise other things over Climate Change and don't understand what it means for farmers. How exactly do they plan to engage the beneficiaries? The success of different funds that have been mentioned? How are farmers engaging?

Among others, the key messages of the group discussions include the following:

Ambitious action: the commitments to agriculture and green water are in place (Maputo, SDGCs, CAADP, etc.) but we are not making implementation progress. SDGC/A proposal is ambitious but needed.

Untapped potential: massive potential but needs significant investment – green water is a strategic opportunity. Green water management meets 4 out of 5 of organisational objectives (GGGI). Green water is technically, socially, financially and environmentally sustainable (GWP) and meets multiple goals, not just zero hunger / 2 including water, poverty, climate, nutrition (FAO).

Low-cost solution: by 2030, 57 million households require rainwater harvesting at the cost of \$168 through to \$4,571 per household, estimated at US\$ 23 billion. The technology packages are indicative but may be too high, especially as don't include the typically high costs for capacity building. Think about collective approaches, harmonisation of technologies, regionally appropriate technologies and "give farmers a say".

Business case: governments were challenged to invest in green water. "if Africans don't invest in Africa, how can others be expected to" and "this is not a technical issue but a political choice" (WaterAid). However, governments cannot be expected to invest in a topic when the payback is not clear, and therefore, the business case must be established.

Don't recreate the wheel: there is a significant experience in Africa and globally on green water management that can be learned from and shared, don't start from scratch. The same can be said with regards to funding mechanisms, look to CRGE Ethiopia, IFAD, Rwanda's green fund, GCF for the experience. And a link to existing approaches to push forward agenda, especially climate and potentially migration.

Create the conditions: finance can help, but it's not the only condition, consider other issues, local policies, good governance, capacity building, leadership, related political economy challenges (imports, tax issues and illicit financial flows).

Involving the community: There is a need to work in partnership with the community. It is necessary to address community needs. The approach should be demand-driven instead of supply-driven only. There is a need for community acceptance; otherwise, programmes/projects cannot be successful.

Awareness raising: Even if funding is available, the beneficiaries may not be aware of the process, and all money can be absorbed on the intermediary level. On the ground level, there is still little awareness about the SDGs and available technologies. It is necessary to close such a gap.

Training and capacity building: Besides the beneficiaries (smallholder farmers), the training and capacity building programme needs to be integrated into the formal education, which is an assurance for the sustainability of the programme.

SESSION 3: IMPROVING PRIMARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION



Financing Education; Improving Primary and Secondary Education presentation by Ms. Lina Henao.

- No African country has achieved universal primary education
- Seven out of 100 secondary school are learning the minimum basic skills, they're supposed to know.
- Less than 10 of the kids are learning the minimum basics of secondary, and then one in 20 girls in rural areas in Africa manages to finish secondary and those girls are behind seven times less likely to do so than boys in urban areas in the country.
- The projections and population growth, nearly 70% of the kids in primary will learn just the basic skills at one three school aged children will learn these skills or to get about 30% of the kids learning what they supposed to be learning. So, meaning that 70% of the cohort will just not get the skills that they need to get after graduation.
- Internationally and domestically if we don't take actions, we are going to lose a generation of kids that won't be able to join a tertiary education and weren't able to enjoy labor markets and will not be productive.

- All the important occasions are basically education understood his primary and secondary is crucial, bridging the gaps so that children will join tertiary school, and then making them producing good graduates that kids join the labor market on their real world afterwards.
- After graduation the African graduates take five years to get job (for five years without an opportunity deal knocking out)
- In coming years, Africa will be the home of the largest one of your population in the world. And it also is also the region with the highest youth unemployment. Certainly, one of the reasons of this high unemployment is the low quality of the graduates. So, this is something that needs to be fixed. And, of course, there are issues on higher education, but their roots start in primary and secondary.
- Education, obviously as a culture and by the way, is very important to to maximize the synergies on our center. So, we have to allocate citizens in quality education so that will have a positive impact in agriculture and economic growth and many other sectors.
- Achieve universe on target is to be ready to buy and reducing the ratio of teachers to students, and increasing teacher salaries and improving infrastructure, this is improving rooms, materials and materials for teaching.
- In 2030, the cost of achieving these targets for primary per student is \$382 and for secondary 715\$. The total cost for both primary and secondary education is \$30 billion.
- We are still not aggressive enough sewing MDGs era, in 15 years, only 4\$ million was raised. And which is obviously not enough for the whole continent.
- We need external collaboration, but it needs to be from Africa and by Africa, creating these people with that good vision.
- We want garbage to increase their education expenditure from three sources: raising their fiscal revenue, giving more priority to education that discovery, and also growing and increasing GDP.

Professor Nelson

- Quoted Mandela that “Education is the most powerful weapon which you can use to change the world.”
- If you access a good education you better chance to change the social economic growth.
- Investing in education is developing a human capital for achieving economic transformation and preparing future generation.
- There is lacking fund for research and innovation in African education
- Girls were disadvantaged attending school previous years, but now it is changing, it big movement in many countries.
- we have education problem, if we continue having uneducated population that means we will struggle with social problems and economy as well.
- Many countries were associated with research and innovation recently, and they committed 1% of the GDP. So that is how African governments commit dedication, in terms of supporting education.

Mr. Lee

- With Sustainable Development Goals and more challenging this second team goals, there's 169 targets, specifically in education. There are about 42 indicators that SDG for education, and most of them have not been entirely clarified, All the indicators will be measuring these goals at the international level. So, I think this is a real failure in the international community to set clear objectives and goals for the sector. You don't know what we're aiming for, with no priority.
- Much more innovation is needed across Africa that is a way to get evidence about funds and education work.
- There's also the issue of retraining details to what to do to improve our quality adequacy of teachers to improve their people teacher ratio. And, there is hope, I think we have enough results where we need to invest more in education.

Ms. Teopista Birungi Mayanja, Regional Coordinator, Africa Network Campaign on Education for All (ANCEFA) and Commissioner, International Commission on Financing Global Education Opportunities

- There a big challenge in secondary and primary education in Africa due to bad political education, has largely been low from low investments.
- One of the areas that struck me the most is ICT we are not investing in ICT, internet infrastructure and computers in schools.
- Why are we continuously consumers of technology took from other places? We have to build enough education for Africa solutions.
- Education is the responsibility of the competent in government. But not the national government has singular responsibility to improve education and responded and predicted to do the highest possible level, and therefore they should get for also investing in education.

Dr. Margaret Wanjiku Ngunjiri, Independent Consultant, Nairobi, Kenya

- we need to reflect on how the others have performed so that we get to trends, we learn from the lessons learned from the previous actions.
- First initiative is to strengthen systems beginning from the planning level. Initiative towards strengthening systems so that he puts the resources we are experts in access is number one.
- The second initiative, all of us here have been talking about innovations, innovations, to do things differently, including the use of technology.

QUESTION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Dr. Margret:

Do we need the fund for education?

Participant: The answer is very simple for me; we need funding education is now. Because if we don't do it now, according to this, show that we have almost 263 millions of children who are out of schools. Now, if we don't meet Now, I know, after 10 years, of after five years, how many children will be out of schools. And as a person expresses when the funding would be so tough to get. Some recommendation for this focus on what is supposed to do for education, is to provide conditional scholarship for steered of children in primary school, both boys and girls, the second is assuring gender identities, curricula and pedagogical systems in all the schools.

Participant: There isn't any African government that is reaching the target. So, there is a very big problem. And you see the statistics, what do we need to learn? How are we going to pay the money? Show me the money from different stakeholders working with governments, civil society, donor community, but also, most importantly, the private sector.

6.4. REMARKS

- What we needed to do is to have a gap analysis, this is what we have to market it gap analysis and analysis that is going to show the depths of what is it we wanted to address. How do we want to address it with how much which incentives needed to attract, that is step number one. Step number two, we need to identify champions, with political power, the heads of states to engage other in financing and we work with them as champions to match the fund with them.
- We may not say the education fund, but we can call it human development fund, but we know it is developing humanity in education.
- The fund is not only money, but it's also technical assistance is building capacity.

ANNEXES

ANNEX I: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS BY ORGANIZATIONS AND COUNTRIES

Organization	Country
403D Civil Affairs Batallion	Djibouti
403d Civil Affairs Battalion	United States
A Global Healthcare Public Foundation	Uganda
A Partner In Education	Rwanda
Abibiman Foundation	Ghana
ABIEN ART CENTER	Rwanda
Academy Of Science Of South Africa	South Africa
Access to Finance Rwanda	Rwanda
Action on Sustainable development goals Kenya Coalition	Kenya
Action Pour l'Education et la Défense des Droits Humains (APEDDH)	Rwanda
ActionAid	Rwanda
ADEPR	Rwanda
Adventist University of Central African	Rwanda
Afreximbank	Egypt
Africa 24	Rwanda
Africa ECD	Rwanda
Africa Improved Foods	Rwanda
Africa Network Campaign on Education for All (ANCEFA)	Senegal
Africa Network of Young Leaders for Peace and Sustainable Development	Cameroon
Africa Smart Investments Distribution	Rwanda
Africa Water And Sanitation Hygiene	Rwanda
Africa Journal	Rwanda
African Center of Excellency in Internet of Things (ACEIoT)	Rwanda
African Centre For Global Health & Social Transformation (ACHEST)	Uganda
African Development Bank	Rwanda
African Evangelistic Enterprise	Rwanda

African Institute for Mathematical Science	Rwanda
African Leadership University	Rwanda
African Peer Review Mechanism (APRM)	South Africa
African Union Commission	Ethiopia
African Union of Medical Laboratory Students (AUMLS)	Rwanda
Afrihealth Optonet Association	Nigeria
AFRISTAT	Mali
AfriYAN (African Youth and Adolescent Network on Population and Development)	Rwanda
Agriculture Technical Assistance Facility (Agri-TAF)/MINAGRI	Rwanda
Aide Medicale Congo	RDC
AIESEC Rwanda	Rwanda
AIM Global	Rwanda
Airtel	Rwanda
Aliko Dangote Foundation	Nigeria
Alliance in Motion Global	Rwanda
Amaya Pharmacy Ltd	Rwanda
American Association of University Women at University of Rwanda	Rwanda
American Refugee Committee	Rwanda
APIDE (Organisation National)	DRC
Apostolic Ministerial International Network	Ghana
Armstrong Women Empowerment Centre	Kenya
ASOR-Rwanda	Rwanda
Association des Educateurs Physiques et Sportifs du Rwanda (AEPS - Rwanda)	Rwanda
Association pour la Promotion de la lutte contre les violences faites aux femmes et la participation au développement de la Femme africaine	Cameroon
Association sportive et sociale les jeunes cadres	Congo
AUCA University	Rwanda
Avega Agahozo	Rwanda
Axis Pensions Ltd Rwanda	Rwanda
BAC	Rwanda

Baha'i International Community	Ethiopia
Bank of Africa	Rwanda
Bank of Ghana	Ghana
Bank of Tanzania	Tanzania
Bank of Uganda	Uganda
Banque de Développement des Etats des Grands Lacs	DRC
Banque Populaire du Rwanda Plc	Rwanda
BBC	Kenya
BDO Corporate Advisory Ltd	Rwanda
Better Future Football Academy	Rwanda
Better World Rwanda	Rwanda
Boss Cow Limited	Rwanda
Bright Future Cornerstone	Rwanda
Builders of Development Organization	Rwanda
Bureau of Statistics Lesotho	Lesotho
Burundi Medical Student Association	Burundi
CABI	Rwanda
Cantine Fast Food	Rwanda
Capital Market Authority (CMA)	Rwanda
Carnegie Mellon University Africa	Rwanda
Catholic University of Bukavu	DRC
Catholic University of Rwanda	Rwanda
Catholic Youth Network For Environmental Sustainability In Africa (CYNESA)	Rwanda
Center for education network	Rwanda
Central Bank of Sudan	Sudan
Central Statistical Agency	Ethiopia
Centre for Public Sector Reforms, Moi University, Kenya	Kenya
CEP UOB DRC	DRC
Cereal Business Company Ltd	Rwanda
Cereals Business Company Ltd	Rwanda
Cerrium Advisory	Rwanda

CHACODEV	Kenya
Christian University of Rwanda	Rwanda
CHUK	Rwanda
Cival Society Actor	Guinea-Bissau
Civil Society Budget Advocacy Group-CSBAG	Uganda
Civil Society/Abunzi	Rwanda
Climate Smart Agriculture Youth Network	Cameroon
Climate Smart Agriculture Youth Network	Cameroon
Club des Etudiants en Pharmacie de l'Université Officielle de Bukavu (CEP-UOB/DRC)	DRC
Club Vision Santé/ Université de Ngozi	Burundi
CNBC Africa	Rwanda
CNBC Africa	Rwanda
Coffee Techlab I&I Center	Rwanda
College of Medicine and Health Sciences-University of Rwanda	Rwanda
COMESA	Zambia
COMESA Monetary Institute	Kenya
Comité d'Initiative pour les Etats Unis d'Afrique	Senegal
Commissariat Général au Plan	Comoros
Commonwealth Youth Human Rights and Democracy Network	Ghana
Compassion International-Musanze-Ruhondo	Rwanda
Concern Worldwide	Rwanda
Consulate of Central African Republic	Rwanda
Convergence	Kenya
Cope Consulting Ltd	Rwanda
Creative-Hills	Rwanda
Crown Shoppers Medicare Ltd	Rwanda
Cyesha Company Ltd	Rwanda
Department for International Development (DFID)	Rwanda
Development Bank of Rwanda	Rwanda
Development Bank of Southern Africa	South Africa
Development Bank of Zambia	Zambia
DFID Rwanda	Rwanda

Diplomatic Mission of Algeria	Rwanda
DUTERIMBERE NGO	Rwanda
East African Development Bank	Rwanda
East African Science and Technology Commission	Rwanda
East African University Rwanda (EAUR)	Rwanda
Ebenezer Bussiness Group	Rwanda
ECA	Ethiopia
Echobrain	Rwanda
Educate!	Rwanda
Efforts Communs pour la Sante (ECOS)	DRC
Ekiti State Government	Nigeria
Embassy of Belgium	Rwanda
Embassy of China in Rwanda	Rwanda
Embassy of Japan	Rwanda
Embassy of Mali in Rwanda	Rwanda
Embassy of Sweden in Kigali, Rwanda	Rwanda
Embassy of the Arab Republic of Egypt in Rwanda	Rwanda
Embassy of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia	Ethiopia
Embassy of the Federal Republic of Germany	Rwanda
Embassy of the Kingdom of the Netherlands	Rwanda
EMBASSY OF THE STATE OF LIBYA	Rwanda
Embassy of Turkey in Rwanda	Rwanda
Emony Yefwe International	Kenya
Empowering Youth For Employment (E.Y.E RWANDA)	Rwanda
Energy4Impact	Rwanda
ENI SpA	Italy
Enterprise Africa	Rwanda
Enterprise Consult	Ghana
Enzemat	Tanzania
Escorts Pharmaceuticals Rwanda	Rwanda
Esperance pharmacy	Rwanda
Ethiopian Agricultural Transformation Agency	Ethiopia
EthSwitch	Ethiopia
European Union	Rwanda

EVERY LIFE COUNT FUND	Ghana
Export Development Fund	Malawi
Eyetimes.com	Rwanda
Faculty of medicine/Universty of medicine	Burundi
Falcon Management Corp.	United States
Family Medicine Association of Congo	DRC
Financial Markets Development Committee, Uganda	Uganda
FMDV-Global Fund for Cities Development	France
Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei	Italy
Fortune Consultancy	Rwanda
Future Earth	France
General Logistics Services	Rwanda
Ghana Education Service	Ghana
Gicumbi District	Rwanda
Girls In School Initiative	Uganda
GIZ	Rwanda
GIZ	France
Global Engagement Institute	Rwanda
Global Green Growth Institute	Rwanda
Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI)	Republic of Korea
Global influencers community	Rwanda
Global Medicine Center and Laboratory	DRC
Global Network Support Charitable Trust	New Zealand
Global Water Partnership Eastern Africa	Uganda
Goethe-Institut Kigali	Rwanda
Good Samaritan for Education Organization "GSEO"	DRC
Government of Rwanda	Rwanda
Grand Synergy Development Initiative	Kenya
Great Lakes Sustainable Development Solutions Network	Rwanda
Greeining Desert Project	Rwanda
Green Revolution	Rwanda
Green Young World International	Ghana
Harvard University	Rwanda

HEAL Africa Hospital, Goma/DRC	DRC
Heal The Planet Global Organisation - HTP	Uganda
Health Development Initiative (HDI)/Rwanda	Rwanda
Health Engineering Solution	Rwanda
Health Maintenance Organization/Africa	Burundi
HEDERA	Germany
HER VOICE AFRICA	Uganda
HERMOSA LIFE	Rwanda
Higher Education Council	Rwanda
HOBUKA Ltd.	Rwanda
Hope Iwacu Initiative	Rwanda
Humanité pour tous	DRC
IASS Potsdam, Germany	Germany
Ibn Haldun University	Turkey
ICDC	Kenya
ICT4D	Rwanda
IFAD	Italy
Ifatizo Organization	Rwanda
Igihe.com	Rwanda
Imbuto Foundation	Rwanda
Independent Researcher/Consultant	Ghana
Infrastructure Development Bank of Zimbabwe	Zimbabwe
Ingaara Organisation	Rwanda
Ingenuity Ltd/USAID Ingobyi Activity	Rwanda
INKOMOKO Entrepreneur Development	Rwanda
Innovations for Poverty Action	Rwanda
Institut National de la Statistique	Niger
Institut National de la Statistique et des Etudes Economiques et Démographiques	Comoros
Institut National de la Statistique et des Etudes Economiques Et Démographiques (INSEED -TOGO)	Togo
Institute of Policy Analysis and Research (IPAR-Rwanda)	Rwanda
IntelliSOFT Consulting Ltd	Kenya
International Organisation for Migration	Rwanda

International Finance Corporation	Rwanda
International Medical Intervention Fellowship	Burundi
International Monetary Fund (IMF)	Rwanda
International Office University of Kigali	Rwanda
International Pharmaceutical students Federation	Rwanda
International Potato Center	Rwanda
International Prison Chaplains Association	DRC
International Rescue Committee	Kenya
International Trade Union Confederation, Africa's Regional Office (ITUC-Africa)	Togo
InumArk Ltd/ Rep. Vihaan Networks Ltd	Rwanda
Investment Watch (I-Watch)	Cameroon
IPAR-Rwanda	Rwanda
IPSF AfRO	Rwanda
ISARO GROUP	Rwanda
ISC Regional Office for Africa	South Africa
ISC/ODD-CI (initiative pour la société civile pour les Objectifs de développement durable)	Côte d'Ivoire
Isinde Green Peace Ltd	Rwanda
Israel Embassy	Rwanda
IUCN	Kenya
Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA)	Ethiopia
Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA)	Japan
Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA)	Rwanda
Jigjiga University	Ethiopia
JIRCAS	Japan
Justice, Development And Peace Commission (JDPC), Ijebu-Ode	Nigeria
Kasha	Rwanda
Kenya airways	Rwanda
Kepler	Burundi
Kepler Kigali	Rwanda
Kibagabaga Hospital	Rwanda
Kibogora Polytechnic	Rwanda

Kigali block service ltd	Rwanda
Kigali independent university	Rwanda
Kigali Modelling Company	Rwanda
King Faisal Hospital	Rwanda
Kingdom Management	Ghana
Kinyamateka	Rwanda
Klab	Rwanda
Korea International Cooperation Agency (KOICA)	Rwanda
KOICA	Republic of Korea
Kora Coaching Group	Rwanda
KOTIAKUM FOUNDATION (STAND AGAINST HUNGER)	Ghana
KTN NEWS	Kenya
KTN NEWS	Rwanda
KT Radio	Rwanda
Kushian Society For Developments And Human Rights	Egypt
LakeTanganyika Authority	Burundi
Land & Water Interventions Company (LAWICO)	Rwanda
Laterite	Rwanda
Leadership Watch	Nigeria
LED Solutions & Green Energy Rwanda	Rwanda
Lewis Group	Rwanda
Liberia Institute of Statistics and Geo-Information Services	Liberia
Love Is Art	Botswana
M.P-Infrastructure	Rwanda
M.Y.MINING LTD	Rwanda
Makerere University	Uganda
MARU SOLUTIONS LTD	Rwanda
MASS Design Group	Rwanda
Medecin Junior de la RDC	DRC
Media High Council	Rwanda
Medical College of Wisconsin	Rwanda
MEDSAR	Rwanda

MEMIAS PHARMACY	Rwanda
MERCPWDR	Rwanda
Ministère du Plan et du Développement	Côte d'Ivoire
Millennium Promise	Rwanda
MINAGRI-RWANDA	Rwanda
Mind of Genius	Rwanda
Mindful Thinkers	Rwanda
Ministry of Finance and Development Planning	Rwanda
Ministry of Infrastructure	Rwanda
Ministry of Health	Rwanda
Ministry of National Development Planning	Zambia
Ministere de L'economie et des Finances	Madagascar
Ministère de l'Environnement de l'Eau et de la Pêche	Chad
Ministère de l'Environnement et du Développement Durable	Côte d'Ivoire
Ministère du Plan et du Développement	Côte d'Ivoire
Ministry of Agriculture and Animal Resources	Rwanda
Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries	Japan
Ministry of Education	Rwanda
Ministry of Energy Uganda	Uganda
Ministry of Environment	Rwanda
Ministry of Finance	Senegal
Ministry of Finance	Kenya
Ministry of Finance	Zambia
Ministry of Finance and Development Planning	Liberia
Ministry of Foreign Affairs	Zambia
Ministry of Health and Child Care Republic of Zimbabwe	Zimbabwe
Ministry of Health and Population	Malawi
Ministry of Higher Education and Research of Djibouti	Djibouti
Ministry of ICT and Innovation	Rwanda
Ministry of Infrastructure	Rwanda
Ministry of Interior and Coordination of National Government, Kenya	Kenya
Ministry of Local Government	Rwanda

Ministry of Planning and Development of Côte d'Ivoire	Côte d'Ivoire
Ministry of Planning and Development of Côte d'Ivoire	Côte d'Ivoire
Ministry of Planning and Development/BENIN	Benin
Ministry of Trade and Industry	Rwanda
Ministry of Water and Environment, Uganda	Uganda
MNR East Africa Ltd	Rwanda
Mount Kenya University	Rwanda
Mount Kenya University- Burundi	Burundi
Mozambican Medical Association	Mozambique
Msingi East Africa	Kenya
Muhabura Integrated Polytechnic College (MIPC)	Rwanda
Muraho Technology	Rwanda
N@tcom Services Ltd	Rwanda
Nandi Company	Rwanda
National Bank of Rwanda	Rwanda
National Bureau of Statistics	Seychelles
National Institute of Statistics	Cameroon
National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda(NISR)	Rwanda
National Pharmacy Council, Rwanda	Rwanda
National Statistical Institute	Cape Verde
National Statistical Office	Malawi
National Statistics Office	Côte d'Ivoire
NDASH Consulting Ltd Rwanda	Rwanda
NESTLE Rwanda	Rwanda
Netsquar	Rwanda
NGF Consult Ltd	Rwanda
Nile Equatorial Lakes Subsidiary Action Program Coordination Unit (NELSAP-CU)	Rwanda
NPC Rwanda - National Paralympic Committee of Rwanda	Rwanda
Nsindagiza	Rwanda
Nyarutarama Business Incubation Center	Rwanda
Nyarutarama Sports Trust Club Ltd	Rwanda
OANDA Consulting Nigeria	Nigeria

Office of President and Cabinet, Performance Enforcement Department	Malawi
Office of the Senior Special Assistant to the President on SDGs	Nigeria
Ohio State University	United States
One UN RCO Rwanda	Rwanda
Osun State University, Nigeria/SDSN Nigeria	Nigeria
Oxfam International	Kenya
Pan African University	Uganda
Panzi Hospital	DRC
Partners In Health	Rwanda
Passion for Greens	Zambia
PAUWES	Rwanda
PAUWES-Algeria	Rwanda
PBL Netherlands Environmental Assessment Agency	Netherlands
Pharmacy	UK
Pilot Light Foundation	Rwanda
Planning and Development Commission of Ethiopia	Ethiopia
POLARPLUS (UK) LIMITED	UK
Policy Analysis Unit, Office Of The President, The Gambia	Gambia
Polyclinique La Medicale	Rwanda
Private Sector Federation	Rwanda
Pro-Femmes/Twese Hamwe	Rwanda
Projet San Francisco	Rwanda
Radio Salus	Rwanda
Rainbow Foundation	Rwanda
RAMIS-RDC	DRC
RCB	Rwanda
Recovery Rwanda	Rwanda
Regional Centre for International Development Cooperation (RCIDC)	Uganda
REMA	Rwanda
RENE Pharmacy (R) Ltd	Rwanda

Reponse aux Catastrophes et aux Initiatives de Developpement RCID en sigle	DRC
Rotaract -Rotary international	Burundi
Royal services Agency Ltd	Rwanda
Ruhango District Pharmacy	Rwanda
Ruhengeri Referral Hospital	Rwanda
RVCP (Rwanda Village Community Promoters)	Rwanda
Rwanda Agricultural Inputs Development Organization	Rwanda
Rwanda Agriculture and Animal resources Board/Ministry of Agriculture and Animal resources	Rwanda
Rwanda Agriculture and Animal Resources Development Board	Rwanda
Rwanda Bankers Association	Rwanda
Rwanda Bio medical Center	Rwanda
Rwanda Children's Cancer Relief	Rwanda
Rwanda Civil Society Platform	Rwanda
Rwanda Convention Bureau	Rwanda
Rwanda Dental Student Association (RDSA)	Rwanda
Rwanda Land Management and Use Authority(RLMUA)	Rwanda
Rwanda Medical Association	Rwanda
RWANDA MEDICAL COUNCIL	Rwanda
Rwanda Polytechnic Higher Learning Institution	Rwanda
Rwanda Printing and Publishing Company Ltd	Rwanda
Rwanda SDG5 Forum/Rwanda Women's Network	Rwanda
Rwanda Water and Forestry Authority (RWFA)	Rwanda
Rwanda Wildlife Conservation Association	Rwanda
Rwanda Women's Network	Rwanda
Rwanda Youthmappers	Rwanda
Rwanda Zambia HIV Research Group RZHRG	Rwanda
Sabio Policy Consult - Eastern Africa	Kenya
Salutem Tech	Rwanda
SAPIM FOREX BUREAU	Rwanda
Save the Children International (SCI)	Rwanda

SCO	Cabo Verde
SCO Company Ltd	Rwanda
SCORE Pharmacy	Rwanda
SDG Center for Africa	United States
SDG Center for Africa	Uganda
SDGs Cameroon	Cameroon
SDSN	France
SDSN-Youth	Rwanda
Secretariat d'Etat Au Plan et Integration Regional	Guinea-Bissau
SEND-GHANA	Ghana
Serano Africa	Kenya
SFBSP-Burundi	Burundi
Sheffield Hallam University	UK
SIWI	Switzerland
Smart Geospatial Media	Rwanda
SOLIDE	Rwanda
Somali Government	Somalia
South African Reserve Bank	South Africa
Spark Africa	Rwanda
Spark Rwanda	Rwanda
Spark Solutions Consulting & Advisory Co. (SCACO Ltd)	Rwanda
Statistics Sierra Leone (Stats SL)	Sierra Leone
Stockholm Environment Institute	Kenya
Stockholm International Water Institute, SIWI	Sweden
STRAC	Rwanda
Strive for Health Rwanda	Rwanda
Sustainability Impact Network Africa	Kenya
The Sustainable Development Goals Center for Africa	Rwanda
Swiss Cooperation Office	Rwanda
Technipharma Pharmacy Ltd	Rwanda
Teebah Film Village	Rwanda
Terre des Jeunes Burundi-Transnational	Burundi

The African Academy of Sciences	Kenya
The East African	Rwanda
The New Times	Rwanda
The Saudi Fund for Development	Saudi Arabia
The Wide Class	Rwanda
Three Stones International	Rwanda
Trade and Development Bank (Formerly PTA Bank)	Kenya
Travel Abroad Solution and Services Ltd	Rwanda
Trust Engineering Solution Ltd	Rwanda
TUBIRWANYE Association	Rwanda
Tura Heza Ltd	Rwanda
TV1 RWANDA	Rwanda
U.S. Embassy Kigali	United States
Uganda Development Bank Limited (UDB)	Uganda
Uganda High Commission, Kigali	Rwanda
Uganda Red Cross Society	Uganda
University of Kigali	Rwanda
Universite Libre de Kigali	Rwanda
UN Economic Commission for Africa	Ethiopia
UN Women	Rwanda
UN Women East and Southern Africa Regional Office	Kenya
UNAIDS	Zambia
UNAIDS	Rwanda
UNDP	Rwanda
UNDP (Nations Unies)	Côte d'Ivoire
UNDP	Canada
UNECA - Regional Office	Rwanda
UNESCO	Ethiopia
UN-FAO	Rwanda
UNFPA Rwanda	Rwanda
UNICEF Rwanda	Rwanda
United Nations	Rwanda
United Nations Population Fund	Rwanda

United Nations World Food Programme	Rwanda
United Religions Initiative	Ethiopia
United Scholars Center	Rwanda
UNITED SIKHS	Uganda
Université Catholique de Bukavu	DRC
University of Global Health Equity	Rwanda
University of Ngozi Burundi	Burundi
University of Rwanda (UR)	Rwanda
University of Rwanda College of Business and Economics	Rwanda
University of Rwanda School of Public Health	Rwanda
University of Rwanda, College of Agriculture, Animal Sciences & Veterinary Medicine	Rwanda
University of Technology and Arts of Byumba	Rwanda
University of Tourism, Technology and Business Studies/ Rwanda	Rwanda
University Teaching Hospital of Kigali	Rwanda
UNRCO Nairobi	Kenya
UPHLS	Rwanda
UR - CST - African Center of Excellence in Internet of Things	Rwanda
UR-CBE (Gikondo Compus)	Rwanda
US Army	United States
US Coalition on Sustainability	United States
Vidapharma Ltd	Rwanda
Vision Africa Regional Network - Zambia	Zambia
WAKA	Rwanda
WATER ACCESS RWANDA	Rwanda
WaterAid	UK
WaterAid	Mali
WaterAid	Zambia
WaterAid Rwanda	Rwanda
WaterAid UK	Rwanda
We Do Green Organization	Rwanda
WE Effect	Zambia
WELTHUNGERHILFE	Rwanda

West African Health Organisation (WAHO)	Burkina Faso
WETALK SERIES UGANDA	Uganda
WGYB We Got Your Back	Rwanda
WHO - World Health Economics	Rwanda
Women for Peace and Gender Equality Initiative (WOPEGEE)	Nigeria
World Bank	Kenya
World Bank Group	Rwanda
World Bank Group	United States
World Food Program (WFP)	Rwanda
World Health Organization	Rwanda
Xinhua News Agency	China
Xinhua, AFP	Rwanda
Yale University	Rwanda
Yale University	United States
Yali	Rwanda
YES Rwanda	Rwanda
Young Volunteers for Environment (YVE)- Rwanda	Rwanda
Youth Advocates Ghana-YAG	Ghana
Youth and Women for Opportunities Uganda	Uganda
Youth Help Sierra Leone	Sierra Leone
Zamani Foundation	Nigeria
Zambia Congress of Trade Unions	Zambia
ZIGAMA CSS	Rwanda
Zipline International inc	Rwanda

ANNEX II: LIST OF DOCUMENTS

1. Africa SDG Index and Dashboard 2019 Report

<https://sdgcafrica.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/AFR-SDGS-REPORT-FINAL.pdf>

2. Africa 2030 SDG Three-Year Reality Check

<https://sdgcafrica.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/06/AFRICA-2030-SDGs-THREE-YEAR-REALITY-CHECK-REPORT.pdf>

3. SDGs Implementation in Africa Reflections on a Three Year Journey_
Conference Brochure

<https://go.sdgcafrica.org/t2xJ>

4. SDGS Implementation in Africa – Reflections on a Three Year Journey Live
stream

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=96Obg0Quk2Y&t=1687s>

5. SDGS Implementation in Africa – Reflections on a Three Year Journey-
Photo Album

<https://www.flickr.com/photos/182025114@N02/>



**THE SUSTAINABLE
DEVELOPMENT
GOALS
CENTER FOR
AFRICA**

M. Peace Plaza, 8th Floor, Tower C
KN 4 Avenue, Nyarugenge, Kigali
P.O. Box 1240 Kigali, Rwanda
Office: +250 788 310 004-5
Email: info@sdgcafrica.org
Website: www.sdgcafrica.org